

Xenophobia and Radicalism in Ireland (2017)

Dr William Allchorn

Introduction

Ireland presents itself as somewhat of a peculiarity when looking at forms of Xenophobia and Radicalism. As this report will discuss, Ireland's above average support for migrants and lack of an organised or successful radical right political scene marks it out as an anomalous case of moderation tolerance within Western Europe. Moreover, elite discourse towards minorities and migrants tended to be positive on the whole in the period under study (2017). This is not to say, however, that Ireland has not had it struggled with exclusionary practices. As this report highlights, hate crime is still not a specifically enforceable criminal offence and third-party recorded statistics mask the underreporting of these incidences. Moreover, minority representation among law enforcement agencies is remarkably low.

This report will therefore look into the period under study and suggest how far Ireland is an anomalous case - focusing on changes in legislation, the current state of law enforcement practices, rhetoric of government officials, popular attitudes towards migrants (in sport and society) as well as the profile of radical right parties. What will be found is positive adherence to moderation, tolerance and human rights norms on the whole – with some room for improvement in key areas of legislation, law enforcement and underlying popular prejudice against minorities.

1. Changes in Legalisation

Protection of freedom of religion and religious expression is enshrined in Ireland's 1937 Constitution. According to Article 44 of the Constitution of Republic of Ireland, the state shall not patronise any religion, there shall be no discrimination based on religious affiliation, faith or position (including discrimination of schools). It notes that every religion has the right to manage its own affairs, own, purchase and manage assets and organise religious and charity organisations. A December 1972 amendment saw the deletion of specific recognition of the Catholic Church as well as other specific denominations.

In the period under consideration, there was no advancement on previous anti-discrimination legislation – with a set of Employment Equality Acts (EEA) 1998-2004 and the Equal Status Acts (ESA) 2000-2004 passed in the early 2000's. This was built on in July 2010 with the legalisation of same-sex civil partnerships and Ireland's signing of a resolution that instructed schools to combat racism among students in 2013. Moreover, in July 2014, Ireland instituted a Commission for Human Rights and Equality. The Commission is constituted of 12-15 people appointed by the President for the term of no more than 5 years – with a key purpose to promote respect towards human rights and equality, organise corresponding promotional events, anti-discrimination projects and facilitate integration.

In contrast to previous anti-discrimination measures, the Republic of Ireland has not passed any hate crime legislation - either before or during the period under consideration.¹ Indeed, Ireland's Court Service has just five recorded convictions of hate crime from 1989 to 2017.² Furthermore, in March

¹ In Ireland, hate crime is not a specific criminal offence. It can, however, be taken into account at the sentencing stage of a trial if a hate element is present.

² Gallagher, C. (19th June 2017) 'Courts Service reveals five convictions for hate crime since 1989.' *Irish Times*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/crime-and-law/courts-service-reveals-five-convictions-for-hate-crime-since-1989-1.3124352/>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

2017, this was highlighted by experts in hate crime who appeared before the Oireachtas calling for the introduction of hate crime legislation “as a matter of urgency”.³ A Private Members’ Bill was introduced at the time by FiannaFáil TD, Fiona O’Loughlin, calling for all political parties to support the introduction of the law- making it a criminal offence to attack individuals based on their race, gender, age, disability, religion, sexual orientation, and gender identity. Previous attempts by O’Loughlin have got to the second stage in the lower house of the Irish Parliament (DáilÉireann) and no further.⁴ A report in the same month by the anti-racism NGO, European Network Against Racism (ENAR) Ireland, found (alleged) racist criminal offences - **330 total** of which **23** could be considered **violent**. However, 2016 figures showed that there were over 300 hate crime offences recorded by Ireland’s Central Statistics Office – with 152 crimes of racism, 38 crimes of ageism, and 31 gender-related, 28 homophobic crimes, 25 anti-Traveller, and 13 anti-Muslim hate crimes reported.⁵

2. Law enforcement practices

The main safeguards against discrimination in everyday life and the workplace in Ireland are the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission and Workplace Relations Commission. The former was set up on August 28th 2014 – with a key role in considering cases of discrimination and whether they have a right to appeal. The Commission also advises the Irish Supreme Court on human rights and equality matters.⁶ The Workplace Relations Commission was set up in 2015 to replace Equality Tribunals and provides an official recourse for employees who feel they have been discriminated against on grounds of gender, sexual orientation, religion, disability and race.⁷

In relation to the period under consideration, iReport.ie saw a reluctance by people who had experienced or witnessed racism to report it to the police (Garda) or other state bodies – with 5 out of 6 people saying that they would not report to the Irish Police or other official bodies.⁸ Reasons cited by respondents to iReports survey included: a reluctance to risk exposing oneself to further victimisation by sharing identifying details, a reluctance to engage in a lengthy legal or other process(es) that might result from issuing a report, and a reluctance to use forms that use complicated technical language and other off-putting vocabulary. This is a shame given attempts by the Irish Government to root out institutionalised racism within the police over the past two decades. For example, in 2000, Irish police set up a department for national and cultural diversity, which is responsible for coordinating and advising in all aspects of police work. Moreover, since 2002, the police have started appointing special liaisons with minority communities to gather information about hate crime and discrimination and support victims of such crime.

³Pollak, S. & Edwards, E. (23rd March 2017) ‘Hate crime legislation needed ‘as matter of urgency’.’ *Irish Times*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/hate-crime-legislation-needed-as-matter-of-urgency-1.3022528>. Date Accessed 22/03/2018.

⁴ Houses of Oireachtas. Criminal Justice (Aggravation by Prejudice) Bill 2016. Hyperlink: <https://data.oireachtas.ie/ie/oireachtas/bill/2016/75/eng@initiated/b7516d.pdf>. Date accessed: 22/03/2018.

⁵O’Keefe, C. (11th May 2018) ‘Improved recording shows hate crime rise.’ *The Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/improved-recording-shows-hate-crime-rise-469976.html>. Date Accessed: 11/05/2018.

⁶Irish Equality and Human Rights Commission. ‘Home: Irish Equality and Human Rights Commission.’ Hyperlink: <https://www.ihrec.ie/>. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

⁷Workplace Relations Commission. ‘Equal Status: Workplace Relations Commission’. Hyperlink: <http://www.workplacerelations.ie/en/What You Should Know/Equal Status/>. Date Accessed. 22/03/2018.

⁸ Ibid. P.3

While this might be so, the recruitment of minorities within the police during the period under consideration continued to remain low. Reports in July 2017 suggest that (since the lifting of a recruitment freeze in 2014) there had been no new officers employed from an African or Caribbean background in the national Garda.⁹ On the back of this calls were made for greater ethnic diversity to be included in the remit of a new Commission on the Future of Policing in Ireland. The Commission now has included investigations into diversity within its terms of reference and will report in September 2018.¹⁰

3. Rhetoric of Irish Government Officials in 2017 towards Minorities

Much hope was placed in the election of Leo Varadkar as the first ethnic minority Taoiseach (or 'Prime Minister') in Irish history in the middle of 2017. The Dublin-born, half-Asian son of an immigrant father was trumpeted by some as a 'clear crystallisation of the significant societal shifts that have occurred in his lifetime'.¹¹ Reports were, however, mixed on his attitudes towards migrants and refugees. One article found, for example, that in 2008 Varadkar had argued for the deportation of unemployed migrants and in 2016 made a series of warnings about migrants 'look[ing] down on our freedoms and liberalisms and think[ing] they're wrong'.¹²

On 20th January 2017, the Irish Oireachtas' Joint Committee on Justice and Equality published a report recognising the ethnicity of the traveller community in Ireland.¹³ Subsequent to the joint committee's investigation into the issue, the office of the Taoiseach requested that the Department of Justice and Equality prepare a report for the Government on the question of recognising Traveller ethnicity. In March 2017, former Taoiseach Enda Kenny T.D made a historic statement in the Irish Parliament (or Dáil Éireann in Irish Gaelic)¹⁴ announcing the state's recognition of Traveller ethnicity based on the communities unique heritage, culture and identity.¹⁵

Following on from these positive steps, on 31st January 2017, President Michael D Higgins warned that racism and xenophobia were 'gaining ground' in Ireland – 'exploiting fears and ignorance in ways that could destroy democracy itself'.¹⁶ In a speech in Dublin before diplomats in Dublin, he used the annual ceremony to raise awareness of the migrant crisis and warn that the United Nations was inadequately funded in its efforts on the subject. He also criticised the organisation for its

⁹ O'Keefe, C. (29th July 2017) 'Gardaí want a more diverse force.' *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/gardai-want-a-more-diverse-force-455947.html>. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

¹⁰ 'Commission on the future of Policing in Ireland: Terms of Reference'. Hyperlink: http://policereform.ie/en/polref/pages/terms_of_reference. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

¹¹ Van Nguyen, D. (3rd June 2017) 'Why doesn't the prospect of an ethnic taoiseach excite me?' Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/life-and-style/people/why-doesn-t-the-prospect-of-an-ethnic-taoiseach-excite-me-1.3096488>. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Joint Committee on Justice and Equality (January 2017) 'Report on the Recognition of Traveller Ethnicity.' Hyperlink: <http://www.oireachtas.ie/parliament/media/committees/justice/Report-on-the-Recognition-of-Traveller-Ethnicity-20-01-17.pdf>. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

¹⁴ House of Oireachtas. 'Dáil Éireann'. Hyperlink: <http://www.oireachtas.ie/parliament/about/dail/>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018.

¹⁵ O'Halloran, M. & O'Regan, M. (1st March 2017) 'Travellers formally recognised as an ethnic minority.' *The Irish Times*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/politics/oireachtas/travellers-formally-recognised-as-an-ethnic-minority-1.2994309>. Date Accessed: 17/04/2018.

¹⁶ *Irish Examiner* (31st January 2017) 'President Higgins: Racism and xenophobia are gaining ground.' Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/breakingnews/ireland/president-higgins-racism-and-xenophobia-are-gaining-ground-774899.html>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

occasional disconnect from ordinary citizens and muddying its 'moral purpose' what he cryptically described as a 'blatant pursuit of interests'.¹⁷

On 28th January 2018, Taoiseach Leo Varadkar spoke at the Mansion House in Dublin to commemorate Holocaust Memorial Day. He stressed the importance of educating Irish citizens about the Holocaust in order to prevent such horrors happening again. He went on to suggest that '[HMD] also allows us to reaffirm our shared principle that hatred and prejudice have no place in today's society.'¹⁸ This was a slightly more high profile appearance by a national politician at the Holocaust Education Trust Ireland Annual event. In January 2017, the event was presided over by Paschal Donohoe, Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform.¹⁹

While rhetoric towards minorities has on the whole been positive during the period under study, there have been some negative incidents – especially in relation to anti-Semitic prejudice. In January 2018, for example, a columnist for the Irish edition of the Sunday Times, Kevin Myers, came under fire for criticising two female BBC presenters, Claudia Winkleman and Vanessa Feltz, for their ability to negotiate higher salaries because they were Jewish.²⁰ In the column, Myers wrote: 'Good for them. Jews are not generally noted for their insistence on selling their talent for the lowest possible price, which is the most useful measure there is of inveterate, lost-with-all-hands stupidity.' Ireland's Jewish leaders, however, came out in defence of the columnist – suggesting that Myers had 'inadvertently stumbled into an anti-Semitic trope' and was symptomatic of his 'curmudgeonly, cranky, idiosyncratic style'.²¹

A second incident that highlighted anti-Semitism in elite rhetoric during the period under consideration made it to the legislative level. In February 2018, Irish Republican Party (Fianna Fáil)²² TD, Marc MacSharry, from County Sligo was accused of anti-Semitic prejudice when he made parallels between the Irish Government and Nazi propaganda minister, Joseph Goebbels.²³ His comments came amidst news of new National Planning Framework funding in the TD's area whilst other services were being cut. While the comments did not appear to be directed at the Jewish community or individual therein, Ireland's Minister for Health, Simon Harris, perception was that his

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Department of the Taoiseach (28th January 2018) 'Key-note speech by the Taoiseach, Mr. Leo Varadkar, T.D., National Holocaust Memorial Day 28 January 2018 Mansion House, Dublin.' Hyperlink: https://www.taoiseach.gov.ie/eng/News/Taoiseach's_Speeches/Key-note_speech_by_the_Taoiseach_Mr_Leo_Varadkar_T_D_National_Holocaust_Memorial_Day_28_January_2018_Mansion_House_Dublin.html. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

¹⁹ HETI (28th January 2017) 'HOLOCAUST MEMORIAL DAY 2017 | SHORT VERSION.' Hyperlink: <http://hetireland.org/videos/holocaust-memorial-day-2017-short-version/>. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

²⁰ JTA (1st August 2017) 'Fired Irish Journalist Apologizes for Offending Jews, Agrees Deserved to Be Sacked.' *Haaretz*. Hyperlink: <https://www.haaretz.com/jewish/fired-irish-journalist-apologizes-agrees-his-should-have-been-sacked-1.5438510>. Date Accessed: 02/04/2018.

²¹ Jewish Telegraphic Agency (1st August 2017) 'Irish Jewish leaders defend columnist fired for anti-Semitic references.' Hyperlink: <https://www.jta.org/2017/08/01/news-opinion/world/irish-jewish-leaders-defend-columnist-fired-for-anti-semitic-references>. Date Accessed: 02/04/2018.

²² Fianna Fáil is an Irish political party founded by Eamon De Valera and by opponents of the 1921 Treaty with London. For more information, please see: <https://www.fiannafail.ie/>.

²³ RTE (28th February 2018) 'Dáil suspended after row over 'anti-Semitic' remark.' Hyperlink: <https://www.rte.ie/news/2018/0228/944171-dail-row/>. Date Accessed: 02/04/2018.

comments amounted to ‘an attack on the Jewish community and the victims of the Holocaust.’²⁴The incident stopped the proceedings of the DáilÉireannfor ten minutesand contrasts heavily with Ireland’s low rankings in recent global surveys of popular anti-Semitism – with only 20% of respondents answering ‘probably true’that Jews are more loyal to Israel than Ireland, that Jews have too much power in business affairs and that Jews have too much control over global media.²⁵ Recent NGO reports also confirm the dearth of popular anti-Semitism in the country – with ENAR Ireland reporting only one incident of anti-Semitic abuse offline and six online between January and July 2017.²⁶ Finally, this is further reaffirmed by historically low records of anti-Semitic incidents reported to Irish Police – with a total 43 incidents occurring nationally between 2006 and 2015.²⁷

4. Position of immigrants in the country during the monitored period

Migration has increase from 69,300 in the year ending April 2015 to 84,600 in the year ending April 2017. April 2016 saw the first net inward migration since the start of the Global Financial Crisis in 2009. In the year ending April 2015, 26.6% Irish, 5.0% UK, 10.2% EU 15, 12.2 % EU 13, and 21.9% Rest of World. In year ending 2016, 28.4% Irish, 5.9% UK, 11.4% EU 15, 13.2% EU 13, and 23.6% Rest of the World. In year ending 2016, 28.4% Irish, 5.9% UK, 11.4% EU 15, 13.2% EU 13 and 23.6% Rest of World. In year ending 2017, 27.4% Irish, 6.1% UK, 10.8% EU 15, 10.9% EU 13, and 29.4% Rest of World.

No major changes were made to immigration law during the period under consideration. This said, two statutory instruments issued by the Irish Government to change provisions within the 2004 Immigration Act to include the granting of visas to citizens of Georgia and the Ukraine were implemented.²⁸ Coming as part of move towards visa-free travel for the countries across Europe since 2008, these new measures came in recognition of attempts by the EU to liberalise visa travel for Georgian, Moldovan and the Ukrainian citizens.

Oversight over the enforcement of immigration law in Ireland is formally the remit of the Garda (Police) National Immigration Bureau (GNIB) which was established in May 2000. They are involved in the execution of deportation orders, operational decisions to do with entry and exits of migrants, and prevention of human trafficking in the country.²⁹Heavy politicisation of the asylum seeker issue in the 1999-2004 period led to asylum seekers being removed from the mainstream social protection system with responsibility handed over to the Department of Justice Equality and Law Reform.³⁰In comparison to other European nations, the numbers of foreign individuals detained for

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ Anti-Defamation League Global 100 Survey (May 2014) ‘Ireland’. Hyperlink: <http://global100.adl.org/#country/ireland/2014>. Date Accessed: 10/05/2018.

²⁶ iReport.ie (January – June 2017) ‘Reports of Racism in Ireland’. Hyperlink: http://enarireland.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/iReport_1516_jan-jun2017.pdf. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018.

²⁷ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (November 2017) ‘Antisemitism Overview of data available in the European Union 2006–2016.’ Hyperlink: file:///C:/Users/ipiwa/Downloads/fra-2017-antisemitism-update-2006-2016_en.pdf. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018. P.46.

²⁸ Houses of Oireachtas. IMMIGRATION ACT 2004 (VISAS) (AMENDMENT) ORDER 2017. Hyperlink: <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2017/si/264/made/en/pdf>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

²⁹ INIS. ‘The Immigration Process in Ireland.’ Hyperlink: <http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/THE%20IMMIGRATION%20PROCESS%20IN%20IRELAND%20050509.pdf/Files/THE%20IMMIGRATION%20PROCESS%20IN%20IRELAND%20050509.pdf>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018.

³⁰ Fanning, B. (2007) ‘Understanding Immigration and Social Change.’ Hyperlink: <http://www.ucd.ie/t4cms/Understanding%20Immigration%20and%20Social%20Change.pdf>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018. P.3.

immigration-related purposes in Ireland are relatively low – with 351 individuals incarcerated in 2015.³¹ However, Ireland is one of only a few countries in Europe that uses prisons for immigration detention.³² In the period under study, for example, the case of Brazilian women, Paloma Aparezida Silva-Carvalho, came to light in July 2017 after she was denied entry to land and forced to stay in Dublin’s Mountjoy Prison until public outcry forced her release.³³ A recent report by the Irish Immigration Support Centre suggests that overcrowding and criminality within detention centres is common and criticises the Irish immigration system for running on a two-tier system wherein Dublin Airport has a civilianised border vs. the police-led operations at all other ports of entry.³⁴ Ireland is set to open its first immigration detention facility at Dublin Airport in 2018.³⁵

5. Society’s attitude towards immigrants, foreign nationals and various ethnic minorities

While attitudes towards migrants hardened in Ireland after the 2008 economic recession, Ireland is generally one of the most tolerant societies amongst the countries under consideration. Indeed, a study by Dr’s Frances McGinnity and Gillian Kingston at Trinity College Dublin found that – despite attitudes towards migrants becoming more negative as a result of recession-based unemployment between 2008-11 – once this was accounted for a higher proportion of immigrants were associated with more positive attitudes.³⁶ Moreover, amongst more educated cohorts, this effect is more pronounced – with unemployment more acutely felt amongst cohorts with lower educational qualifications.³⁷ Interestingly, McGinnity and Kingston (2017) found that cultural change and transformation had a very small or no effect on anti-migrant prejudice.³⁸ This was attributed to the relatively short period of mass immigration into Ireland in the 2000’s and the ‘whiteness’ of migrants being received during that period.

This trend towards more positive attitudes was reflected in popular attitudes during the period under consideration. For example, in February 2017, it was reported that Irish citizens were 20 points above the European average in their positivity towards EU (81%) and non-EU migrants (57%).³⁹ This was despite 41% of Irish citizens listing ‘immigration’ as their main concern, above

³¹Global Detention Report (March 2018) ‘Profile Updated: March 2018 Ireland Immigration Detention Profile.’ Hyperlink: <https://www.globaldetentionproject.org/countries/europe/ireland>. Date Accessed: 09/0/2018.

³²Global Detention Report. ‘Europe’. Hyperlink: <https://www.globaldetentionproject.org/regions-subregions/europe>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018.

³³Holland, K. (20th July 2017) ‘Galway family left ‘distracted’ by arrest of former au pair.’ *The Irish Times*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/crime-and-law/galway-family-left-distraught-by-arrest-of-former-au-pair-1.3160547?mode=sample&auth-failed=1&pw-origin=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.irishtimes.com%2Fnews%2Fcrime-and-law%2Fgalway-family-left-distraught-by-arrest-of-former-au-pair-1.3160547>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018.

³⁴ NASC (14th March 2018) ‘Immigration Detention & Border Control in Ireland.’ Hyperlink: <http://www.nascireland.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/Nasc-Immigration-Detention-Border-Control-in-Ireland.pdf>. P.46

³⁵ The Journal.ie. (22nd April 2018) ‘Contract awarded for new immigration unit with detention cells at Dublin Airport.’ Hyperlink: http://www.thejournal.ie/dublin-airport-immigration-3959990-Apr2018/?utm_source=shortlink. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018

³⁶McGinnity, F. & Kingston, G. (Autumn 2017) ‘An Irish Welcome? Changing Irish Attitudes to Immigrants and Immigration: The Role of Recession and Immigration.’ *The Economic and Social Review* 48 (3): 253-279.

³⁷ Ibid. PP.270-272.

³⁸ Ibid. P.273.

³⁹ O’Keefe, A. (27th February 2017) ‘Revealed: From Brexit fallout to immigration, the Irish are more optimistic than most.’ *The Independent*. Hyperlink: <https://www.independent.ie/business/brexit/revealed-from-brexit-fallout-to-immigration-the-irish-are-more-optimistic-than-most-35486306.html>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

'terrorism' (33%) and 'public finances' (21%).⁴⁰ Moreover, and focusing on refugees, Irish citizens were broadly supportive of the Irish Refugee Protection Programme where the government promised to welcome 4,000 Syrian refugees to Ireland by the end of 2017. In a February 2017 Sunday Independent/Millward Brown poll, 54% said that they would not object to a refugee centre in their own community and 52% agreeing that greater cosmopolitanism has a more positive effect on society.⁴¹ Despite this, there were lingering prejudicial fears about the presence of (predominantly Muslim) Syrian migrants – with 62% concerned that terrorists could enter Ireland and only 19% agreeing that Islamic communities do enough to adapt to the Irish way of life.⁴² Moreover, the same poll found that 53% of Irish citizens didn't believe that the Islamic community was doing enough to encourage Muslims to adapt to Irish ways of living.⁴³ This builds on previous research that illustrates lingering anti-Muslim prejudice in Irish society – finding that only 41% of Irish citizens would accept 'some' or 'many' Muslim migrants coming into the country;⁴⁴ that 13.7 % of Irish citizens would not want a Muslim neighbour;⁴⁵ and, that 22% of Irish citizens wish for a total ban on Muslim migration.⁴⁶

Despite the Muslim community only making up 1.3% of the Irish population, anti-Muslim prejudice in Ireland has become a key issue of concern during the period under consideration. A newly released report by the Turkish-based Foundation for Political, Economic and Social Research (SETA) in March 2017 found 'worrying developments' in the treatment and perception of Muslims in Ireland – with 'terror attack', 'terrorists' and 'extremists' often being used as co-locates for 'Islamic' in Irish media reporting as well as structural and institutional exclusion said to be occurring in the educational sphere.⁴⁷ While it was noted that the Irish Garda had started recording anti-Muslim hostility on its PULSE database in 2015, the author of the report, Dr James Carr, could not access statistics about these incidents at the Central Statistics Office. Moreover, in June 2017, there were reports of anti-Muslim graffiti, saying "F**k Islam", being sprayed at a park and a bus stop in Tallaght, South

⁴⁰ EC Europa. 'Irish most optimistic about EU's future – Eurobarometer autumn 2016.' Hyperlink: https://ec.europa.eu/ireland/news/irish-most-optimistic-about-eu-s-future-eurobarometer-autumn-2016_en/. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁴¹ O'Hanlon, E. (26th February 2017) 'Irish welcome refugees but fear terrorists.' *The Independent*. Hyperlink: <https://www.independent.ie/irish-news/politics/irish-welcome-refugees-but-fear-terrorists-35482869.html>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Kantar Millward Brown (26th February 2017) 'National Opinion Poll: February 2017'. Hyperlink: http://www.millwardbrown.com/docs/default-source/ireland-downloads/opinion-polls/issues_with_integration_on_the_continent_can_be_a_lesson_to_us-sunday_independent_26th_february_2017.pdf. Date Accessed: 11/05/2018. P.14.

⁴⁴ McGinnity, F, Grotti, R., Russell, H. and Fahey, E. (March 2018) 'Attitudes to Diversity in Ireland'. *Irish Human Rights Commission*. Hyperlink: <https://www.ihrec.ie/app/uploads/2018/03/Attitudes-to-diversity-in-Ireland.pdf>. Date Accessed: 10/05/2018. P.25.

⁴⁵ Strabac, Z. & Listhag, O. (2007) 'Anti-Muslim prejudice in Europe: A multilevel analysis of survey data from 30 countries.' *Social Science Research* 37(1):268-286. P.278.

⁴⁶ Marfouk, A. (November 2016) 'I'm Neither Racist nor Xenophobic, but: Dissecting European Attitudes towards a Ban on Muslims' Immigration.' Center for Ethnic and Migration Studies, University of Liege, IWEPS . Hyperlink: https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/79747/1/MPRA_paper_79747.pdf. Date Accessed: 16/05/2018. P.24.

⁴⁷ Baker, N. (23rd March 2017) 'Treatment of Muslims in Ireland a 'worry', says European report.' *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/treatment-of-muslims-in-ireland-a-worry-says-european-report-445857.html>. Date accessed: 23/03/2018.

Dublin.⁴⁸ This led to renewed calls by key figures in South Dublin's Muslim community for hate crime legislation to be introduced. Finally, the period under consideration came after a heightened period of anti-Muslim activism –with an Irish chapter of PEGIDA(Patriotic Europeans Against the Islamisation of the West) set up in January 2016, patrols being conducted by the Irish chapter of the Finnish anti-Islam and anti-refugee vigilante group, the Soldiers of Odin,⁴⁹ in May and the setting up of the far-right anti-Islamic National Party in November 2016. It seems that anti-Muslim prejudice has mainly been stirred by these groups and media reporting during the period under study.

One minority group that is persistently painted in a negative light in Ireland is the traveller community. In an October 2017 poll, only 9% of respondents would want a family member to marry a person from a population considered as 'itinerants' by the Irish government.⁵⁰ Moreover, while 47% of people were happy to have a Polish co-worker, only 25% would accept a traveller as a fellow work colleague.⁵¹ In an earlier poll, 52% of the Irish population objected to travellers being an ethnic minority; this was in contrast to 81% of Irish TeachtaDála (TD or 'Member of Parliament') being supportive of the measure.⁵² Despite recognition of their unique ethnic identity in March 2017, the picture is therefore still bleak for this minority in Ireland – with only 16% of travellers completing compulsory education and wide pessimism around life chances being prevalent amongst the community in 2017.⁵³ This picture of prejudicial feelings can also be extended to the Roma the 5,000 Romani Gypsies in Ireland – with only 25% of Irish citizens saying they would accept 'some' or 'many' Roma migrants coming into the country.⁵⁴

6. Radical Nationalist Groups and Parties

Ireland has long been treated as an exception in the academic literature on radical right parties.⁵⁵ With no prominent Neo-Fascist or Neo-Nazi organisations at the social or political level, experts on the Irish radical right have increasingly had to search around for functionally equivalent forms of populist nationalism at the party-political level.⁵⁶ One seminal article that has explored the failure of

⁴⁸ O'Keefe, C. (28th June 2017) 'Call for hate crime laws after anti-Islam graffiti in Dublin.' *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/call-for-hate-crime-laws-after-anti-islam-graffiti-in-dublin-453496.html>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁴⁹ *Hope not Hate*. 'Soldiers of Odin Network'. Hyperlink: <https://www.hopenothate.org.uk/research/islamophobia-hub/profiles/anti-muslim-street-protest-movements/soldiers-odin-network/>. Date Accessed: 09/05/2018.

⁵⁰ Holland, K. (4th October 2017) 'Just 9% of settled people would want a Traveller marrying into family.' *Irish Times*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/just-9-of-settled-people-would-want-a-traveller-marrying-into-family-1.3244131?mode=sample&auth-failed=1&pw-origin=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.irishtimes.com%2Fnews%2Fsocial-affairs%2Fjust-9-of-settled-people-would-want-a-traveller-marrying-into-family-1.3244131>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁵¹ *Ibid*.

⁵² Ryan, O. (13th June 2016) 'Half of Irish people don't want Travellers to have ethnic status.' *Journal.ie*. Hyperlink: <http://www.thejournal.ie/traveller-ethnicity-opinion-poll-2815067-Jun2016/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁵³ RTE Ireland (4th October 2017) 'Rise in Traveller educational attainment – survey.' Hyperlink: <https://www.rte.ie/news/education/2017/1004/909644-educational-attainment-travellers/>. Date accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁵⁴ McGinnity, F, Grotti, R., Russell, H. and Fahey, E. (March 2018) 'Attitudes to Diversity in Ireland'. *Irish Human Rights Commission*. Hyperlink: <https://www.ihrec.ie/app/uploads/2018/03/Attitudes-to-diversity-in-Ireland.pdf>. Date Accessed: 10/05/2018.

⁵⁵ Mudde, C. (2007) *Populist Right Parties in Europe*. PP.51 & 52.

⁵⁶ Cronin, M (1997) *The Blue Shirts and Irish Politics*. Dublin: Four Courts Press; Garner, S. (2007) 'Ireland and immigration: explaining the absence of the far right' *Patterns of Prejudice* 41(2): 109-130.; Fanning, B.

the radical right in Ireland was Eoin O'Malley's excellent (2008) article in the academic journal, *Western European Politics*. What he found was that – despite Ireland being a place amenable to the growth of a radical right party - the only generally accepted radical-right group, the Immigration Control Platform (ICP), had failed to register any notable electoral support during its period of operation from 2002-2011.⁵⁷ Moreover, O'Malley goes on to argue that Sinn Féin has taken the place of the radical right within the Irish party system – combining an anti-establishment platform with radical nationalism that has also (coincidentally) attracted younger voters with anti-immigrant and intolerant positions.⁵⁸

Looking more historically, Steve Garner's (2007) article explaining the absence of the far right in Ireland argues that it is a racialized form of governance implemented by the mainstream parties – especially around the focal issue of citizenship – that has stunted the rise of a successful radical right presence in the country.⁵⁹ Historical examples of failure include the short-lived 'Blue Shirts' in the 1930s who, like the British Union of Fascists in the UK, drew their inspiration from the fascism of Benito Mussolini. A paramilitary organisation linked to the Cumann na nGaedheal party at the founding of an independent Irish state, Michael Cronin (1997) argues that the Blue Shirts were more populist than fascist and were happy to merge with one of the mainstream parties, Fine Gael, in 1935.⁶⁰ A more overtly Neo-Nazi organisation that directly preceded the ICP was an Irish branch of the American National Socialist Party that began to organise in Ireland over the 2000 - 2003 period. Locally-based forms of activism ended in failure and the party adopted a continuing trend of far right activism online - with race-based arguments ranging across the themes of invasion, the failure of politicians to defend Irish culture, and Holocaust denial being evident.⁶¹ Looking more contemporaneously, there are only two political parties to carry a recognisable radical right agenda in Ireland, Justin Barrett's National Party and Peter O'Loughlin's Identity Ireland. Pro-life, staunchly Catholic and anti-immigrant, the National Party, however, ceased to be a registered party in 2017 and didn't contest elections in the previous year.⁶² Moreover, despite Identity Ireland being registered as an official party in 2017, forays by committee members into the electoral arena by the staunchly anti-Islam, ethno-nationalist party have exclusively ended in failure – with O'Loughlin achieving 1.00% and 0.36% of the vote when running in the 2014 European and 2016 Irish elections, respectively.⁶³

Another study to focus on the relative absence of the populist radical right in Ireland is Bryan Fanning and Fidele Mutswarasibo's (2007) article on Ireland's 2004 Citizenship referendum which institutionalised a populist distinction between nationals and non-nationals. Here, Fanning and

& Mutswarasibo, F. (2007) 'Nationals/non-nationals: immigration, citizenship and politics in the Republic of Ireland.' *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 30(3): 439-460; O'Malley, E. (2008) 'Why is there no Radical Right Party in Ireland?' *West European Politics* 31(5) 960-977.

⁵⁷ O'Malley, E. (2008) 'Why is there no Radical Right Party in Ireland?' *West European Politics* 31(5). P.961

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Garner, S. (2007) 'Ireland and immigration: explaining the absence of the far right' *Patterns of Prejudice* 41(2). P.109.

⁶⁰ Cronin, M (1997) *The Blue Shirts and Irish Politics*. Dublin: Four Courts Press.

⁶¹ Garner, S. (2007) 'Ireland and immigration: explaining the absence of the far right' *Patterns of Prejudice* 41(2). P. 110.

⁶² Hope not Hate (January – February 2018) *2018 State of Hate Report: Far Right Terrorism on the Rise*. London: Hope not Hate. P. 81.

⁶³ ElectionsIreland.org (2014) 'South Region Results'. Hyperlink: <https://electionsireland.org/result.cfm?election=2014E&cons=242>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018 & RTE News (2016) 'Election 2016: Peter O'Loughlin.' Hyperlink: <https://www.rte.ie/news/election-2016/candidates/766449-peter-oloughlin/>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

Mutswarasibo argue that the politics of the referendum highlighted how a process of exclusionary nation-building and recurring economic distributional anxieties had come to shape mainstream party positions on citizenship in Ireland.⁶⁴ Looking into the mainstream party campaigns during the referendum, they highlighted Minister Michael McDowell's claims about the exploitation of Irish maternity health services by immigrant mothers seeking Irish citizenship for their children and how the referendum in essence saw a shift towards a mono-ethnic form of national identity.⁶⁵ This mainstreaming of racist and nationalist positions can therefore be posited as another reason for the relative absence of the radical right in Ireland.

Looking beyond party political manifestations of the radical nationalist movements, social movement manifestations of the radical right have emerged in the period of study. In November 2017, an Irish branch of the pan-European ethno-nationalist organisation, Generation Identity, was established – with Facebook page⁶⁶ and website⁶⁷ set up at the time of the launch. Most of their activities have been limited to publicity stunts (such as the unfurling of banners in Dublin over scaffolds and bridges calling for people to 'Defend Ireland') and handing out leaflets concerning 'African Gangs' in Balbriggan. The group currently has 3,879 'likes' on Facebook⁶⁸ and 3,568 followers on Twitter⁶⁹. It should be noted that the Irish chapter of the movement has questionable autonomy for the UK and other core European chapters in Germany and France – acting more as a placeholder rather than a substantive separate movement away from its Continental cousins.

7. Xenophobia amongst Sports Fans

Like in other Western democracies, nationalism and xenophobia have showed historic connections with some sections of sporting community in Ireland. As mentioned in Athena S. Leoussi's (2001) *Encyclopaedia of Nationalism*, the Gaelic Athletic Association pursued a policy of promoting exclusively Irish sports from its inception in 1884 and plays a prominent role in the Irish republican movement of Northern Ireland today.⁷⁰ Perhaps one of the most prominent incidents of far right nationalist involvement in sporting events in recent Irish history was the February 1995 Lansdowne Road Riot where the British far right paramilitary group, Combat 18, began chanting 'Sieg Hail' and gave Nazi salutes during a game between England and Ireland.⁷¹ Missiles were thrown on the pitch and a mini riot ensued.

Luckily, such high level incidences have not been experienced since but not without serious efforts by civil society organisations to combat racism and discrimination. One of the leading initiatives in the Republic of Ireland to promote positive integration and social inclusion in sports is Sports Against

⁶⁴Mutswarasibo, F. (2007) 'Nationals/non-nationals: immigration, citizenship and politics in the Republic of Ireland', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 30(3). P.440.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁶Generation Identity EIRE Ireland and Northern Ireland Facebook Page. Hyperlink: <https://www.facebook.com/giEIRE/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁶⁷Generation Identity United Kingdom and Ireland. Homepage. Hyperlink: <https://www.generation-identity.org.uk/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁶⁸Generation Identity EIRE Ireland and Northern Ireland Facebook Page. Hyperlink: <https://www.facebook.com/giEIRE/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁶⁹Generation Identity UK & Ireland. Twitter Page. Hyperlink: <https://twitter.com/generatidentity?lang=en>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷⁰Leoussi, A. (ed.) (2001) *Encyclopaedia of Nationalism*. London: Transaction Publishers.

⁷¹Fottrell, S. & Austin, S. (28th May 2013) 'England v Republic of Ireland: Riot marred Lansdowne Road friendly.' *BBC Sport*. Hyperlink: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/22397204>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

Racism Ireland (SARI).⁷² They put on regular events to combat discrimination, xenophobia and racism in football by putting on football tournaments, community events and school visits that promote cohesiveness and diversity in sport. Another organisation dedicated to stamping out xenophobia and racism in sport is Show Racism the Red Card (SRtRC), Ireland. Formally launch in 2006, SRtRC Ireland produces anti-racist educational resources, conducts awareness raising campaigns and delivers workshops and training in schools and other organisations across the country.⁷³ In 2017 alone, the organisation reported that it had reached 6,000+ school students, involved 3,878 players in SRtRC actions, and allowed 200 schools to participate in its Anti-Racism Creative Competition.⁷⁴

Having said this, one of the most high profile of incidents of xenophobia in sport during the period under consideration came in the latter part of 2017. For instance, in November 2017, Republic of Ireland defender, Cyrus Christie, reported he had been 'in tears' after being subjected to a torrent of racist abuse on Twitter.⁷⁵ The perpetrator in question had told Christie to 'go play for Jamaica' and suggested that he would start a petition to 'lynch' the Ireland defender. The incident was reported to the Irish Garda by the Football Association of Ireland and widely condemned by fans and official bodies alike. Talking about the abuse, Christie stated: 'It is deeply saddening that racism is still part of the game we all enjoy and love. I strongly believe we need to stand up against these individuals who do not belong in football or any other sport.'⁷⁶ The Garda contacted Twitter as part of their investigations in an attempt to establish the identity of the perpetrator.⁷⁷ As of March 2018, the Police investigation was inconclusive.⁷⁸ Indeed, an additional report of overt racism online directed towards the defender was also being investigated at the time of writing.

8. Hate Crime

Despite the low recorded levels of hate crime in Ireland, there are a number of third party organisations involved in monitoring and acting as a reporting mechanism for such incidences. For example, in June 2017, Ireland anti-racism NGO, ENAR, used its iReport online monitoring tool in the preceding six months to find 330 reports of racist assaults, harassment and discrimination – a 33% increase on the previous six month reporting period (p.7).⁷⁹ Of these, there were 19 assaults – including arson, sexual assaults and threats to kill (p.8). Moreover, there were 162 reports of hate speech – either online and or in newspapers (p.7) - 166 instances of verbal abuse (p.12), and 62 reports of racist abuse against Jews and Muslims in the six month period – occurring both in the online and offline space (pp.19-20). Finally, and related to previous discussion already, only one third

⁷²SARI Website. 'News' Page. Hyperlink: <http://www.sari.ie/news/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷³SRtRC Website. 'About' Page. Hyperlink: <http://theredcard.ie/about/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷⁴SRtRC Website. 'News' Page. Hyperlink: <http://theredcard.ie/news/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷⁵Crowzer, O. (19th November 2017) 'Ireland star Cyrus Christie subjected to racist abuse online after Ireland's 5-1 loss to Denmark.' Hyperlink: <https://www.thesun.ie/sport/football/1823771/ireland-star-cyrus-christie-subjected-to-racist-abuse-online-after-irelands-5-1-loss-to-denmark/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷⁶The 42. (19th March 2018) 'After racist abuse and World Cup heartache, Ireland's Young Player of the Year eager to move on.' Hyperlink: <http://www.the42.ie/cyrus-christie-ireland-denmark-3912438-Mar2018/>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁷⁷Byrne, L. (26th December 2017) 'Gardai launch hunt for trolls who sent Christie online abuse.' *Herald.ie*. Hyperlink: <https://www.herald.ie/news/gardai-launch-hunt-for-trolls-who-sent-christie-online-abuse-after-36437036.html>. Date Accessed: 17/04/2018.

⁷⁸O'Hehir, P. (23rd March 2018) 'You think it's going away but it comes back' - Cyrus Christie says not enough being done to tackle racism.' *Irish Mirror*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishmirror.ie/sport/soccer/soccer-news/you-think-its-going-away-12234997>. Date Accessed: 17/04/2018.

⁷⁹iReport.ie (January – June 2017) 'Reports of Racism in Ireland'. Hyperlink: http://enarireland.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/iReport_1516_jan-jun2017.pdf. Date Accessed: 22/03/2018.

of respondents felt confident reporting such instances to the police – preferring instead to inform third sector organisations as well as other private and public non-law enforcement bodies.

Turning to more qualitative studies of hate crime during the period under study, there has been increasing amounts of focus within the academic community on everyday anti-Muslim prejudice in Ireland. As early as June 2014, Dr James Carr wrote a seminal academic report outlining ‘Experiences of Anti-Muslim Racism in Ireland’ for the University of Limerick’s Hate and Hostility Group.⁸⁰ What Carr found – based on interviews and focus group discussions with 345 Muslim Men and Women – was that Irish converts to Islam were particularly targeted as ‘traitors’ (p.3); that Muslims were treated as ‘suspect communities’ by police and society at large (p.4); and that a greater degree of anti-Muslim hostility was felt by individuals who were identifiable based on skin colour (47% of respondents) and other, cultural markers of ‘Muslimness’ (such as the wearing of the Hijab or SalwaarKameez) (45% of respondents) (p.5). In addition, he found that 36% of respondents had experienced some form of anti-Muslim racism – with 22% experiencing physical assaults, 20% harassment and 14% damage to personal property (p.3) – and that only 36% of victims reported anti-Muslim hostility (p.9). Finally, there was also a noticeably gendered aspect of this discrimination and hostility – with 96% of Muslim women who participated in the study suggesting that they had experienced some form hostility based on how they dressed compared with just under half (45%) of the men surveyed (p.6).

In a further (2015) study,⁸¹ Dr Carr (along with his co-author, Amanda Haynes) focus on how transnational and local self-imaginings of race feed into perceptions of the Muslim community in Ireland. What they argue is that Muslims are caught between two different competing racializations – on the one hand an exclusionary form of Irishness and on the other a racialized form of Muslimness (p.21). They also argue that the Irish state’s lack of willingness to categorise anti-Muslim hatred as a specific offence is part of a wider dismantling of the apparatus to address racism, which reflects the neoliberalisation of race (ibid). Finally, and based on Carr’s PhD research into Anti-Muslim hostility in Ireland, what the authors find is that – of the 36% of participants stated as experiencing some form of anti-Muslim hostility – two-thirds reported that they did not refer it to any state entity (p.30). This was largely based on fear of the police, fear of reprisals in case they were identified to the perpetrator(s) and notions of futility around the reporting of hate crimes (pp.30-32). This again paints minority communities confidence in reporting hate crime in Ireland.

Finally, and turning the issue of homophobic hate crime, it was very hard to gather up-to-date statistics surrounding this phenomena during the period under study. In May 2017, the main source of monitoring for anti-gay incidents, Ireland’s Gay and Lesbian Network, was closed following a review of its financial operations.⁸² This did not however serve to mask key homophobic incidents during the period under consideration. In August 2017, a gay man from County Sligo, Gary Daly, was

⁸⁰Carr, J. (June 2014) ‘Experiences of Anti-Muslim Racism in Ireland.’ University of Limerick: Hate and Hostility Research Group. Hyperlink: <https://ulsites.ul.ie/hhrg/sites/default/files/Experiences%20of%20Anti-Muslim%20Racism%20in%20Ireland.pdf>. Date Accessed: 10/04/2018.

⁸¹Carr, J. & Haynes, A. (2015) ‘A Clash of Racializations: The Policing of ‘Race’ and of Anti-Muslim Racism in Ireland.’ *Critical Sociology* 41(1): 21-40. Hyperlink: <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0896920513492805>. Date Accessed: 10/04/2018.

⁸²*The Independent* (18th May 2017) ‘Gay and Lesbian Equality Network to close after recent controversy.’ Hyperlink: <https://www.independent.ie/irish-news/gay-and-lesbian-equality-network-to-close-after-recent-controversy-35729024.html>. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018.

head-butted, punched and bitten after kissing another man on a date.⁸³ Moreover, in June 2017, reports emerged that young people returning from Dublin's annual Pride event were subjected to homophobic abuse.⁸⁴ Finally, a December 2017 report by NGO, Stop Transphobia and Discrimination Ireland, found that only 10% transphobic hate crimes are reported to the Irish Police – compared to 75% in Northern Ireland.⁸⁵ Better training in hate crime directed towards transgendered people was seen as a key way to rectify underreporting.⁸⁶

9. Glorification of German National Socialism and collaborators of the Nazi Germany

Holocaust denial is not illegal in Ireland. Freedom of speech is guaranteed under Article 40 of the Irish Constitution but is limited to speech that does not 'undermine public order or morality or the authority of the State.'⁸⁷ Moreover, this is extended to 'publication or utterance of blasphemous, seditious, or indecent matter...punishable in accordance with law'.⁸⁸ Since the publication of the 1937 Constitution, there have been attempts to limit incitement to hatred and include prohibitions of blasphemy under religious hatred. In 1989, the Prohibition of Incitement to Hatred Act made it an offence to make, distribute, or broadcast 'threatening, abusive or insulting' verbal and non-verbal gestures with intent or likelihood to 'stir up hatred', where 'hatred' is 'against a group of persons in the State or elsewhere on account of their race, colour, nationality, religion, ethnic or national origins, membership of the travelling community or sexual orientation'.⁸⁹ Moreover, in 2013, a Constitutional Convention recommended placing prohibition of blasphemy within the ban on religious hatred within the 1989 act. This was endorsed by the Oireachtas and will be put to a referendum later in 2018.⁹⁰

Outbursts of Neo-Nazi activism in an attempt to glorify German National Socialism were at a fairly low-level during the period under consideration. In May 2017, it was reported that a group of neo-Nazi's conducted a sticker campaign in the Western Irish City of Galway - featuring the slogan 'Defend Your Heritage' and an image of men with swords on horses chasing immigrants.⁹¹ The group

⁸³Farrell, C. (31st August 2017) 'HORROR ATTACK: Gay man is headbutted and BITTEN after homophobic thugs see him kiss his date in Sligo pub.' *The Irish Sun*. Hyperlink: <https://www.thesun.ie/news/1468248/gay-man-is-headbutted-and-bitten-after-homophobic-thugs-see-him-kiss-his-date-in-sligo-pub/>. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018.

⁸⁴O'Reilly, B. (26th June 2017) 'I helped a teenager wipe his pride face paint off' - horrific homophobic abuse on bus following Dublin pride.' *The Independent.ie*. Hyperlink: <https://www.independent.ie/irish-news/i-helped-a-teenager-wipe-his-pride-face-paint-off-horrific-homophobic-abuse-on-bus-following-dublin-pride-35865457.html>. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018.

⁸⁵Donoghue, K. (5th December 2017) '90% Of Transphobic Hate Crimes Go Unreported To Gardaí.' *Gay Community News*. Hyperlink: <https://gcn.ie/90pi-transphobic-hate-crimes-unreported-gardai/>. Date Accessed: 15/05/2018.

⁸⁶ Ibid.

⁸⁷Constitution of Ireland (1937). Hyperlink: http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/cons/en/html#article40_6_1. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁸⁸ ibid

⁸⁹Houses of Oireachtas. Prohibition of Incitement to Hatred Act 1989. Hyperlink: <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/1989/act/19/enacted/en/html>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁹⁰ Houses of Oireachtas (2nd October 2014) Sixth Report of the Constitutional Convention - Blasphemy: Statements. Hyperlink: <http://oireachtasdebates.oireachtas.ie/debates%20authoring/debateswebpack.nsf/takes/dail2014100200011?opendocument#N5>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁹¹McGarrigle, S. (23/03/2018) 'Sick neo-Nazis urge attacks on refugees in Ireland.' Hyperlink: <https://www.irishmirror.ie/news/irish-news/sick-neo-nazis-urge-attacks-10403073#r3z-addoor>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

of neo-Nazis were also behind a graffiti tribute to Adolf Hitler beside the Westend Canal in the City.⁹² Added to this was the rise of far-right National Party leader, Justin Barrett. It was found that he had attended German and Italian neo-Nazi and neo-Fascist conferences in the late 1990s and early 2000s as a guest. In the former conference, a standing ovation was given to a former SS officer and speeches were said to have lauded and quoted Hitler.⁹³ These incidents were used to discredit Barrett as a prominent leader in Ireland's 'No to Nice Campaign' in 2002 amidst an Irish referendum to ratify the Nice Treaty that year.

10. Human Rights in Ireland

There were no high profile instances of repression by the state directed at anti-fascist or human rights activists during the period under consideration. Looking at Ireland's human rights performance in the past couple of years, some worrying trends have been highlighted by the international community. In May 2016, for example, Ireland's Justice Minister, Francis Fitzgerald was called before the UN to be questioned by other members on the country's human rights record.⁹⁴ In particular, issues around access to abortion, recognition of travellers as an ethnic group as well as non-discriminatory access to education on religious grounds were highlighted. Moreover, in July 2017, a UN report highlighted 'significant gaps' in Ireland's protection of human rights – particularly in relation to prisoner treatment, support for victims of people trafficking, and police accountability.⁹⁵ It suggested that women's prisons were some of the most overcrowded and that unannounced inspections on Garda stations to hold officers to account were not routine. Despite this, the general complexion of human rights within Ireland was considered to be doing well – with UN reports noting the country's ratification of conventions relating to children, domestic workers, organised crime and human trafficking.⁹⁶ This was affirmed in 2012 when UN Special Rapporteur, Margaret Sekaggya, visited the country – noting there to be a conducive and enabling environment for human rights defender in Ireland.⁹⁷

11. Conclusions for the period

The period under study has not seen any major upticks in radicalism and popular xenophobia in Ireland. Whilst 2016 saw a heightened period of anti-Muslim activism, Ireland still remains an exceptional case in Europe whereby there is little or no successful organisation by the far right; both at the street movement and electoral level. Moreover, we can also paint a positive picture in terms of popular attitudes towards minorities, migrants and foreigners – with Ireland above average in its

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³McKittrick, D. (11th October 2002) 'Irish 'no' spokesman tied to neo-Nazis.' *The Independent*. Hyperlink: <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/irish-no-spokesman-tied-to-neo-nazis-139799.html>. Date Accessed: 23/03/2018.

⁹⁴Hayes, I. (11th May 2016) 'Ireland will be grilled on its human rights record at the UN today - and it might not be pretty.' *Thejournal.ie*. Hyperlink: <http://www.thejournal.ie/ireland-human-rights-un-review-2761526-May2016/>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

⁹⁵Leogue, J. (19th July 2017) 'Ireland has 'significant' human rights gaps.' *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/ireland-has-significant-human-rights-gaps-455106.html>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

⁹⁶UN Committee Against Torture (31st August 2017) 'Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Ireland' & UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (9th March 2017) 'Concluding observations on the combined sixth and seventh periodic reports of Ireland.' Hyperlink: <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Countries/ENACARRegion/Pages/IEIndex.aspx>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

⁹⁷UN General Assembly (26th February 2013) 'Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders, Margaret Sekaggya, Addendum Mission to Ireland (19 – 23 November 2012)' Hyperlink: http://ap.ohchr.org/documents/dpage_e.aspx?si=A/HRC/22/47/Add.3. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

support for EU and non-EU migrants and welcoming of refugees after the 2015 Syria crisis. Furthermore, rhetoric by governing elites towards minorities has been on the whole supportive – with only some instances suggesting the presence of anti-migrant and anti-Semitic discourse.

In the Irish case, there does, however, exist some areas of concern that need to be noted. In particular, hardened and closed attitudes towards the traveller and Islamic communities in Ireland can be picked up from recent opinion polls – with many Irish citizens spurning relations with the former and harbouring suspicions about terrorist activity in the latter. Moreover, a lack of representation of minorities in the national Garda suggests significant barriers to diversity and a lack of confidence within minority communities – with many third party reports noting that minorities are reluctant to report suspected hate crimes to the police. Finally, recent UN reports have suggested ‘significant gaps’ in Ireland’s protection of human rights – particularly in relation to prisoner treatment, support for victims of people trafficking, and policing accountability.⁹⁸

In sum, then, while there is a lack of successfully organised right-wing radicalism in Ireland, there are some concerning trends – both at the elite and popular level – with regards to xenophobic prejudice. Government and third-party organisations should therefore actively focus their attention at combatting this xenophobia in public and political spaces as well as prejudice at a mass level.

12. Recommendations:

1) General recommendations for the accession to international agreements and conventions.

There are a number of United Nations conventions that Ireland has signed but not ratified that could help strengthen the position of minorities and human rights activists within the country. In particular, the Optional Protocol of the Convention against Torture, the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance and the International Convention on the Protection of Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families require accession.⁹⁹

2) General recommendations for adjustments to the legal framework.

The major lacuna within Ireland’s response to xenophobia and radicalism is specific hate crime legislation. While the 1989 Prohibition of Incitement to Hatred Act and subsequent Equality acts (1998-2004) have closed the general legal net around discrimination, a more explicit recognition of hate crime as a criminal offence with its own specific statute is still not forthcoming. A piece of legislation therefore that incorporates the OSCE’s Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights ‘hate crime’ definition for non-violent acts of harassment would do much to garner confidence among minority communities and provide a more systematic basis for official recording – tapping into the prevalence of the phenomena within wider society.¹⁰⁰

A second and related measure would be the lowering the legal barriers set against the travelling community in Ireland. Efforts are being made to investigate and report on the possibility of recognising a separate ethnic identity for Travellers – with a separate ethnic identity recognised by

⁹⁸Leogue, J. (19th July 2017) ‘Ireland has ‘significant’ human rights gaps.’ *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/ireland-has-significant-human-rights-gaps-455106.html>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.

⁹⁹ UN Human Rights Council. ‘Ratification Status for Ireland.’ Hyperlink: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/Treaty.aspx?CountryID=83&Lang=EN. Date Accessed: 11/04/2018.

¹⁰⁰OSCE ODIHR (2018) ‘What is Hate Crime?’ Hate Crime Reporting. Hyperlink: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/what-hate-crime>.

the Irish state in March 2017 of the period under study. In addition to this, however, wider measures are needed to tackle disadvantage suffered by the travelling community in education, the workplace and in the hands of law enforcers.¹⁰¹

3) General recommendations for the executive bodies in the field of law enforcement and human rights.

As noted above, practices to greater boost diversity within the national Garda would help generate greater confidence amongst minority communities in law enforcement agencies. Better training to spot and record hate crime would also help foster greater trust. This could also be extended to the online space. Reflecting on the sad case of Cyrus Christie, better attempts are needed by law enforcement to interdict online forms of hate speech. Finally, and picking up on the UN's July 2017 on human rights in Ireland, greater steps need to be made to address prisoner treatment, support for victims of people trafficking, and police accountability – particularly when it comes to women prisoners and spot checks on Garda stations.¹⁰²

¹⁰¹ RTE Ireland (4th October 2017) 'Rise in Traveller educational attainment – survey.' Hyperlink: <https://www.rte.ie/news/education/2017/1004/909644-educational-attainment-travellers/>. Date accessed: 23/03/2018.

¹⁰² Leogue, J. (19th July 2017) 'Ireland has 'significant' human rights gaps.' *Irish Examiner*. Hyperlink: <https://www.irishexaminer.com/ireland/ireland-has-significant-human-rights-gaps-455106.html>. Date Accessed: 29/03/2018.