

TEACHING AND LEARNING IN TIBET

Reader's copy

Nordic Institute of Asian Studies
Recent NIAS Reports

28. Christopher E. Goscha: *Vietnam or Indochina? Contesting Concepts of Space in Vietnamese Nationalism, 1887–1954*
29. Alain Lefebvre: *Islam, Human Rights and Child Labour in Pakistan*
30. Mytte Fentz: *Natural Resources and Cosmology in Changing Kalasha Society*
31. Børge Bakken (ed.): *Migration in China*
32. Donald B. Wagner: *The Traditional Chinese Iron Industry and Its Modern Fate*
33. Elisabeth Özdalga: *The Veiling Issue, Official Secularism and Popular Islam in Modern Turkey*
34. Sven Cederroth: *Basket Case or Poverty Alleviation? Bangladesh Approaches the Twenty-First Century*
35. Sven Cederroth and Harald O. Skar: *Development Aid to Nepal*
36. David D. Wang: *Clouds over Tianshan. Essays on Social Disturbance in Xinjiang in the 1940s*
37. Erik Paul: *Australia in Southeast Asia. Regionalisation and Democracy*
38. Dang Phong and Melanie Beresford: *Authority Relations and Economic Decision-Making in Vietnam*
39. Mason C. Hoadley (ed.): *Southeast Asian-Centred Economies or Economics?*
40. Cecilia Nathansen Milwertz: *Beijing Women Organizing for Change*
41. Santosh Soren: *Santalia. Catalogue of Santali Manuscripts in Oslo*
42. Robert Thörlind: *Development, Decentralization and Democracy*
43. Tarab Tulku: *A Brief History of Tibetan Academic Degrees in Buddhist Philosophy*
44. Donald B. Wagner: *The State and the Iron Industry in Han China*
45. Timo Kivimäki (ed.): *War or Peace in the South China Sea?*
46. Ellen Bangsbo: *Teaching and Learning in Tibet. A Review of Research and Policy Publications*

A full list of NIAS publications is available on request or may be viewed online (see copyright page for contact details).

TEACHING AND LEARNING
IN TIBET

A Review of Research and Policy Publications

ELLEN BANGSBO

 **nias** PRESS

Reader's copy

NIAS Report no. 46
First published in 2004 (reprinted from 2019)
by NIAS Press
Nordic Institute of Asian Studies
Øster Farimagsgade 5, 1353 Copenhagen K, Denmark
tel: (+45) 3532 9503 • fax: (+45) 3532 9549
E-mail: books@nias.ku.dk • Website: www.niaspress.dk

© Ellen Bangsbo 2004

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Bangsbo, Ellen

Teaching and learning in Tibet : a review of research and
policy publications

1.Education - China - Tibet 2.Education and state - China -
Tibet

I.Title II. Nordic Institute of Asian Studies

379.5'15

ISBN 978-87-91114-30-4

Typeset by NIAS Press
Printed and bound in Great Britain
by Marston Book Services Limited, Oxfordshire

CONTENTS

PART I: TEACHING AND LEARNING IN TIBET

Chapter 1: Educational Policies in Tibet and China	1
Traditional education policies in Tibet	1
Educational policies in China	3
Contemporary official documents on education in China	4
Floating population	8
Selected references	11
Chapter 2: Teaching and Curriculum	16
A standardized curriculum related to the Tibetan culture	16
Bilingual teaching	19
Language policies and legal rights regarding minority education	22
Concepts of quality education	27
Quality education seen from a Chinese perspective	28
Quality education seen from an international perspective	31
Implications of a 'quality education' approach in Tibet	36
Selected references	39
Chapter 3: Teachers' Education and Training	46
Post-compulsory education	47
'Quality education' in Tibet related to teachers' education	50
Recommended teaching and learning strategies	51
Media and IT	53
Selected references	54
Chapter 4: Access and Participation	60
Pre-school education in rural areas and at township level – elimination of village schools	60
Retention – keeping children in school – girls' access to schools	62
Cooperation between parents and local communities	64
Selected references	67
Chapter 5: International Development Aid	71
Official development actors in Tibet	72
NGOs and institutions in educational development in Tibet and bordering regions	73

Chapter 6: Implications for Educational Projects in Tibet	76
Issues of access and participation	78
Issues of policy and practice for teachers' education	79
Applying Chinese educational policies in Tibet	80
Selected references	82

PART II: BIBLIOGRAPHY

Chapter 7: An annotated bibliography of key publications	87
Chapter 8: Selected Reference Material	124
A. Bibliographic guides	124
B. Newspapers and journals	124
C. Selected statistical references on Tibet and China	127
D. On-line guides	129
E. Selected websites	130
On-line news	130
Education strategies links	131
Online reports on the status of Tibet	132
Online books and publications	133
Online geography and maps	134
Tibet in general	134
Human and legal rights	135

PART III: APPENDICES

Appendix 1: The 1990 and 2000 population census in the PRC	139
Appendix 2: Action plan for vitalizing education for the 21st century (PRC)	145

TABLES

1: Population of Tibetans in the PRC according to the 2000 Census	141
2: The Tibetans and others: breakdown by province and by other ethnicities	142
3: Breakdown of the population of the TAR in the 2000 census	143
4: Percentage of each ethnic group in the total population of the TAR	144

Preface and acknowledgements

At the beginning of the 21st century, attainments for schooling of children in Tibet still lag far behind educational results in most other places. The majority of Tibetans live in the rural areas whereas generally modernization in Tibet has only reached the urban areas. Without adequate schooling and education, the majority of Tibetans will be excluded from any benefits of modernisation or economic improvements in Tibet.

Tibetans are classified as one of China's 55 ethnic minority groups, and they are obliged to follow national directives on schooling in China. But Tibetan culture and language have characteristics of their own and Tibetan concepts of schooling are not necessarily consistent with directives from the official Chinese side. The aim of this bibliographic research guide is to pinpoint problematic issues on schooling in Tibet and to provide an overview of literature dealing with this issue. The main focus is on the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR). With few publications existing on schooling in Tibet, a secondary focus is put on the autonomous prefectures of the Chinese provinces of Sichuan, Gansu, Qinghai and Yunnan). Although there are many similarities, still there are differences between Chinese educational policies and the implementation of the same in the TAR and the autonomous prefectures.

This book is to be regarded as a working paper and as such far from being a complete collection of information on these issues. The compiled information is intended to be used as a guide for literature searched on published research, literature and various kinds of documents collected from selected official Chinese sources, Tibetan NGO's outside Tibet, international news agencies, as well as Chinese, Tibetan, and international scholars with knowledge of social and educational issues in Tibet and China. The intention of the book is to highlight some of the most important problems that Tibetan children meet when they attend school or, quite often, are the cause of why they do not attend school. To provide the reader some details of these issues, each chapter is a compilation of short extracts from published information

of issues related to a specific topic. These short extracts aim to highlight the relevant issues and provide some idea of the content of the source mentioned. The reader is expected to find more details by tracking the source in accordance with the reference. In order to understand issues and problems on schooling in Tibet, one must know the various views of interest as it is expressed from all sides. It has therefore been my intention to provide an unbiased presentation of views on problems on schooling in Tibet as it is seen from all sides, i.e. from Tibetans both in and outside Tibet, international scholars and Chinese scholars, as well as official Chinese sources.

The material was compiled between June 2002 and February 2003 with the addition in October 2003 of data from the People's Republic of China (PRC) 2000 Population Census. Place names mentioned appear in their Tibetan or Chinese forms according to the choice of the author cited. Conclusions and comments without references are my own, those referenced are by the author of that work.

The research guide is in three parts. Part I is a guide to literature searches on research and policy publications related to basic and primary schooling and quality education in Tibet. Part II is an annotated bibliography of selected key publications and statistical information; it also lists selected websites and journals. Finally, Appendices 1 and 2 in Part III provide information on the 2000 population census and official policies for education in China.

My thanks to the NIAS Press staff for assistance, and to Gerald Jackson for support and guidance. I am especially grateful to Leena Höskuldsson for providing extensive editing and critical comments with patience and perseverance and thereby improving the manuscript considerably. Thanks go to Mads Holst Jensen and Anders Højmark Andersen for critical comments and suggestions for additional literature. I also wish to thank Ole Bruun for valuable suggestions for improvements. Finally, I am indebted to the Nordic Institute of Asian Studies (NIAS) for providing support – and facilities – particularly during the process of finalizing the manuscript.

Reader's copy

Part I: Teaching and Learning in Tibet

Reader's copy

Reader's copy

Chapter 1

Educational Policies in Tibet and China

TRADITIONAL EDUCATION POLICIES IN TIBET

The earliest organized formal education in Tibet took place at the Buddhist monasteries and the affiliated universities. Secular schooling was mainly accessible to the elite children of aristocrats, as reading and writing were considered necessary skills only if one were to work for the government or to study the religious scriptures. However, attempts to establish more secular schools in Tibet started to take place at the beginning of the 20th century.

Tibetan government ran two secular schools in Lhasa, but apart from these schools secular education was based on a private tutorial system established by the traditional elite for the education of their children. (Bass 1998: 1).

In his study of the history of Tibet, Goldstein looks closely at the role and introduction of Buddhism in Tibet in the 7th century. The role of Buddhism was to play an important role in bringing a higher culture to the Tibetan people, which is also illustrated in that the Tibetan society was hitherto a pre-literate culture; even the Tibetan alphabet was devised so as to permit the writing down of Buddhist scriptures. During the following centuries, the Tibetan Buddhist monastic orders grew substantially and in the 1950s, as many as 15–20 per cent of the male population in Tibet were monks. Lay and monk officials administered the Tibetan government (pre-1959) and lay officials were normally recruited from the aristocracy. Aristocratic families had to educate their sons either in one of the private schools in Lhasa or at home with private tutors. The monasteries were the traditional centres of education in Tibet, and apart from providing religious education, they were also responsible for providing literacy. With almost no public schools sending children to the monasteries was often the only means, which poor parents had for providing their children with any education. (Goldstein 1989: 5–37)

Burman writes on education in the traditional Tibet that most monks could only read and write and had to memorize the Buddhist scriptures in order to pass the highest degrees in Buddhist philosophy. Students were not required to write out their answers, but to memorize and recite scriptures. Some scholars wrote elaborate treatises on Buddhism, but Tibetan literature in general did not develop much through novels or poetry or history. Still teaching of Buddhist philosophy did not remain confined to the literate or to the monks, but 'the Buddhist way of life' pervaded the whole society. (Burman 1977: 11)

The role of the monasteries was strong and bureaucratic and being 'advocates of the self-estate economic system' it was conservative. The monasteries can therefore be seen as playing a major role in thwarting progress for adapting to changes in the twentieth century. (Goldstein 1989: 37)

Key issues

- Novices or monks did not generally have to pass exams in order to remain in the monastery, although there were exams of higher philosophical degrees within the monasterial ranks. (Goldstein 1989)
- The Tibetan Buddhist doctoral exam is conducted in the form of a rationale debate on Buddhist philosophy with the use of the discursive mind to investigate valid sources of knowledge based on logic statements. The main teachings for novice monks are to memorize texts. Memorization of texts is used in the Tibetan Buddhist philosophical debate where the language used is a rather technical, artificial form of Tibetan (Perdue 1976)
- In the Tibetan Buddhist philosophical debate the monks learn the trilogy of hearing the teaching of the doctrine, thinking about its meaning, and meditating on it. One reads the texts, memorizes the definitions and divisions, and thinks about the meaning of what one is studying. One puts forth one's own view or understanding and raises objections to that view. Similarly, one raises objections to others' interpretations or understanding. (Perdue 1976)

EDUCATIONAL POLICIES IN CHINA

In order to understand the present conditions for schooling in Tibet, it is necessary to be aware of the background for the present Chinese policies in this area, i.e. to view education in Tibet within the framework of education in China as a whole.

China is often identified as a society of collectivism and this contributed to the extreme collectivism during the Cultural Revolution (1966–1976). China is also known for its traditional values of education. Scholarship has always been something treasured by society and has contributed to the rapid expansion of education in the two decades of reform after the Cultural Revolution. However, it is exactly that reform that has given rise to a growth in individualism and to education having an economic dimension. Both developments have gradually eroded the traditional culture of education. (Cheng 2001: 242)

Transmitting moral values, the teacher was also to be a moral example to his students, and his person thus became the natural centre of the teaching situation. He conveyed moral principles recorded in texts, which had reached the status of irrefutable dogmas. The most prevalent learning method thus became the word-by-word memorization of these texts. This type of instruction continues to dominate Chinese classrooms. (Thøgersen 1990: 19)

The school system in China has very distinct origins. Before public schools were established, education was limited to private tuition. Education was considered the means, and the only means, to achieve mobility in the hierarchy. Cheng outlines some important historical features:

- In ancient China, joining officialdom was the only path of upward social mobility. All that mattered in the system was the examination. There was a simple curriculum: the *Four Books* and the *Five Classics*. The examination system was simply on the interpretation of the classical writings in the context of government.
- It was a low-cost system, and was affordable by any family. It was a highly individualized endeavour and schools were never a necessity.
- It was an open system, as everyone was allowed to take the examination. It therefore enjoyed high legitimacy as a fair system for social mobility. It was, nonetheless, a tight system. It was rigorous and strict.
- In traditional Chinese society, a child's life was governed by the honour of the family, and the child's success in examinations was symbolic of the family glories. Social mobility was almost the only aim of 'education'.
- Examination success was not a matter of right or wrong. Rather, it was how the interpretation of the classics met with the approval and appreciation of the examiner, sometimes the emperor. There was therefore a subtle expectation of conforming to authority.

- The examination trained respect for authority rather than objectivity. It trained political sensitivity rather than analytic capacity. It was open to all, and was indeed seen as fair to all, although in the final analysis, success belonged to the few. It was on a competitive basis. There was no guaranteed success for hard work. (Cheng 2001: 244–245)

CONTEMPORARY OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS ON EDUCATION IN CHINA

This section presents official publications by the ‘People’s Republic of China’ on policies and plans in education, as well as a western response to these – with special reference to minority education policy. Note that statistics does not include soldiers from the PLA (People’s Liberation Army) based in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR).

China’s Law on Regional Autonomy was passed in 1984. Since the promulgation of the ‘Education Law of the People’s Republic of China’ (PRC) (the Third Session of the Eight National Peoples Congress 1995), the ‘Regulations for Ethnic Minority Education’ have been entered into the state’s ‘Plan for the Principal Complementary Laws for the Education Law’, which will be promulgated and implemented by the State Council. (Chen Lipeng 1999: 7)

To guarantee the people’s right to receive education is in accordance with the law, the autonomous region promulgated for implementation the Measures of Compulsory Education in the TAR region in 1994. The investment in education within the local budget totalled 1.03 billion yuan from 1990 to 1995. The teaching and administrative staff have reached 22,279, among whom 19,276 are full-time teachers, and the teachers of ethnic minorities, with most being Tibetans, account for over 80 per cent. According to statistics, Tibet now boasts 820 primary schools, 101 middle schools and 3,033 teaching centers with a total enrolment of 354,644 in primary and middle schools, including 34,756 junior middle school students and 9,451 senior middle schools students within the region itself. The enrolment ratio of school-age children has reached 83.4 per cent. (Chinese Government White Paper, *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000: 10).

One of the striking contradictions in the Chinese educational system is the fact that it preaches the constitutional equality of *minzu* (ethnic groups) while impressing on minority students immense feelings of cultural inferiority. Education is praised by the government, educators, many intellectuals, and researchers in China as a means of

‘improving backward habits’ or civilizing the ‘backward’, and therefore it is maybe not so surprising that the form and content of this education often contradicts the outspoken message of national equality. (Hansen 1999: 4)

Over thousands of years, monastic education had produced generation upon generation of brilliant scholars and highly prestigious monks in Tibet. However, some scholars continually dispute this fact. [...] Professor Ran Guangrong has continually argued to Chinese scholars, officials, and students that Tibetan monasteries have no educational function, but rather represent a backward religious tradition that has made people appear foolish in public conferences and classes. [...] Tibetan monastic education is a culturally different educational system and, though it runs counter to some scholars’ ideas about education, it still has its value if education is viewed in a more holistic perspective to include cultural transmission and development. (Badeng Nima 2001: 92)

The Chinese authorities stated in their 10th Five-Year Plan (2001–2005) for the TAR that teachers should be recruited from China in order to develop education in the region: ‘We must put existing qualified personnel to good use and actively recruit from outside [the TAR] the qualified personnel we urgently need.’ The same report said:

Outstanding personnel must be attracted to join the teaching profession. At the same time, we must rely on institutions of higher education in the interior to establish training bases for senior-level teaching staff for Tibet in order to speed up the buildup of a teaching corps for Tibet.

TIN writes:

Tibetan language policy has been one of the most important issues in education in the TAR since the Chinese authorities gained control of the region in 1949-50 and particularly since the temporary period of liberalisation in the early 1980s. Since the first constitution of the People’s Republic of China, China’s nationalities have had, in principle, the right to use their own languages in administration and education. In education, the option for ‘minority’ nationalities to provide teaching in their own languages became part of the 1995 Education Law. Article 12 of the law states that ‘schools and other educational institutions primarily for “minority” nationalities may use the spoken or written language in common use among the ethnic group or in the locality as the language of instruction’ (Xinhua, reporting on the Education Law, 20 March 1995). Retrieved from TIN 27-11-2001.

The Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Finance aimed to promote compulsory education in Tibet by investing 3.9 billion yuan through the 'Hope Project' between 1995 and 2000. (Chinese Government White Paper, *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000: 23)

In 1992, the 'Hope Project' was established in the TAR to help return drop-outs to school. By 1994, 300,000 people (almost 15 per cent of the population of the TAR) were said to have contributed to the Tibetan branch of the 'Hope Project' (Bass 1998: 128)

What is interesting about the Hope project in the TAR is that it acknowledges the failure for rural areas of the quality-oriented 'consolidation' policies of the 1980s. It recognises that the closure of a large number of rural primary schools instead of increasing efficiency led directly to low enrolment and high drop-out. (Ibid.: 80)

It appears that the education strategies of the current phase – that is the combination of the policies made in the interest of rapid economic development and the rejection of preferential policies for Tibetans in enrolment and teaching medium – are leading education development to an impasse. There is a real danger that the continuation of these policies will hinder the participation of the Tibetan community in the future economic development of the Tibet Autonomous Region. (Bass 1999: 25)

Through the state educational system, the Chinese government transmits its ideology of the nation and of the relationships among the peoples in China who have become categorized into static ethnic groups. Education of minorities plays a central role in implicitly reproducing notions of cultural inequalities while explicitly promoting the 'unity of the *minzu*'. [...] The classroom is an arena where processes of ethnic identification become highly relevant when minority students inevitably are confronted with the government's monopolizing interpretation of their identity. [...] A study of the impact of Chinese minority education on ethnic minorities' ethnic self-perceptions and identities has to take into account the fact that most non-Han students experience that their language, history, religion, and customs are considered useless (or less significant) knowledge in the Chinese school system. [...] Students learn that almost all of the minority *minzu* were more 'backward' in terms of economy and culture than the majority Han at the time of Liberation. [...] Chinese education fosters in many students a perception of themselves as members of a 'backward minority' simply because it denies the usefulness (sometimes even the existence) of the

minorities' own language, histories, religions, form of education, customs, marriage practices, values, and so forth. (Hansen 1999: 159–160)

Hansen concludes that 'evidence demonstrates that belief in the Chinese state education system's ability to control ethnic identity is not justified', and that it can be argued that the education system may not have the ability to make minorities identify with the state and assimilate them into Chinese society. The way this policy is implemented today may in fact risk producing the opposite effect, 'an increased emphasis on ethnic identity and cultural differences' (Hansen 1999: 168–169)

The State will invest more than 30 billion yuan (US\$3.6 billion) during the 10th Five-Year Plan period 2001–2005, to increase the accessibility of basic education throughout the country, sources from the Ministry of Education said, according to today's China Daily. The investment is much larger than the 5 billion yuan (US\$602 million) set aside during the Ninth Five-Year Plan period 1996–2000, said Li Lianning, director of the ministry's Department of Basic Education. The money will be used to widen the nine-year compulsory education programmes and improve educational facilities throughout China. The nine-year compulsory education programme covers six years of primary school education and three years of middle school education. [...] Efforts will be particularly focused on the country's central and western areas, where educational conditions are inadequate, Li Lianning (Ministry of Education) added. Educational departments in more developed eastern areas will be mobilized to help the central and western areas advance education by donating money and teaching instruments, and sending teaching staff to these areas through a rotation system, according to the ministry. (Xinhuanet 4–9–2001).
Extracted from <http://www.edu.cn/20010904/3000223.shtml>

FLOATING POPULATION

According to the 1990 Population Census and the 1992 *China Population Statistics Yearbook* the total population in the TAR was 2,196,029, of which 2,096,718 were Tibetan and 80,837 (3.7%) Chinese. Total population in Lhasa Municipality was 375,968, of which Tibetans accounted for 327,882 and Chinese 44,945 (12.0%), with 29% in Lhasa inner city. (*China Population Statistics Yearbooks*, 1992).
See <http://www.tibetinfo.net/tibet-file/stats.htm>

In 2000, Chinese official sources said that the total population in the TAR was 2,620,000 of which 160,000 (6.1 %) were Chinese. (Cf. China Population Statistics Yearbook 2001)

Throughout the PRC there is an enormous floating population in search for employment or economic opportunity. [...] increased population flow has already led to an enormous increase in the population of Lhasa. Eleven years ago, Lhasa Radio reported that 'the mobile population entering Tibet' had increased and 'according to incomplete statistics' now numbered '30,000 to 40,000' in Lhasa. (SWB 21 March 1989)

Around the same time, Ngapo Ngawang Jigme, Tibetan vice chairman of the Standing Committee of the People's Congress, referred to a total of 'at least 100,000 in Lhasa alone', comprising 'labourers, including peddlers and hawkers' (*People's Daily*, 22 March 1989). The transients referred to were both Tibetans and Chinese. (TIN 2001: 104)

The population of the Tibetan capital of Lhasa has increased seven-fold since 1959, the year the Dalai Lama fled to India, the official Chinese news agency Xinhua said Tuesday. Lhasa has grown from a small town of no more than 30,000 people in the 1950s to a city of some 200,000 people. The urban district has expanded from three square kilometres to 51 (1.2 square miles to 20.4 square miles), and the urban population has increased to 200,000, almost seven times the 1959 figure, Xinhua quoted Lhasa mayor Qjangba Punco as saying. The report did not detail the proportion of Tibetans, which is fast shrinking with the arrival of tens of thousands of Han Chinese settlers sent to Tibet in recent decades. Official figures fail to mention Chinese troop numbers and migrants in Tibet. According to some estimates, Lhasa has about 200,000 migrants from neighbouring Sichuan province in southwestern China. (AFP Beijing 23-02-1999 in WTN 25-2-99)

According to proposals outlined in the Party's Tenth Five-Year Plan (2001-2005), the population of Lhasa's urban area will have more than doubled in the 15-year period ending in 2005. The Lhasa urban area, which was no more than three square km with a population of 20,000-30,000 in 1959, reached 53 square km and a population of 230,000 last year, according to official statistics. Meanwhile, the total population of the Lhasa city (county level), which covers 523 square km, has risen to 470,000. The Five-Year Plan states that the short term goal is to expand the urban area to 70 square km by the end of 2005 and to increase the urban population from 230,000 to 'over 300,000'

(Beijing China Internet Information Centre, 4 June 2001). [...] Reports from Tibet indicate that the current population of Lhasa is at least 70 per cent Chinese. (TIN 2002: 30)

Half the population of Lhasa are now immigrants from elsewhere in China, a senior Chinese official conceded today, in comments likely to increase concerns among rights activists who say Tibet's unique culture is being swamped. There are currently 200,000 inhabitants in Lhasa, and half are Tibetans, said Jin Shixun, vice president of the Commission for Planning and Development in Tibet. He was speaking in the Tibetan capital at the start of a rare visit by foreign reporters to the Himalayan region, usually strictly off-limits to overseas media. The massive influx of non-Tibetans into the city, the centre of Tibet's Buddhist culture and all-but closed to foreigners for centuries, is obvious on its streets, where nowadays more signs are in Chinese than the native script. The majority of shops also appear to be run by Chinese who have moved from all corners of the country. (AFP, Lhasa, August 7, 2002. Retrieved from WTN 9-8-2002)

By the middle of 2000 clearer plans and strategies were emerging for the implementation of the Western Development campaign in TAR. Perhaps the most significant development was the announcement that construction of a railway to Lhasa, a Chinese ambition since the 1950s, is now set to commence in the Tenth Five-Year Plan period. This could prove to be one of the most profound and irreversible threats to the identity, culture and livelihood of Tibetans living in the region. The railway, running along a proposed route through Qinghai province (incorporating the traditional Tibetan area of Amdo), will create much greater opportunities for mineral and natural resource exploitation and increased migration into Tibetan areas. In July, China finally rejected new World Bank conditions and withdrew its request for Bank funding for a project in Dulan County (part of China Western Poverty Reduction Project). The project was designed to resettle 57,775 farmers mostly of non-Tibetan origin in Dulan county, in Tsonub (Ch: Haixi) Mongolian and Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Qinghai. (TIN 2001: 7-8)

According to TIN records policies and official statement have encouraged the migration of skilled – and unskilled – Chinese workers to the west. The TIN report therefore concludes that 'in the Tibetan areas, the prospect of gradual cultural and economic assimilation is steadily approaching'. (TIN 2001: 8)

Postiglione writes:

Tibet still (1997) remains far below the rest of China on indicators of school provisions. This is happening despite the fact that the proportion of the TAR budget allocated to education is said to be approaching 20 per cent (higher than elsewhere in China). It is no coincidence that the budget increase has coincided with increased Han Chinese immigration to the region. Moreover, the sensitivity of the TAR means that because fewer international development agency projects are permitted than in other poor provinces, the government has to make up the difference. Finally, the TAR government also supports a portion (one-quarter in Beijing) of the cost of the many Tibetan high schools in China. (Postiglione 1997: 4)

Key issues in educational policies in China and Tibet

- It happens that graduate students are unable to find adequate jobs and instead are assigned jobs in various government departments and in state-owned enterprises. Undoubtedly, all the students were given jobs based on their relationship to officials in the government; those with good relations with higher officials may have been awarded a good seat. (Badeng Nima 2001: 99)
- High social prestige, emphasis on moral instruction, teacher-centered education methods and rote learning are all key characteristics of traditional Chinese education still relevant for a discussion of the distinct features of Chinese education today. (Thøgersen 1990: 19)
- Any statistics on Lhasa should be seen in the light that ‘the floating population’ does not register for the first three years of residence. (TIN 2001: 103–4)
- As the market economy leads more Han population floating into ethnic minority regions, the chances of cultural misunderstanding will grow unless schools do more to foster a sensitivity to minority cultures. (Postiglione 1999a: 17)
- Religion and language are the two key issues of ethnic minority policy in China. When it comes to education, however, the message about religion is clear – it shall have no place in state schooling. Yet language is a different matter. As well as being a part of culture, it is also the medium for the communication of culture. (Postiglione 2001: 3)
- Since Tibetan monasteries were seen by the Chinese government as one of the greatest obstacles to modernization, as well as being the bastion of ‘feudal power’, education had to be shifted to secular educational establishments of which there were very few. (Bass 1998: 12).

**SELECTED REFERENCES, EDUCATIONAL POLICIES
IN CHINA AND TIBET**

- Badeng Nima (2001). 'Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from Chinese [Guan yu xizang de shuangyu jiaoyu wenti].
- Bass, Catriona (1998). *Education in Tibet: Policy and Practice since 1950*. Tibet Information Network & Zed Books, London & New York. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/education.htm>
- (1999). 'Shifting Priorities'. *China Review*. Autumn/Winter, 1999, vol. 14, pp. 23–25.
- CERNET (China Education and Research Network), <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/index.shtml>
- Chen Lipeng (1999). On the 'Law on Ethnic Minority Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. September–October, vol. 32, no. 5, pp. 7–19. First published in Chinese [Lun shaoshu minzu jiaoyu fa] in *Minzu jiaoyu yanjiu* [Studies on ethnic education], 1997, no. 3, pp. 20–24.
- Cheng, Kai-ming (1999). *Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century*' (synopsis) (People's Republic of China). Proposed by Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998. Endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm
- (2001). 'Changing cultures and schools in the People's Republic of China: tradition, the market and educational change'. In Jo Cairns, Denis Lawton and Roy Gardner (eds), *World Yearbook of Education 2001. Values, Culture and Education*, pp. 242–257. Kogan Page, London.
- China Tibet Information Center (The State Council Information Office). Documents and Figures from Official Resources <http://www.tibetinfo.com.cn/tibetz-en/whitebook/> <http://www.tibetinfo.com/english/>

Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education. 1999, September–October, vol. 32, no. 5.

Chinese Education and Society. New Rules of the Game in Education in the People's Republic of China. Education Laws and Regulations. 1999, May–June, vol. 32, no. 3.

Chinese Government, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China <http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng>
Papers on Education, <http://www.china.org.cn/english/shuzi-en/en-shuzi/index.htm>

Chinese Government White Papers, <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white>

- *The Development of Tibetan Culture.* Beijing, June 2000.
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/2/index.htm>
- *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China.* Beijing, June 2000.
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/4/index.htm>
- *New Progress in Human Rights in the Tibet Autonomous Region.* Beijing, February 1998.
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/last/index.htm>
- *Progress in China's Human Rights Cause in 2000.* Beijing, April 2001.
<http://www.china.org.cn/ewhite/2000renquan/index.htm>
- *The Situation of Children in China.* Beijing, April 1996.
<http://test.china.org.cn/e-white/children/index.htm>
- *Tibet's March Toward Modernization.* Beijing, November 2001.
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/20011108/index.htm>
- *Tibet – Its Ownership and Human Rights Situation.* Beijing, September 1992. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/tibet/index.htm>

Chinese Laws: Internet Guide for China Studies,
<http://sun.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/igcs/index.html> or
<http://www.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/library/> or
<http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng>

CPC Central Committee. Proposal for Formulating China's 10th Five-Year Plan (2001–2005), <http://www.china.org.cn/e-15/15-3-g/15-3-g-2.htm>

- Clarke, Graham (1992). 'Research Design in the Use of China's Census and Survey Data for Rural Areas and Households'. In E.B. Vermeer (ed.). *From Peasant to Entrepreneur: Growth and Change in Rural China*, pp. 217–240. Wageningen, Pudoc.
- (1994). 'The Movement of Population to the West of China: Tibet and Qinghai'. In Judith M. Brown and Rosemary Foot (eds) *Migration: The Asian Experience*, pp. 221–257. St. Martin's Press, Oxford.
- Dhondup, K. (1984). 'The Thirteenth Dalai Lama's Experiment in Modern Education'. *The Tibet Journal*. Vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 38–59.
- Dorjee, Tashi (1977). 'Education in Tibet'. *The Tibet Journal*. Vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 31–37.
- Goldstein, Melvyn C. (1989). *A History of Modern Tibet, 1913–1951. The Demise of the Lamaist State*. University of California Press, Berkeley.
- Hansen, Mette Halskov (1999). *Lessons in Being Chinese. Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.
- International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet (the present Tibet Justice Center) (2001), *A Generation in Peril: The Lives of Tibetan Children under Chinese Rule*, <http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>
- Johnson, Bonnie and Nalini Chhetri (2000). 'Exclusionary Policies and Practices in Chinese Minority Education: The Case of Tibetan Education'. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*. On-line Journal from Teachers College, Columbia University. Vol. 2, no. 2. <http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/articles/bjnc122.htm>
- Perdue, Daniel (1976). *Introductory Debate in Tibetan Buddhism*. Buddhist Studies Program, University of Virginia. Library of Tibetan Works & Archives, Dharamsala, India.
- Postiglione, Gerard A. (1997). 'Editor's Introduction'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30, no. 4, pp. 3–6.
- (ed.) (1999b). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London.

- (2001). 'Editor's Introduction'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 3–6.
- RITNE. (Research Institute for Tibetan Nationality Education) (1997). 'The Light of Hope on the Roof of the World: A Brief Account of Thirty Years of Tibetan Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30, no. 4, pp. 21–38.
- Rosen, Stanley (1987). 'Restoring Key Secondary Schools in Post-Mao China: The Politics of Competition and Educational Quality'. In David M. Lampton (ed.) *Policy Implementation in Post-Mao China*, pp. 321–353. University of California Press, Berkeley.
- Thøgersen, Stig (2002). *A Country of Culture. Twentieth-Century China Seen from the Village Schools of Zouping, Shandong*. Michigan University Press, Michigan.
- Thøgersen, Stig (1990). *Secondary education in China after Mao: Reform and Social Conflict*. Aarhus University Press, Aarhus.
- Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (TCHRD) (1997). *The Next Generation: The State of Education in Tibet Today*. Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala.
<http://www.tchrd.org/pubs/index.html>
- TIN (Tibet Information Network), <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
- (2001). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29. 2000*. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- (2002). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 30, 2001*. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra30.htm>
- Tsering W. Shakya (1994). 'Politicisation and the Tibetan Language'. In Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner (eds), *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*, pp. 157–165. Hurst & Company, London.
- Wang, Chengzhi (2001). *Governance and financing of basic education in China*. PhD dissertation, AAT 3023226.
<http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/3023226>

WNC (Worlds News Connection). Tibet government work reports 1st January and 1st July, (WNC requires subscription) <http://wnc.fedworld.gov/cgi-bin/pincmd.cgi>

WTN (World Tibet News), <http://www.tibet.ca>

Chapter 2

Teaching and Curriculum

A STANDARDIZED CURRICULUM RELATED TO THE TIBETAN CULTURE

The anthropologist Janet Upton has researched on the content of the junior- and secondary-level textbooks for the course on Tibetan language and literature (Tib. *Skad-Yig*, Chin. *Yuwen*) in Tibetan medium schools in the PRC. She points to the importance of examining Tibetan-language textbooks within the particular cultural framework in which they have been developed and are being employed. She finds that the content of the textbooks are derived from three primary sources: translation from Chinese (24 per cent), modern and contemporary Tibetan-language writings (47 per cent), and traditional Tibetan literature (29 per cent). Some texts are translated from modern Russian literature, some Chinese-language texts are to an extent weighted with political messages, and some of the classical Tibetan texts are secularized with selective editing and omissions of the original religious content. Upton concludes that 'the held assumption that the current Tibetan-language curriculum in the PRC is virtually devoid of Tibetan literary and cultural content is in fact quite misleading'. She finds that 'a great deal of material is also drawn from historical and contemporary Tibetan-language sources' and by using the writings of modern and contemporary authors as models, 'students are encouraged to be active producers of literature and not being passive consumers'. (Upton 1998)

Upton found that Tibetan teachers in the Aba Tibetan and Qiang Autonomous Prefecture of Sichuan have the opinion that Tibetan culture can be modernized only through the expansion of Tibetan language educational effort and the development of a greater degree of Tibetan literacy. Upton points to how a process of identification is contingent upon the historical, cultural, political, and economic circumstances in which it emerges. A notion of a unified Tibetan identity is both promoted and reinforced in educational circles, not only by Tibetan educators, but also by a nationally approved, standardized Tibetan-language curriculum. (Upton 1996: 116, 119)

The government has established the special Tibetan Language Work Guidance Committee and editing and translation organs so as to promote the study, use and development of the Tibetan language. The Tibetan language is a major course of study for schools at all levels in Tibet. Tibetan textbooks and reference materials have been compiled, translated and published for all courses at all levels of schools from primary to senior high. Tibet University has compiled 19 varieties of teaching materials in the Tibetan language, which have already been used on a trial basis. (Chinese Government White Paper. *Tibet's March Toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001: 9)

However, this policy has recently been changed (cf. the section of language policies and legal rights regarding minority education, p. 22).

The Chinese state has gone to great lengths to accommodate minority languages. Minority language textbooks and teaching materials are available, more so than in the United States. Nevertheless, success in bilingual and literacy education for minorities will be shaped to a large extent by the politics of ethnic identity. (Postiglione 1999a: 10)

Based on research at the local Tibetan school in Songpan County, Sichuan, Upton observes that as to the interconnectedness between the standardized curriculum and a feeling of Tibetan identity, the school textbooks in use do contain a fair amount of material drawn from Tibetan sources and are relevant to Tibetan cultural life in a broad sense. Nevertheless, the view of Tibetan history that is presented in the formal curriculum under the current political and cultural regime is far removed from the 'real history' that so many Tibetans at home and abroad currently crave. These lessons nonetheless play an important role in establishing a sense of a unified Tibetan culture and identity among young Tibetans, for they represent the new 'cultural capital' that educated youth are being encouraged to acquire. Upton notes that some of the most forceful lessons about the value of Tibetan culture can be taught to students through lessons that derive from works that are historically and culturally distant. (Upton 1999: 306–310)

The content of the curriculum should be based on the needs of the Tibetan society and the curricular plan chosen from central China is too general for Tibetan students; some subjects should be omitted and others added. (Cf. Badeng 2001: 101, Zhou et al.2001: 25)

National minorities, whether in socialist or capitalist societies, have their own unique configuration of value orientation with which they face the challenges that threaten their very existence. Because edu-

cation makes possible the reproduction of those essential value orientations, it becomes central in determining the manner in which ethnic groups and national minorities integrate themselves into the larger societies. [...] Cultural autonomy extends to many areas. Within education, [policy on school curriculum calls for them to be brought more in line with the realities of national minority life and culture. Among the most important indices of cultural autonomy among national minority groups are religion and language. (Postiglione 1992: 327)

Kolås and Thowsen found that private schools (Qinghai) have in many cases been particularly successful in managing to obtain funding from foreign NGOs, and some schools have attracted foreign teachers to teach English. But even having received funding from abroad, the curriculum in private schools is still controlled by the local education department at the prefecture, county and village district level. (Kolås and Thowsen forthcoming)

School curricula that more accurately reflect the cultural diversity that characterizes China's ethnic minorities might not only increase understanding among ethnic groups and conserve their cultures within the process of economic modernization, but also make state schools much more attractive to ethnic communities, thereby strengthening their identities within the national community. (Postiglione 1999a: 17)

Key issues, standardized curriculum related to the Tibetan culture

- For most ethnic minorities in China, school education is entirely based upon Chinese language and history. It leaves no room for the transmission of cultural values that might contradict the state's interpretation of nationalism, atheism, and the common interest of multiethnic China. (Hansen 1999: xiii)
- If the construction of a unified sense of Tibetan identity is an implicit (and possibly somewhat subversive) goal of the Tibetan-language curriculum, an infinitely more explicit goal is the construction of a sense of unity with the Chinese nation. (Upton 1999: 309)
- The cultural bias in the curriculum creates problems for the learning process, not just on historical events in Tibet, but also when students read about traffic lights, etc., as some children in the rural areas have never seen such a thing. (Hansen 1999)
- A problem in rural Tibet is that policy or curriculum developments at the top do not necessarily trickle down to classrooms in outlying areas. Also, in the quota system, literacy is too narrowly measured by

proficiency in a test that is very closely linked to the curriculum. (Young 2001a: 9)

- Cultural homogenization is not necessarily achieved by insisting upon a strictly standardized education that leaves no room for cultural values and practices that are not officially promoted by the government. (Hansen 1999: 169)
- The content of certain chapters in the standard curriculum lends itself directly to the discussion of the commonalities of Tibetan experience, thereby further establishing a sense of connectedness to other Tibetans who may live in distant places, speak different dialects and belong to different religious sects. (Upton 1999: 308)

BILINGUAL TEACHING

Upton tells that in accordance with directives and stipulations of the state Education Commission, a school in Songpan includes the following 14 subjects in the curriculum on junior-high level: Tibetan language and literature, Chinese language and literature, English language, history, geography, mathematics, physics, chemistry, biology, politics and ideology, music, physical education, art and physical labour. The school has also added a course in conversational English to its curriculum, and has taken two approaches to trilingual education: 'Take Tibetan as the focus, learn Chinese well, and add some English, or take Chinese as the focus, learn Tibetan well and add some English.' The experience of the school is that this 'two-tiered' system tackles best the problems caused by the lack of Tibetan-language education at the elementary level. School officials report that most of the students from schools where Tibetan has been the medium of instruction drop out of school, and that 'a large number of students graduated from elementary schools with Chinese as a medium of instruction wish to continue their education in a Tibetan-language environment'. (Upton 1999: 304-305)

Since the terms 'bilingualism' and 'bilingual education' first appeared in Chinese educational policy discussions in the early 1980s, there have been a series of attempt to categorize the varieties of bilingual education systems and plans that exist in China. (Stites 1999: 106)

Zhou stresses that 'while a 'maintenance program' and a 'transitional program' do not appear incompatible in theory, western scholars tend to see them as mutually exclusive in practice. Zhou proposes a categorization of bilingual teaching plans:

- a) *Maintenance type* – is basically aimed at preserving and cultivating a child's knowledge of his or her mother tongue. The defining feature is the use of the mother tongue throughout the course of elementary and/or secondary schooling.
- b) *Transitional type* – is aimed at developing competence in the dominant group language. It is designed to provide a bridge between the language of the home and that of the school, and to facilitate the transition from institution in the minority language to instruction in Chinese. Understood in a way that the minority language is to be used as the principal medium of instruction in the first two years of elementary school, for both Chinese and the minority language to be used in grade three and four, and then for Chinese to be the principal language of instruction in the final two years of elementary school.
- c) *Expedient type* – this form of instruction violates the constitutional guarantee of the right of nationalities to use their own language. The minority language is taught only for a short period of time in the final year of elementary school. Reasons for this practice could be the scarcity of minority language teachers, the (incorrect) assumption that non-Han-speaking students' 'souls' receive maximum exposure to *Putonghua* during elementary school, and the strategic consideration of the need to improve student test scores on the secondary school entrance examination where the minority language accounts for only 30 per cent of the total score. (Zhou 1991, quoted in Stites 1999: 106–110)

Upton found that most Tibetans are interested in learning Chinese. An increasing number of Tibetans want to learn Chinese fluently due to day-to-day survival, and also because literacy in Chinese provides an access to broader occupational opportunities. Both Han students and Tibetans are interested in learning English. (Upton 1999)

True bilingual education (not merely one or two hours per week of voluntary extra teaching in the minority language) is one of the methods that might increase students' acceptance of the value of their own language. However, this effect is often neutralized when the mother tongue, the minority language, is realized to be worthless for continued education. The possibility of continuing on to secondary and higher education is completely dependent on the student's level of Chinese, not on her ability to speak or write a minority language. (Hansen 1999: 160)

Tibet University, the leading educational institution in Tibet Autonomous Region, has introduced, for the first time, degree examinations on the Tibetan language. The exams, in four degrees, are designed to

test the students on their knowledge of the Tibetan language and will be carried out twice a year, according to a university official. The four-degree scheme has been developed from a previous three-degree one, which was trialed [*sic*] two years ago. Tibet University, with over 5,000 students, has two institutes, eight departments and a department for overseas students. Tibetan language is a compulsory subject for all students. (*People's Daily*, 27–4–2001)

In her book *Lessons in being Chinese*, Hansen argues:

The Chinese government's and most educators' belief in the school as an institution capable of controlling the transformation of minorities' cultural values and eliminating ethnic identities is exaggerated. For most ethnic minorities in China, school education is entirely based upon Chinese language and history. It leaves no room for the transmission of cultural values that might contradict the state's interpretation of nationalism, atheism, and the common interest of multiethnic China. However, by denying the significance of the minorities' own languages, histories, religions, and cultural values, education sometimes strengthens focus on ethnic identity. (Hansen 1999: xiii)

Kolås and Thowsen found that in the provinces with Tibetans outside the TAR, the policy shift on bilingual education has not merely followed that of the TAR itself. Rather, each province has had its own policies and guidelines and there are large variations between the different provinces. One common feature is discernible – the system of two parallel classes within schools for Tibetans: one Chinese medium and the other Tibetan medium. Chinese and Tibetan are taught in both of these classes as 'streams'. The shift from Tibetan to Chinese as a medium of instruction creates difficulties for Tibetan students which native Chinese-speaking students do not experience. Nor is it easy for Tibetan students in bilingual schools to master two very different languages, and use two different scripts in addition to the written Tibetan taught in school, which may vary from their native spoken language. (Kolås and Thowsen, forthcoming)

Tournadre writes that in 1991, official Chinese statistics clearly showed that Tibetan high school students were obtaining better results in scientific subjects when they were taught in their mother tongue. Undeniably, linguistic and educational policies are playing a considerable role in the way in which Tibetans conceive of their language. By excluding Tibetan from the administrative spheres and giving Chinese a predominant position at schools and universities, by offering

only a handful of professionals openings based on a command of Tibetan, the authorities have contributed to giving Tibetan the image of a 'useless' language. (Tournadre 2003)

Key issues in bilingual teaching

- It is more beneficial for students to study in Chinese than in Tibetan. Currently, the prevailing mode of thought is to 'attend school, attain a secure government job, and thereby secure money and power'. This has had a negative influence on Tibetan society. (Badeng Nima 2001: 99)
- Bilingual education for Tibetans is less available in the autonomous prefectures outside the TAR where Tibetans are a minority.
- Tibetans are disadvantaged compared to Chinese students, as their choice of taking Tibetan as a second language excludes them from taking English classes.
- Difficulties of bilingual education are visible in the fact that an alarming number of Tibetans are incapable of reading, and even speaking their own language. A difficulty in learning Tibetan is also due to dialects, and diglossia (the fact that literary and spoken Tibetan are different) that constitute an enormous barrier to the learning and spread of Tibetan language. (Tournadre 2003: 32)
- Bilingual education can also refer to schools where English is taught as a second language. To enter a university in China the candidate needs to have studied English, and it is becoming more common (in Sichuan) to exchange the Tibetan class with an English one. (Kolås and Thowsen, forthcoming)
- A strong emphasis on Tibetan language instruction beyond the elementary level can be comprehended as a support to Tibetan nationalism and therefore viewed as a threat to Chinese national unity.

LANGUAGE POLICIES AND LEGAL RIGHTS REGARDING MINORITY EDUCATION

Almost all of the 55 official minorities in China, accounting for more than 100 million people, have their own language. The Tibetan population accounts for 94 per cent of the total population of the TAR. (Chinese Government White Paper. *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000: 22)

China has 55 ethnic minority groups apart from the Han people, who are in the majority. All major ethnic groups in the country still use the

language of their forebears. Their right and freedom to choose their languages are prescribed in China's Constitution and relevant law on ethnic regional autonomy. In Tibet, the Tibetan language is the only everyday oral and written means of communication for 84 per cent of the 2.4 million ethnic Tibetans. (Xinhuanet 24-5-2002 in WTN 24-5-2002) <http://www.tibet.ca/english/index.html>

The Chinese White paper, *The Development of Tibetan Culture* writes:

The study of the Tibetan language is protected by law. Educational institutions in the TAR universally practise a bilingual educational system whereby teaching is done principally in the Tibetan language. Furthermore, the teaching and reference materials for all the courses from primary school to senior high school have been edited in or translated into the Tibetan language. [...] The government at all levels in Tibet have implemented the provisions on protecting and developing the spoken and written Tibetan language according to law, safeguarding the Tibetan people's right to study their native language, and making the language develop continuously together with the development of politics, economy and culture. [...] In juridical proceedings, the spoken and written Tibetan language is used in trying cases and in the relevant legal documents if the litigant participation are Tibetans. Both the Tibetan and Han Chinese languages are used for all work units, official seals, certificates, forms, stationery, and signs, and signboards of institutions, factories, mines, schools, railway stations, airports, stores and shops, hotels, cinemas, theatres and gymnasiums, street and road signs, and traffic signs. (Chinese Government White Paper. *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000)

Article 37 in the PRC Constitution and the Law on Regional Nationality Autonomy provide:

The organs of self-government of national autonomous areas may set up public primary schools and secondary schools, mainly boarding schools and schools providing subsidies in pastoral areas and economically underdeveloped, sparsely populated mountain areas inhabited by minority nationalities. Schools where most of the students come from minority nationalities should, wherever possible, use textbooks in their own language and use these languages as the media of instruction. Classes for the teaching of Chinese (the Han language) shall be opened for senior grade of primary schools or for secondary school to popularise *Putonghua*, the common speech based on Beijing pronunciation. [...] The provision on setting up schools is expressed

in permissive terms, whereas the provision about introducing Chinese classes in schools is expressed as mandatory. (TIN 2001: 60)

Increase in Chinese medium teaching in Tibetan schools: There have been further indications that Chinese is becoming the main medium of instruction in schools in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) with the use of the Chinese language as a teaching medium being increased in primary schools. The main teaching medium in middle schools is already standard Chinese (*Putonghua*). Reports from Tibet indicate that Chinese is now being used as a teaching medium in a number of primary schools near Lhasa, with plans to increase its use throughout the region. Concerns among Tibetan teachers for the security of their jobs have been reported, as the implementation of these plans is likely to lead to the recruitment of more Chinese nationality teachers. Beijing's Five-Year Plan states that it is important for more teachers to be recruited from China to work in Tibet. Concerns among Tibetan teachers for the security of their jobs have been reported, as the implementation of these plans is likely to lead to the recruitment of more Chinese nationality teachers. Beijing's Five-Year Plan states that it is important for more teachers to be recruited from China to work in Tibet. (TIN 27-11-2001).

<http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/nu271101.htm>

The new changes to education provision in the TAR involve the teaching at primary level of mathematics and Chinese – and English in some schools – through the medium of Chinese. If fully implemented, this would mean that the only subject taught in Tibetan in primary and middle schools would be Tibetan language. This represents a major change, because the majority of primary schools in the TAR currently teach through the Tibetan medium. In 1996, at least 95 per cent of primary schools were said to be Tibetan medium. [...] In a small number of primary schools in the TAR, however, teaching in Chinese has been carried out for some years, partly due to a shortage of Tibetan teachers. [...] The teaching of both Chinese and English at primary level is welcomed by many Tibetans, as this enables them to acquire proficiency in both languages in order for them to be able to compete with their Chinese peers. It also takes into account the economic realities of the situation in the TAR, where most business is conducted in the Chinese language. However, there is still concern among many Tibetans about the impact of such moves on the survival of the Tibetan language, which is regarded as an important element of Tibetan identity and culture. The Chinese authorities stated in their 10th Five-Year Plan for the TAR that teachers should be recruited from China in order to develop education in the region. (Xinhua, 20-3-1996)

Tibetan legislators passed a special law yesterday to encourage the use of the Tibetan language, the first such requirement since the language began to evolve 1,300 years ago. The law, approved at the 15th session of the Seventh Regional People's Congress of the Tibet Autonomous Region, declares that the Tibetan language must have equal emphasis and legal status with the standard Chinese language in the region. According to its 19 articles, pupils must study Tibetan language during their nine years of compulsory education, while standard Chinese is also taught. When assemblies and government meetings are held, or at court, people can choose between using the Tibetan language or standard Chinese. Other ethnic groups and people of Han origin living in Tibet are also required to study Tibetan language. (Xinhuanet 24-5-2002 in WTN 24-5-2002)
<http://www.tibet.ca/english/index.html>

A report issued on 25 January 2003 by the official Chinese news agency Xinhua praises the 'Regulations on the Study, Use and Development of the Tibetan Language' as one of the major achievements of the outgoing 7th People's Congress of the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR). According to the report, the regulations will '*carry out China's strategy of developing its west and conserve local cultures*'. The overall emphasis of the regulations is on the '*equality*' of the Tibetan and '*common national*' (Han Chinese) languages. However, while safeguards and promotional measures for the Tibetan language are included in the regulations, in the absence of measures that in practice favour the use of Tibetan, the position of Chinese, which is already dominant in business, commerce and administration, is likely to be enhanced. (TIN News Update 30-1-2003). <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/2003/3001.htm>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/docs/languageLaw.htm>

A set of regulations on protecting the Tibetan language was adopted by the National People's Congress (NPC) at the seventh sitting of the fifth session on May 22nd 2002. Comprised of 19 articles, these are the first regulations of their kind aiming to protect the language of a 'minority nationality' in the People's Republic of China. It corresponds to the amendment of an earlier draft bill (*tshod lta'i lag bstar gyi khrims*) voted by the NPC at the fourth setting of the fifth session on September 9th 1987. Article one states that 'Tibetan is the common language of the Autonomous Region of Tibet'. 'Tibetan and Chinese have equal administrative status in the Autonomous Region of Tibet' (Art. 3). 'The Chinese and those belonging the other minorities living in the Autonomous Region of Tibet must learn Tibetan' (Art. 8). 'Those

bilingual in Chinese and Tibetan will receive priority in recruitment to administrative positions' (Art. 10). (Tournadre 2003: 30–31)

Tournadre points to the ambiguity and lack of detail and realism in the regulations. He argues that one can have doubts about the implementation, as the regulations are accompanied by no coercive measures or strong incentives to implement them. Moreover, they operate on a purely theoretical level, with no pragmatic dimension. (Ibid.)

Perhaps the largest obstacle [that] the development of Tibetan-language education in Songpan (and in other Tibetan Areas) faces is a practical one: in most areas other than the educational field, there is little demand for individuals literate in the Tibetan language. Though official policy may promote the use of minority languages in the so-called minority autonomous regions, practice is not usually so generous: the language of officialdom remains Chinese, and with the exception of formal translation work there is little opportunity for the use of Tibetan in the public sphere. (Upton 1999: 311)

Upton tells that Tibetan students often enter school with very little understanding of spoken Chinese, yet they are expected to complete an all-Chinese curriculum for at least the first 3 years of their schooling. For the most part, students not only fail to do well in Chinese, but their other subjects also suffer. Those students who begin Tibetan in the fourth grade graduate from elementary school having only completed half of the elementary level Tibetan curriculum. (Upton 1998)

Key issues in language policies regarding minority education

- Language is the medium for the communication of culture. Therefore, the manner in which the state permits ethnic minority languages to be used in school is crucial for the form of ethnicity that schools reproduce. Unlike religion, language is essential for achieving the goals of state schooling. (Postiglione 1999a: 9)
- There is some (Chinese government) resistance to the widespread use of minority languages, because this can be comprehended as encouraging separatism and non-Chinese nationalist feelings.
- The Han Chinese language becomes the main education language and medium of instruction, as there are little scientific materials published in the languages of ethnic groups.
- The Tibetan language is significant for the Tibetan people both historically and at the present time, but it is difficult to tackle prob-

lems of a modern society in the Tibetan language, because the Tibetan language lacks a modern technical vocabulary. (Badeng 2001: 96)

- Outside of language lessons, subject matter instruction in schools for Tibetan students still relies primarily on Han language instruction and texts. (Stites 1999: 19)
- It is likely that present regulations (May 22, 2002) on the Tibetan language will have no significant impact and that only a far-reaching reform introducing a real Tibetan–Chinese bilingualism will be capable of changing the ecolinguistic situation. (Tournadre 2003)

CONCEPTS OF QUALITY EDUCATION

In the following, Bass explains that between 1949 and 1978, educational policy in China swung between two strategies that came to be known as ‘*red and expert*’, ‘*egalitarian*’ and ‘*hierarchical*’, or ‘*quantity*’ and ‘*quality*’. With the end of the Cultural Revolution, the ‘*quality*’ strategy [return of ‘*quality*’ over ‘*quantity*’] under Deng Xiaoping once more took hold in China and has continued up to the present day. (Bass 1998: 41–45)

- a) ‘*Red*’ (communist), ‘*egalitarian*’ or ‘*quantity*’ – rural

Universal education and access to it, an orientation towards basic primary education. The promotion of mass education by Mao Zedong with a strong ideological content. In the 1950s Mao Zedong encouraged the development of community-funded schools known as *minban* (*mangtsuk lobchung* in Tibetan). These schools were to be set up by individual communes or villages and were intended to cater directly to the need of the local community. Mao had expressed a need for a rural-based education system as counter to China’s existing urban-oriented system, which he saw as serving the educational needs only of the elite. (Ibid.: 26–46)

- b) ‘*Expert*’ or elite focus and academic orientation – urban

The promotion of technical, academic education by Liu Shaoqi and Deng Xiaoping in the 1960s. The return to a ‘*quality*’ strategy brought with it the promotion of key schools (*zhongdian xuexiao*). The key schools were designed to concentrate financial and human resources in schools, which already had a well-developed educational infrastructure. The idea was to concentrate the scarce resources in a few key centres where they were capable of producing maximum returns in the shortest time. With the end of the Cultural Revolution, the ‘*quality*’ strategy once more took hold in China and has continued up to the present day. (Ibid.)

A national policy of improving efficiency and quality in education and the economy throughout the 1980s and early 1990s led to a situation where funding and expertise were focused on provinces and regions in China that were deemed to be able to produce the best results. Increasingly, the notion of quality in education came to be associated with examination success and the number of students graduating to higher levels of education. This led, in spite of government directives, to the neglect of education in rural areas, and to the development of an exam-oriented curriculum. (Ibid.: 106)

QUALITY EDUCATION SEEN FROM A CHINESE PERSPECTIVE

The Chinese government defines '*quality education*' in the 'Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century (People's Republic of China)' proposed by the Ministry of Education on December 24, 1998 and endorsed by the State Council, January 13, 1999. The plan aims to enhance quality education and teacher quality, higher education, distance and vocational education, structural reform, educational funding and ideological education.

The action plan is abbreviated in a synopsis by Cheng:

Overall target goals

- For 2000: Universal basic education, 11% enrolment for higher education, preparation of a new infrastructure for the new economy.
- For 2010: Gradual universalization of senior secondary education, 15% enrolment for higher education, establishment of a national system of lifelong learning, a system of knowledge innovation.

'Quality education'

1. At 2000, universalization 9-year compulsory education and the eradication of illiteracy among the young and middle-aged. 'Emphasis of emphasis'. Concentration on poor regions. Enhancement of the inspection system as a vehicle for quality assurance.
2. Implementation of the 'Cross-century Quality Education Project'. Reform in basic education curriculum, standards, teaching, assessments, accompanied by teacher training and educational experiments, to build a new curricular system in 10 years.
3. Enhancement and improvement of moral education.
4. Enhancement of physical and aesthetic education, with articulation between primary, secondary and tertiary education.
5. Improvement of early childhood and special education.

6. Expansion and improvement of education of the ethnic minorities.
7. Further standardization of the national language and improvement of teaching of the national language and the minority languages. (Cheng 1999)

The Chinese government has furthermore proposed a concept of 'Distance Education' with the implementation of 'Modern Distance Education Project':

- To expand the capacity and scale of the network to achieve a comprehensive national information system for education;
- Enhancement of the existing satellite TV system. By 2000, most rural schools should be able to receive education TV;
- Development of high-quality software;
- Drafting a 'Modern Distance Education Development Plan' for nation co-ordination by the Ministry of Education;
- Extending the existing continuing education system to the cyberspace, expanding the Self-study Examination system, thereby increasing the education opportunities for the entire nation. (Ibid.)

In a report from the The Education Commission of the Tibet Autonomous Region (ECTAR), the concept of 'quality education' is defined thus:

Giving instruction in one language or another is only a means of teaching and does not involve the purposes and objectives of education, the contents of teaching materials, or the principles and methods of teaching. [...] Teaching principles should be adhered to, teaching methods should be flexible, teaching management should be tight and orderly, the quality of education – moral, intellectual, physical and aesthetic – should be constantly improved, and strenuous efforts should be made to lift students out of their state of cultural and scientific underdevelopment. (ECTAR 1997: 47)

In June 1999 the State Council declared quality education the guiding policy for all forms of education throughout China. In Zouping, as in the rest of China, many teachers and administrators described the implementation of quality education as countering the excess of too much 'exam-oriented education'. For these educators, exam-oriented education meant teaching and learning for the sole purpose of passing exams. It involves only studying what is to be tested, reliance on memorization, as opposed to analytical reasoning, excessive amounts of homework, drilling and review, and the evaluation of student, teachers, administrators and schools solely in terms of standardized examinations. (Kipnis 2001: 10–11)

Critics to the reform mentioned that significant quality gains could be made not by downplaying exams, but by changing their content and structure:

The criticism of exam-oriented education reverses the logic of the longstanding relationship between exam success and assessments of an individual's quality in post-Mao China. 'Quality' has long been associated with notions of social class, and the slur that a person lacks 'quality' is often directed against 'peasants' or other 'uncultured' people. Although passing university entrance examinations and graduating from university has generally guaranteed that one will not be mocked as 'lacking quality', advocates of quality education argue that students who focus solely on passing examinations in fact become uncreative, not well-rounded, 'low quality' adults. The title of the reform thus involves an inversion of one of the more common uses of the word quality in everyday life. (Ibid.)

Streaming in schools [an examination-oriented education system] is an important part of the 'quality' strategy designed to invest more resources in those students who are likely to produce the best results. It reappeared as a result of the reintroduction of the university entrance examination in 1997. Although urban children have greater access to education than rural children, considerable inequality exists as a result of the streaming system. (Bass 1998: 146)

Thøgersen (2000) discusses the concept of quality education and how the Chinese minister of education, Chen Zhili, expressed her view on the Chinese Nation in the age of globalization:

[...] in a world with rapid technological progress and increasing international competition, the rise and fall of nations will be decided by their ability to foster talented and creative people. [...] The key word for the argument of quality education by the Chinese minister of education, Chen Zhili, is 'creative' because the present exam-oriented system is accused of fostering students who are experts in memorising textbooks, but are unable to come up with new and innovative ideas, and thus also incapable of lifting China into the league of the world's leading nations. [...] The term 'quality education' began to emerge in the Chinese debate after 1988, and in 1993 it was written into the official *Programme for the Development and Reform of Chinese Education* that exam-oriented education should give way to an all-round development of the students which would 'raise the quality of the citizens' [...] and in 1994 Vice Premier Li Lanqing officially authorised 'quality education' as a guiding principle for education reforms. (Thøgersen 2000: 5)

Chinese children are becoming more independent, but their parents and teachers are still unclear what the 'quality education' is meant for. This is disclosed by a one-year survey on the quality of Chinese children's education, which made its results public here Thursday. The survey, carried out by China Children's Center, investigated 42,000 children and their parents in 30 provinces, autonomous regions and municipalities. Quality education is the country's strategy to stress the training of children's comprehensive ability instead of focusing only on their performance in study. The survey shows that most children are sociable, concerned with society and environmental protection, and have practical outlook on life. Their favourite careers are teacher, doctor and scientist. Children are less interested in learning in classes, do little housework and have little play time. Parents and teachers do not understand what quality education looks for. Over half [of the] surveyed parents select 'enter a college or university' as their expectation for their children, followed by 'live a happy life,' and then 'be a useful person to the society and the country'. Many parents put it top priority for their children to strive for higher scores, overlooking training of children's ability of coordination, exchanges and cooperation. Over 32 per cent of the teachers think quality education should be carried out by specially arranged teachers, and have no idea that they should play their own part in the drive. (*People's Daily* 31–8–2001) Retrieved from <http://www.edu.cn/20010831/200893.shtml>

QUALITY EDUCATION SEEN FROM AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

The Western educational theory of the importance on the pedagogical methods of learning for children dates back to the early 1960s when it was realised that children should not learn by copying and memorizing. It was emphasized then that children should rather learn to think constructively, to use their fantasy, personal feelings and will. Already then, the concept of a 'child-centered school' took root within reformed pedagogical and psychological environments in the USA. In the past decade the UN has put particularly strong emphasis on schooling and education. At the World Education Forum in Dakar in 2000 the 'Dakar Framework for Action' was adopted by 164 countries, committing themselves to achieve quality basic education for all by 2015.

The Dakar Framework for Action (*Education for All 2000 Assessment*) (EFA) expresses the international community's collective commitment to pursue a broad-based strategy to ensure that the basic learning needs of every child, youth and adult are met within a generation and sus-

tained thereafter. The Dakar Framework proposes twelve major strategies and sets six major EFA goals:

1. early childhood care;
2. access for all children to school;
3. young and adult learning;
4. improve literacy;
5. eliminate gender disparities;
6. quality of education.

A 'quality education' is defined to satisfy basic learning needs, and to enrich the lives of learners and their overall experience of living. Successful education programme on 'quality education' require:

1. healthy, well-nourished and motivated children;
2. well-trained teachers and active learning techniques;
3. adequate facilities and learning materials;
4. a relevant curriculum that can be taught and learned in a local language and that builds upon the knowledge and experience of the teachers and learners;
5. an environment that not only encourages learning but is welcoming, gender-sensitive, healthy and safe;
6. a clear definition and accurate assessment of learning outcomes, including knowledge, skills, attitudes and, values;
7. participatory governance and management; and
8. respect for and engagement with local communities and cultures.

(UNESCO 2000. Dakar Framework for Action)
[http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/wef_2000/
expanded_com_eng.shtml](http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/wef_2000/expanded_com_eng.shtml)

'The basic right of the child is to have access to enabling and supportive learning environments, which will help children gain both access to other rights and to the knowledge, skills, competencies, attitudes, and values needed for continuing lifelong learning' (UNICEF 2002b). Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>

According to UNICEF, a rights-based, child-friendly school:

1. Reflects and realises the rights of every child – co-operates with other partners to promote and monitor the well-being and rights of all children; defends and protects all children from abuse and harm (as a sanctuary), both inside and outside the school.

2. Sees and understands the whole child, in a broad context – is concerned with what happens to children before they enter the system (e.g., their readiness for school in terms of health and nutritional status, social and linguistic skills), and once they have left the classroom – back in their homes, the community, and the workplace.
3. Is child-centred – encourages participation, creativity, self-esteem, and psycho-social well-being; promotes a structured, child-centred curriculum and teaching–learning methods appropriate to the child’s developmental level, abilities, and learning style; and considers the needs of children over the needs of the other actors in the system.
4. Is gender-sensitive and girl-friendly – promotes parity in the enrolment and achievement of girls and boys; reduces constraints to constraints to gender equity and eliminates gender stereotypes; provides facilities, curricula, and learning processes welcoming to girls.
5. Promotes quality learning outcomes – encourages children to think critically, ask questions, express their opinions – and learn how to learn; helps children master the essential enabling skills of writing, reading, speaking, listening, and mathematics and the general knowledge and skills required for living in the new century – including useful traditional knowledge and the values of peace, democracy, and the acceptance of diversity.
6. Provides education based on the reality of children’s lives – ensures that curricular content responds to the learning needs of individual children as well as to the general objectives of the education system and the local context and traditional knowledge of families and the community.
7. Is flexible and responds to diversity – meets differing circumstances and needs of children (e.g. gender, culture, social class, ability level).
8. Acts to ensure inclusion, respect, and equality of opportunity for all children – does not stereotype, exclude, or discriminate on the basis of difference.
9. Promotes mental and physical health – encourages healthy behaviors and practices and guarantees a hygienic, safe, secure and joyful environment.
10. Provides education that is affordable and accessible – especially to children and families most at-risk.
11. Enhances teacher capacity, moral, commitment, and status – ensures that its teachers have sufficient pre-service training, in-service support and professional development, status, and income.

12. Is family focused – attempts to work with and strengthen families and helps children, parents and teachers establish harmonious, collaborative partnerships.
13. Is community-based – strengthens school governance through a decentralised, community-based approach; encourages parents, local government, community organisations, and other institutions of civil society to participate in the management as well as the financing of education; promotes community partnerships and networks focused on the rights and well-being of children. (UNICEF 2002b: 12–13)
Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>

Characteristics of 'education quality' according to Save the Children:

As well as promoting access to education for all children, efforts need to be made to ensure that education is of good quality and relevant to children's lives. Many children and their families choose not to go to school because they know that poor quality schooling can be worse than useless. Education isn't only about *what* children learn, but *how* they learn. Save the Children believes that education is about much more than training or passing on information: it is about supporting the personal development of the individual. This involves developing a range of personal, social and practical skills as well as building up knowledge, which will help the child face current and future challenges. We promote education, which is:

- responsive to children's needs
- relevant to the local context
- appropriate to the development of the 'whole' child
- participatory

We know from experience that children learn best when they are interested and actively engaged, and for younger children this means learning through play. For learning to be effective, children of all ages need to feel respected and to be allowed to express their opinions freely. Adult attitudes to children are a key factor in a child's education: if they are to teach effectively, adults need to understand how children learn and develop, so appropriate training for teachers and other adults who work with children is a crucial component of our education work. We believe that involving parents, local people and children is an important part of improving education quality – contributing their skills, adapting the curriculum to local needs, running schools, and checking the quality of teaching.

All children have a right to quality education, which helps them to develop their potential, but school systems often marginalize or exclude particular groups such as disabled children, child workers, ethnic minority children and girls. Save the Children promotes an inclusive approach to education, helping education systems, schools and educators to respond to the needs of all children in their society. We also support initiatives that give children from disadvantaged groups access to education that is particularly relevant and useful to them, such as night classes for working children who are unable to go to ordinary schools. Retrieved in June 2002 from <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

Key characteristics for 'education quality' according to Save the Children

- Education isn't only about *what* children learn, but *how* they learn.
- Education is much more than training or passing on information: it is about supporting the personal development of the individual.
- Education is about developing a range of personal, social and practical skills as well as building up knowledge which will help the child face current and future challenges.
- Education should be: responsive to children's needs; relevant to the local context; appropriate to the development of the 'whole child'; participatory.
- Children learn best when they are interested and actively engaged, and for young children this means learning through play.
- Children of all ages need to feel respected and to be allowed to express their opinions freely.
- Adults' attitudes to children are a key factor in a child's education. If they are to teach effectively, adults need to understand how children learn and develop.
- Involving parents, local people and children is an important part of improving education quality – contributing to their skills, adapting the curriculum to local needs, running schools, and checking the quality of teaching. Retrieved in June 2002 from SC(UK), <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

A conceptual framework of learning according to UNICEF

Education needed for the 21st century requires significant changes in the way policy-makers make policies, planners plan systems, teachers teach, communities participate, learners learn – and development agencies function. It requires, most of all, a broadening of thinking and

attention away from an almost exclusive focus on the more formal structure and output orientation of 'schooling' to greater concern for the more broadly defined process of 'learning'.

- That building and supplying more schools (with teachers, new curricula, and texts), while important tasks in themselves, do not automatically lead to more positive learning outcomes.
- That learning takes place not only in schools (in fact, not even mostly in schools) but also in other environments – in families and communities, with peers and through the media.
- That the strengthening of these environments as places where children learn must also be of concern. (UNICEF 2002b). Retrieved in June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>

IMPLICATIONS OF A 'QUALITY EDUCATION' APPROACH IN TIBET

Bass writes that the the drive for '*quality education*' in China prioritizes the following:

- developed provinces over less developed provinces;
- urban education over rural education;
- elite education over mass education;
- higher education over basic education. (Bass 1998: 49)

Central government support for education in the TAR: the 'intellectual aid' scheme

The educational part of this program has had considerable impact on educational development in the TAR over the past seventeen years.

The scheme has three components:

1. Sending selected Tibetan children for secondary education to Central China;
2. Sending teachers from other provinces in China to work in schools and colleges in the TAR on two- to eight-year contracts;
3. The creation of links between certain schools and colleges in the TAR and similar institutions in China in order to improve teaching standards and school management. (Bass 1998: 53)

The '*intellectual aid*' program has a number of implications which are likely to have a negative impact on the long-term success of educational development in the TAR itself, as well as having implications for the development of Tibetan language and culture: It includes costs

for the construction of schools outside the TAR; the program of sending (Chinese) teachers to Tibet leads to a high turnover of staff in schools as Chinese teachers are entitled to extended home leave and some have relatively short-term contracts; and the Chinese teachers do not speak Tibetan, adding to the learning difficulties created for Tibetan students. [...] It now appears that the 'intellectual aid' scheme, which was presented as an interim measure in 1980, has become a permanent feature of educational developments for Tibetans. In 1996, provisions for education set out in the Ninth Five-Year Plan for the TAR indicated that the scheme would be a priority for the future, at least for the next fifteen years. (Ibid.: 54)

In 1994, there were Tibetan classes (*Xizang ban*) at 28 inland universities, and in 1987 Xinjiang classes (*Xinjiang ban*) totalled 450 students at 14 inland universities. (Sautman 1999: 176)

In Tibet, where it is claimed that as of 1995, 96,7 per cent of the population were ethnic minorities, it was decided in 1980 that at least 60 per cent of new entrants to institutions of higher education be from minority groups. (Ibid.: 187)

People's Daily, the official newspaper of the Communist Party, reported on 8 November 2002:

Since the first Tibetan class was set up in an inland school in 1985, more than 20,000 Tibetan students have graduated from such classes offered by more than 20 provinces and cities over the past 17 years. Some 10,000 are university graduates. China's central government has allocated special funds to set up Tibetan middle schools in mainland China. The students are selected after medical examinations and on the basis of their school results. These mainland middle schools are distant from Tibet, and so the students must stay continuously for three years. Some young Tibetans who were chosen from primary school age spent many more years continuously in China. Teng Xin (Tib: Tenzin), a scholar, fully endorses this policy and states that students need to be isolated so that they can learn and not be affected by their fatalistic surroundings [*sic*]. (*People's Daily*, 8–11–2002)

The Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy questions why these elite schools are being provided in mainland China and not where they are most needed, in Tibet:

This 'minorities' education policy of taking the brightest Tibetan students to special schools in China and indoctrinating them in communist ideology and political worldview is part of a series of

systematic schemes to assimilate Tibetans into the Chinese mainstream and blur the distinctness of Tibetan language, customs, culture and history. (TCHRD 2002) <http://www.tchrd.org/>

The Ministry of Education is planning to give special training and support for one million key teachers in China. In the Proposal for Improving Education (Ministry of Education) it is required that the educational level of primary and middle school teachers, where feasible, be brought up to vocational and college level respectively by the year 2010. (*China Education News*, 19–9–2000)

Young looks at how a ‘*child-centred learning*’ programme introduced by Save the Children (SC[UK]) in a rural village school in the Lhasa Valley uses a learning method, which actively engages the children in the learning process.

An attempt to actively engage children in the learning process represents a profound departure from normal Tibetan, and indeed Chinese, teaching methods in rural schools. Children are more usually treated as empty vessels: passive recipients of knowledge that is transmitted only via the teacher and the textbook. Rather questions are designed to make children think, or express an opinion, rather than parrot a ‘right answer’. ‘Quality teaching’ aims to foster ‘critical thinking’ about the environment and related social issues, and to encourage students to become ‘active, environmental citizens’. By using low- or no-cost, locally available, ‘real objects’ as teaching aids is another focus of training. This helps to root formal education in the real, familiar world that the children inhabit. Moreover, it engages all five senses in the learning process – not just the ears and the eyes – reflecting the way that young children learn in the home environment. (Young 2001a: 7–8)

In Tibetan society, the cultural implications of Buddhist ethics and ideology still prevail, namely the ethics of the Buddhist ideological pattern that discourages the ‘ego’. This challenges many of the aims of modern, student-centered pedagogy. A comprehension of keeping discipline by ‘*ngo-tsha*’, the sense of shame and modesty, does not promote student-participation. (Labiessé 1995)

Another cultural aspect in Tibet is the emphasis of maintaining a modest and humble attitude, as it is required in spoken Tibetan. In spoken Tibetan language, one needs to use both an honorific and a common language terminology: the honorific language is used for addressing or commenting on others (superiors) and common language is used when speaking to equals or about oneself. Even high

officials as well as the Dalai Lama would always speak of themselves in the common language.

Cheng (2001) discusses on how the change of the role of the state to individuals is significant, but the state has now become very remote from the individual. Reforms in education, and indeed in society, have increased the sense of the market in education, and hence have developed amongst the students a possibility of choice and thereby the students' former idea that their careers would be arranged by the state had almost totally disappeared. In criteria for students' choice, national needs were hardly ever mentioned, but students revealed that they made their decisions independently, at times even rejecting what their parents or teachers preferred. (Cheng 2001: 254–255)

The change of ideology is apparently a reaction to the extreme collectivism highlighted by the Cultural Revolution, but it is also a deviation from the traditional culture where individuals submit to the will of the family, the community or whatever in the collective. The implications of such a change of ideology are far-reaching. When individuals are expected to make decisions independently of the state, they become experienced decision makers and it is individual decision making that forms the very basis of the democracy that prevails in the international community. (Ibid.: 255)

Key issues in implications of a quality education approach in Tibet

- Examinations in China are mainly focused on how much of the set texts the students remember by heart.
- Minority students receive 'bonus points' when they take exams in Chinese, but this system is a failure and consistently prevents minority students from fully participating in the Chinese educational system.
- Traditional education is delivered in one way, with not enough attention paid to informal education and individual creative thinking.

SELECTED REFERENCES, TEACHING AND CURRICULUM

Baden Nima (1997). 'The Way Out for Tibetan Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30:, no. 4, pp.7–20. First published in Chinese [Zangzu jiaoyu de chulu] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994, no. 3, pp. 44–50.

- Badeng Nima (2001). 'Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from 'Guan yu xizang de shuang-yu jiaoyu wenti'.
- Bass, Catriona (1998). *Education in Tibet: Policy and Practice since 1950*. Tibet Information Network & Zed Books, London & New York. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/education.htm>
- Burman, Beena Roy (1977). 'Cadre Education in Tibet'. *China Report*. Vol. 13: no. 1, pp. 11–15.
- CERNET, China Education and Research Network, <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/index.shtml> Education for Ethnic Minorities, <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/education/ethnicedu/index.shtml>
- Chen Lipeng (1999). On the 'Law on Ethnic Minority Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. September–October, vol. 32: no. 5, pp. 7–19. First published in Chinese [Lun shaoshu minzu jiaoyu fa] in *Minzu jiaoyu yanjiu* [Studies on ethnic education], 1997, no. 3, pp. 20–24.
- Chen Yunpu and Huang Yunbin (1997). 'A Summary of Technical Secondary School Recruitment in 1994'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 94–102. First published in Chinese as [1994 nian zhongzhuan zhaosheng zongshu] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet], 1995: no. 2, pp. 43–46.
- Cheng, Kai-ming (1999) *Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century* (synopsis) (People's Republic of China). Proposed by the Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998 and endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm
- (2001). 'Changing cultures and schools in the People's Republic of China: tradition, the market and educational change'. In Jo Cairns, Denis Lawton and Roy Gardner (eds), *World Yearbook of Education 2001. Values, Culture and Education*, pp. 242–257. Kogan Page, London.

China Education News, September 19, 2000. http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/chinaednews_index_bytopic.htm

Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I). 1997, July–August, vol. 30: no. 4.

— *The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. 1997, September–October, vol. 30: no. 5.

— *Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. 1999, September–October, vol. 32: no. 5, pp. 5–102.

— *Bilingual Education in China*. 2001, March–April, vol. 34: no. 2.

Chinese Government White Papers, <http://test.china.org.cn/e-white/>

- *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/2/index.htm>
- *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000.
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/4/index.htm>
- *Tibet's March Toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/20011108/index.htm>

Clarke, Graham E. (1994). 'The Movement of Population to the West of China: Tibet and Qinghai'. In Judith M. Brown and Rosemary Foot (eds). *Migration: The Asian Experience*, pp. 221–257. St. Martin's Press, Oxford.

CREC, China Education News Archive,
http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/index_old.html

— Education Reform,
http://www.hku.hk/chinaed_news/chinaednews_index_ed_and_reform.html

— Ethnic Minority Education,
http://www.hku.hk/chinaed_news/chinaednews_index_ethnicminorityed.htm

— Wah Ching Centre of Research on Education in China,
<http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/>

ECTAR (Education Commission of the Tibet Autonomous Region and the Leading Group for Tibetan-Language Instruction of the Regional Education Commission) (1997). 'Summary of Pilot Project Work in Middle-School Tibetan-Language Instruction'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 41–48. First published in Chinese [Zhongxue zangyuwen shouke shidian gongzuo zongjie] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet] 1995: no. 5, pp. 3–6.

Goldstein-Kyaga, Katrin (1993). *The Tibetans – School for Survival or Submission: An Investigation of Ethnicity and Education*. HLS Förlag, Stockholm.

Hansen, Mette Halskov (2000). 'Chinese Minority Education: State Policy, International Organizations and Local Responses'. *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 4, pp. 12–16.

— (1999). *Lessons in being Chinese. Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Hayhoe, Ruth (ed.) (1992). *Education and Modernization. The Chinese Experience*. The Comparative and International Education Series. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

ICLT (International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet, now TJC – Tibet Justice Center) (2001). *A Generation in Peril. The Lives of Tibetan Children under Chinese Rule*. A Report by the International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet. <http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>

Johnson, Bonnie and Nalini Chhetri (2000). 'Exclusionary Policies and Practices in Chinese Minority Education: The Case of Tibetan Education'. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*. On-line Journal from Teachers College, Columbia University. Vol. 2: no. 2. <http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/articles/bjnc122.htm>

Kipnis, Andrew (2001). 'The Disturbing Educational Discipline of "Peasants"'. *The China Journal*. July, no. 46, pp. 1–24.

Kolås, Åshild and Monika P. Thowsen (Forthcoming). *On the Margins of Tibet: Cultural Survival on the Sino–Tibetan Frontier*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Labiesse, Christiane (1995). 'The paradox of Tibetan education in exile'. *Tibetan Review*. August, vol. 30: no. 8, pp. 12–13.

Postiglione, Gerard A. (ed.) (1999a). 'Introduction: State Schooling and Ethnicity in China'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London, pp. 3–19.

— (ed.) (1999b). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Sautman, Barry (1999). 'Expanding Access to Higher education for China's National Minorities. Policies of Preferential Admissions'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 173–209. Falmer Press, New York and London.

SC(UK) Save the Children UK. Education programmes and policies. <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

Süttes, Regie (1999). 'Writing Cultural Boundaries: National Minority Language Policy, Literacy Planning, and Bilingual Education'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 95–130. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Thøgersen, Stig (2000). 'The "Quality" of Chinese Education and the New Ideal Student'. *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 4, pp. 4–7.

Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (TCHRD) (2001). *Annual Report 2001*. Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala. <http://www.tchrd.org/pubs/2001/index.html>

— (TCHRD) (1997). *The Next Generation: The State of Education in Tibet Today*. Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala. <http://www.tchrd.org>

TIN (Tibet Information Network) (1998). *News Review. Reports from Tibet*, no. 26. 1997. Education in Tibet. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra26.htm>

- (2001). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29. 2000*. Tibet Information Network, London.
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- (2001a). 'Language and Tibetan Identity'. In *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29, 2000*, pp. 53–66. Tibet Information Network, London.
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- *Tibet Current Affairs Archive. News Updates 1988–1998*. Tibet Information Network, London.
<http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/TibPages/TIN/tin-archive.html>
- Tournadre, Nicolas (2003). 'The Dynamics of Tibetan–Chinese Bilingualism. The current situation and future prospects'. *China Perspectives*. January–February, no. 45, pp. 30–36.
- Tsering W. Shakya (1994). 'Politicisation and the Tibetan Language'. In Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner (eds), *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*, pp. 157–165. Hurst & Company, London.
- UNESCO (2000). *Dakar Framework for Action*, http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/wef_2000/expanded_com_eng.shtml
- (2000a). *Education for All: The Year 2000 Assessment Final Country Report of China*. Chinese National Commission for UNESCO, Beijing.
- (2003). *United Nations Literacy Decade 2003–2012*.
http://portal.unesco.org/education/ev.php?URL_ID=5000&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201&reload=1046196388
- UNICEF (2002a). 'Education Initiatives. Education is a Right' <http://www.unicef.org/programme/education/cfchlist.htm>
- (2002b), *The Global Agenda for Children: Learning for the 21st Century*. A report by Shaeffer, S., A. Dykstra, J. Irvine, M.J. Pigozzi and R.M. Torres. Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>
- Upton, Janet L. (1996). 'Home on the Grasslands? Tradition, Modernity, and the Negotiation of Identity by Tibetan Intellectuals in the PRC'. In Melissa J. Brown (ed.), *Negotiating Ethnicities in China and Taiwan*, pp.

98–124. Institute for East Asian Studies, University of California, Berkeley.

— (1998). 'Beyond the Content of a Curriculum: An Ethnographic Reading of Tibetan–Language Textbooks in the People's Republic of China'. Paper presented at the Eighth Seminar of the International Association of Tibetan Studies Seminar, Indiana University, Bloomington, USA. July 25–31, 1998.

— (1999). 'The Development of Modern School-Based Tibetan Language Education in the PRC'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 281–340. Falmer Press, New York and London.

WTN, World Tibet Network News, News Archive, <http://www.tibet.ca/wtnnews.htm>

Young, Nick (2001a). 'Bringing quality down to the basics'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 7–12.

<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369>

— (2001b) 'Exam system is weakest link in quality chain'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 13–17.

<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371>

Zhou Wei, Zhang Tiedao, Liu Wenpu, Ma Yuqin, and Peng Jiayun (2001). 'Research into Girl's Education in Four Western Provinces of China'. *Chinese Education and Society. Educational Research Selections*. September–October, vol. 34: no. 5, pp. 4–28. First published in *Jiaoyu yanjiu* [Educational research], 1996: no. 1, pp. 34–43.

Zhou Qingsheng (1991) 'Zhongguo shuangyu jiaoyu leixing' (Varieties of bilingual education in China), quoted in Regie Stites, 'Writing Cultural Boundaries: National Minority Language Policy, Literacy Planning, and Bilingual Education'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London, 1999: 95–130.

Chapter 3

Teachers' Education and Training

During the 1990s, further measures were taken by the TAR government to improve teaching quality. These included the introduction of an examination for community school teachers to enable them to qualify as state teachers and the exclusion from further teaching of those who failed the exam after three attempts. [...] One of the particular problems of the teaching system in the TAR is that teachers are taught in Chinese in secondary school and for their teacher training. (Bass 1998: 225)

A revision of the law on 'national minorities' was officially launched at China's National People's Congress on February 2000. The policy plan on 'Development of the Western Regions' appears to strengthen the rights of the state as opposed to the rights of autonomous peoples. The revised law stipulates that 'the organs of autonomy' in autonomous areas will set up 'state-run nationality primary and middle schools' in pastoral and mountainous areas, mainly as boarding schools. The funding for these schools will be the responsibility of the local authorities. The revised law also suggests that more qualified teachers should be 'imported' to the western regions from the 'developed areas'. (cf. TIN 13-3-2001)

Young writes that salaries for public servants are much higher in Tibet than in the rest of China: '[A] qualified teacher can expect to start on CNY 1,000–1,200 per month (USD 120–146), more than twice the rate elsewhere.' In the TAR, many teachers in the local villages have no more than a junior high school education and earn CNY 100–200 per month (USD 12–24). In order to professionalize the *minban* teachers (community 'barefoot' teachers), local training institutions began during the 1990s to offer in-service training, and to give certification courses, generally through summer schools. To build grass-root capacity of teachers that can spread horizontally seems more efficient than relying on a vertical training of trainers model. China's top educationalists rarely have a profound experience of teaching children and it is therefore 'likely to prove harder to find a common language between university professors and rural schoolteachers. As rural Tibet amply demonstrates,

policy or curriculum developments at the top do not necessarily trickle down to classrooms in outlying areas.' (Young 2001a: 8–10).

Key issues in teachers education training

- 'Good' teachers are generally regarded as those who are knowledgeable in their subject area, rather than those skilled in communicating their knowledge or stimulating children to learn for themselves. (Young 2001a: 8)
- Inflation makes getting by on a local primary teachers salary, even in rural areas, increasingly difficult. (Upton 1996)
- There is a lack of qualified teachers as seventy per cent of teachers have no more than a middle or high school education.
- Educated Chinese teachers willing to work in minority areas are given improved work conditions, they receive higher wages, and they are permitted to have two children.
- Graduate teachers from Chinese eastern provinces are recruited for middle school posts in Lhasa and other major population centres.
- The concept of group work is now more understood by the teachers in Tibet and by this kind of work the children can help each other. However, this is not formalized as policy and therefore the concept of 'child-friendly learning' does have relevance in the framework of Chinese quality education policy. (Young 2001a)

POST-COMPULSORY EDUCATION

In October 1994, the Tibet Education Foundation was established. It is affiliated to the China Youth League and is intended to fund Tibetan students in secondary and higher education in other parts of China (Bass 1998: 128). The 'Law on Vocational Education' was deliberated and passed at the Nineteenth Session of the Standing Committee of the Eight National People's Congress on May 15, 1996. (Chen Lipeng 1999: 10)

The Central government and the local government of Tibet have set up 25 scientific research institutes, employing 35,000 professional scientific and technical personnel. There are four universities in the TAR: the Tibet Ethnic Institute, the Tibet Institute of Agriculture and Animal Husbandry, Tibet University, and the Tibet College of Tibetan Medicine, with a total enrolment of 5,249 students. Also 16 secondary vocational schools have been set up in the region, and the number of students attending such schools both within and outside the TAR has reached 8,161. With the development of adult education, the illiteracy

rate of Tibetan young and middle-aged people declined from 95 per cent before 1951 to 42 per cent in 1999. (Chinese Government White Paper, *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000. Chinese Government White Papers, *Tibet's March Toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001)

The ministry of Education will no longer use the term 'middle level specialized secondary school', and 'higher level specialized college', etc. They will be renamed as Vocational Technical Colleges. The Ministry will also designate 83 disciplines as key disciplines. There will be an emphasis on teacher training. Fifty sites for teacher training will be set up. The Central government will allocate 15 million yuan to develop vocational distance education. (East News Net, 8-4-2002. Retrieved May 2002 from <http://www.hku.hk/chinaed>)

UNDP's Artisans' Heritage Development (1999–01) project has provided training for some 50 young Tibetan artisans with the view to help them adapt and update their traditional skills to modern market conditions. The project may now be expanded to create an integrated centre in Lhasa to serve artisans from a whole range of trades. (Young 2001a: 12)

According to the White Paper from the Chinese Government, *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*, in 1998 Tibetan cadres accounted for 74.9 per cent of the total in the TAR. However, it appears that China is perpetuating the existing institutional model, in which Tibetans are excluded from the top positions. A current programme at Tibet University to train 70 Chinese cadres in Tibetan language and nationalities policy, apparently as a part of a programme to prepare them for future leadership roles at the county and village level, indicates that the importation of reliable Chinese personnel to Tibet continues to be one solution to the issues of strengthening the Party at the 'grass-roots' level (TIN 2001: 10 and *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000: 12)

Nineteen of China's provinces now have educational responsibilities toward Tibet. In 1986 and 1987 a total of 2,500 graduates of Tibet primary schools were sent to other provinces to study in priority secondary schools. [...] Those most successful in the examinations that follow will go on to either upper secondary or to tertiary education. At present 1,300 students are admitted from the 11 to 14 years age group each year. Of these Tibetans constitute the largest group, but there are also Menba, Luoba, and other national minority

graduates from Tibet. They must demonstrate good ideology and have passed mathematics, Chinese language, and Tibetan language subjects. Their health must be good, and their parents must approve. All fees are paid by the government. Except for the students that go on to the upper secondary school, all of the other students return to Tibet when they finish their studies. Admission standards to universities for Tibetan students have been lowered. Without this special provision the admission of Tibetan students to upper secondary and higher education would be between 50 and 70 per cent of the normal requirement. (Postiglione 1992b: 331–332)

Sangay writes that China has one of the oldest and largest programmes of state-sponsored preferential policies for ethnic minorities. Each year top-ranking students from the elementary schools are sent to other Tibetan Secondary Schools in China. This practice is viewed by some as a systematic way to assimilate Tibetans into the Chinese culture. (Sangay 1998)

Many prominent universities now have one or more *minzu ban*. There were, for example, *minzu ban* at 16 Beijing universities in 1994–1995, including 6 national and 10 locally controlled institutions (Sautman 1999: 176). *Minzu ban* also exists in upper secondary schools, where their main task is to prepare students to go to universities. By 1991, some 3,600 Xinjiang minority students were studying at inland universities, and in 1993 there were 110 Xinjiang classes at 46 universities. Similar classes exist for some other ethnies. (Ibid.: 177)

During the 1994–1995 academic year, about 800 Tibetans were studying at universities outside the TAR, many of them at keypoint schools. A large share of these students are products of the *neidi* Tibetan boarding secondary school system, whose graduates on average have scored over 100 points higher on the national entrance examination than examinees who did their studies in Tibet. (Ibid.: 192)

Preferential admissions in taking the entrance examination are facilitated by several factors. One element is to make the process of taking the national entrance examination easier for minority students by allowing them, in many cases, to use indigenous languages. (Ibid.: 183)

Eight prestigious universities across China are to enrol a total of 120 postgraduates from government departments in Tibet per year for the next five years in an effort to improve the professional skills of Tibetan officials. The applicants must be university graduates who have worked in a government department or institution for at least three years. They must agree to return to Tibet after graduation. The eight uni-

versities are the People's University of China, Beijing Normal University, the Chinese University of Political Science and Law, Tianjin University, Sichuan University, Jilin University, Southwest China University of Finance and Economics and Northwest China University of Agricultural and Forestry Science. (*People's Daily*, 7-11-2002) Retrieved on 8 November 2002 from WTN.

'QUALITY EDUCATION' IN TIBET RELATED TO TEACHERS EDUCATION

According to Chinese policies, any teacher in Tibet will have to take the official policy of '*ideological education*' into consideration. The concept of ideological education is the

- enhancement of moral education in higher education;
- improvement of the curriculum in 'Marxist Theories' and 'Ideology and Morality';
- reinforcement of education in national tradition and revolutionary tradition;
- enhancement of research in philosophy;
- enhancement of educational research;
- enhancement of the role of the Party.

The concept of teacher quality is

- enhancing teacher professionalism. Retraining of all principals and teachers in 3 years. Consolidate teachers' qualification and certification systems. Around 2010, upgrade the required qualification of primary and junior secondary teachers;
- selecting and educating 100,000 'core teachers' in 1999 and 2000 as models and change agents;
- around 2000, turn the entire teaching force into contract employment. Economizing the teaching force. Preferential treatments for teachers in difficult rural areas. (Cheng, 1999)

From the 1990s, government policy was to professionalise the *minban* teachers through '*in-service-training*', until they could qualify as fully-fledged, state school-teachers. To this end, local training institutions began to offer certification courses, generally through summer schools. Yet the poorest areas often lacked the resources to offer training, and teachers could seldom afford to attend. (Young 2001a).

In the proposal for 'The Tibet Basic Education Project', Save the Children states:

SC(UK) objectives in the China County Strategy parallel those of national and regional education, and focus on the need to improve access to, and the quality of education for all children. According to recent statements by the Director General of Basic Education, priorities for development include the need to reduce the education inequalities between rural and urban areas, increase the attendance of girls, improve methods for monitoring children's learning, and improve the ability of county education bureaus to provide more funding for rural schools. These priorities fall under the umbrella of national policy guidelines that stress 'quality education' for children, improved teaching methodologies, and improved supervision of teachers. (Save the Children 2002)

RECOMMENDED TEACHING AND LEARNING STRATEGIES

To develop 'quality', new competence and skills

Child-centred learning involves children in the learning process and aims to strengthen their all-round development in social and physical as well as academic skills. It is important to teach in a manner, in which questions are designed to make children think, or express an opinion, rather than parrot a 'right answer'. There is a need to substantially revise textbooks, with less emphasis on 'rote learning' and more emphasis on students' abilities to read and analyse texts. (Young 2001a, 2001b)

In Save the Children's proposal to 'The Tibet Basic Education Project' to take place in the Lhasa Valley, the goal is to achieve Universal Basic Education in Tibet by 2010:

To help education authorities to develop and promote a model of child-friendly schools which approves access to, and retention in, quality basic education for all Tibetan children of school going age in four target counties (Lhundrup, Medrogongkha, Damshung counties of Lhasa Municipality, and Ngamring County of Shigatse Prefecture). Based on the child friendly school model the project will provide in-service education and in-school support for primary teachers in collaboration with the County Education Bureau. Work with ongoing changes to the teacher training and accreditation system, organize teachers workshops with key teachers and review and modify teaching support materials including curricular changes e.g. the teaching of

English from grade three. Work on increased parental and community involvement in primary schools, the closure of small Preliminary Primary Schools with fewer than 25 pupils (unless there is no other school within three kilometres) resulting in children from grade 1 upward having to board in nearby integrated primary school. Implement out of school activities for children, support nutrition in schools, improve hygiene practices among school-aged Tibetan children and work on vocational education and early childhood initiatives. (Save the Children 2002)

'Community literacy' is an approach that seeks to build on the existing curriculum by developing and including materials relevant to vocational skills and income generation, with practical applications in helping to improve livelihoods. This also contributes to building a closer parent-teacher relationship, and achieving greater parental involvement in children's education. (Young 2001a)

Young proposes the following concepts in quality education.

Concepts of 'quality education' in teaching

Questioning: good questioning is vital to effective classroom learning and it is important that teachers plan their questions carefully to maximize children's learning and use open questions to encourage divergent and creative thinking and allow for a wide range of answers. As they make children think more deeply about topics, such questions are more effective in helping children learn.

Real objects/direct experience: children learn through using their five senses, they need to use real objects or have direct experiences to assist them in their learning and development. The use of real objects and direct experience allows children to see and feel concepts that are being taught. It makes explanations more clear, it makes learning more interesting, it allows children the opportunity to talk and think about what they learn, and it allows children to understand how concepts can be applied to real life. This kind of teaching helps to root formal education in the real, familiar world that the children inhabit. Moreover, it engages all the five senses in the learning process – not just the ears and the eyes – reflecting the way that young children learn in the home environment.

Games: education games are good way to practise and revise concepts after they have been taught. Games motivates children, it develops social skills and get children working co-operatively together. Education games encourage children to enjoy school, and it develops peer relationships amongst children. It makes children actively use their minds and trains them to work independently.

Group work: the process of learning happens within a social context and group work is an important part of active learning. When children work together in group they learn to negotiate, work co-operatively with each other and develop social skills. They learn to deepen their understanding about learning through discussion with each other and by working in a less threatening environment they are more likely to take risks. They can work at their own pace and have time to develop concepts and ideas, and they can help each other and thereby support other children in the learning process. (Young 2001a)

MEDIA AND IT

The Chinese Party and government exercise a very substantial degree of control over information content and distribution in Tibetan areas. The widespread usage of the Chinese language in print, broadcasting and television media serves to disadvantage and marginalise those whose first or only language is Tibetan from gaining essential information. In addition, the low priority given to original journalism in Tibetan and the high proportion of published writing that is simply translated from Chinese pushes educated bilingual Tibetans towards a preference for original Chinese language material. There are, however, indications that the state's ability to control access to information within its borders may be in decline. As a result of the process of modernisation, Internet users in Lhasa are now able to access websites outside the PRC, and the rapid increase in independent broadcasts into Tibet in the Tibetan language, by Tibetan exiles, has meant that even illiterate nomads in the most remote areas of Tibet have access to independent sources of news. Improvements to communications, and the increase in the number of people who travel within and beyond Tibet's borders, mean that the Party (PRC) is increasingly unable to contain and control the flow of news within Tibet (TIN 3-5-2000).

<http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/nu030500.htm>

In China the information technology is an important plank of the 'quality education' platform, with an ambitious commitment to have 90 per cent of the country's 670,000 primary and junior schools on-line by 2010 (up from around 10 per cent now). (Young 2001b: 13)

Key issues in teachers education training

- The lack of universities in the Tibetan region forces many Tibetans to study at universities or key point schools outside the TAR. Although these students are provided good learning facilities they

are being uprooted from their cultural background and assimilated into Chinese culture and livelihood.

- An implicit assumption that ‘more education’ and ‘more educated teachers’ naturally equate with better quality of education is not granted. Thought will also have to be given to the methods used to deliver education in the classroom. Only 30 per cent of the children in the TAR are officially reported to complete the 9 years of compulsory school. Given the situation in the rural areas, it would be more realistic to concentrate first on making the few years that most Tibetan children spend in school as productive, useful and relevant as possible. This might be done by introducing ‘child-centred learning’. (Young 2001a)
- In 1994, the programme of educating Tibetan children in Central China was altered to include Han Chinese children resident in the TAR. (Bass 1998: 56)
- National minority education is still the most difficult area of research within Chinese educational studies. Access to most minority areas still remains restricted; contacts are usually managed through the Han majority nationality, and therefore, one often gets one side of the picture. Moreover, most of the national minority educational research is done by Han Chinese rather than minority group members. (Postiglione 1992b: 332)
- The challenge for Tibetan educators and their supporters is thus to prove the value of a Tibetan-language education in a sociopolitical context which is not always supportive of, and is sometimes downright hostile to, the maintenance and development of Tibetan language and culture. (Upton 1999: 312)

SELECTED REFERENCES, TEACHERS EDUCATION TRAINING

Baden Nima (1997). ‘The Way Out for Tibetan Education’. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp.7–20. First published in Chinese ‘Zangzu jiaoyu de chulu’ in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 3, pp. 44–50.

Badeng Nima (2001). ‘Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet’. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from ‘Guan yu xizang de shuang-yu jiaoyu wenti’.

Bass, Catriona (1998). *Education in Tibet: Policy and Practice since 1950*. Tibet Information Network & Zed Books, London & New York.
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/education.htm>

Burman, Beena Roy (1977). 'Cadre Education in Tibet'. *China Report*. Vol. 13: no. 1, pp. 11–15.

Chen Lipeng (1999). On the 'Law on Ethnic Minority Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. September–October, vol. 32: no. 5, pp. 7–19. First published in Chinese [Lun shaoshu minzu jiaoyu fa] in *Minzu jiaoyu yanjiu* [Studies on ethnic education], 1997: no. 3, pp. 20–24.

Chen Yunpu and Huang Yunbin (1997). 'A Summary of Technical Secondary School Recruitment in 1994'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 94–102. First published in Chinese [1994 nian zhongzhuan zhaosheng zongshu] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet], 1995: no. 2, pp. 43–46.

Cheng, Kai-ming (1999). *Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century* (synopsis). (People's Republic of China). Proposed by the Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998. Endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from
http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm

Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I). 1997 July–August, vol. 30: no. 4.

— *The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. 1997, September–October, vol. 30: no. 5.

— *Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. 1999 September–October, vol. 32: no. 5.

— *Bilingual Education in China*. 2001 March–April, vol. 34: no. 2.

Chinese Government White Papers, <http://test.china.org.cn/e-white/>

- *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/2/index.htm>
- *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/4/index.htm>

- *Tibet's March Toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/20011108/index.htm>

Clarke, Graham E. (1994). 'The Movement of Population to the West of China: Tibet and Qinghai'. In Judith M. Brown and Rosemary Foot (eds). *Migration: The Asian Experience*, pp. 221–257. St. Martin's Press, Oxford.

ECTAR (Education Commission of the Tibet Autonomous Region and the Leading Group for Tibetan-Language Instruction of the Regional Education Commission) (1997). 'Summary of Pilot Project Work in Middle-School Tibetan-Language Instruction'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 41–48. First published in Chinese [Zhongxue zangyuwen shouke shidian gongzuo zongjie] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet] 1995: no. 5, pp. 3–6.

Goldstein-Kyaga, Katrin (1993). *The Tibetans – School for Survival or Submission: An Investigation of Ethnicity and Education*. HLS Förlag, Stockholm.

Hansen, Mette Halskov (1999). *Lessons in Being Chinese. Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Hayhoe, Ruth (ed.) (1992). *Education and Modernization. The Chinese Experience*. The Comparative and International Education Series. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

ICLT (International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet; now TJC – Tibet Justice Center) (2001), *A Generation in Peril: The Lives of Tibetan Children Under Chinese Rule*. A report by International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet. <http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>

Kolås, Åshild and Monika P. Thowsen. (Forthcoming). *On the Margins of Tibet: Cultural Survival on the Sino–Tibetan Frontier*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Lin Junhua (Padma-tshe-ring) (1997). 'Brief Summary of the History of Evolution of School Education in the Ganzi Tibetan Region'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. Vol. 30: no. 5., September–October, pp. 7–25. First published in Chinese [Ganzi

zangqu xuexiao jiaoyu kaifashi gaisuo] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1993: no. 2, pp. 39–46.

Postiglione, Gerard A. (ed.) (1992b). 'The Implications of modernization for the Education of China's National Minorities'. In Ruth Hayhoe (ed.), *Education and Modernization. The Chinese Experience*, pp. 307–336. The Comparative and International Education Series. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

— (1999b) *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Sangay, L. (1998). 'Education rights for Tibetans in Tibet and India'. In J. D. Montgomery (ed.), *Human Rights: Positive Policies in Asia and the Pacific Rim*, pp. 285–307. Hollis Publishing Company, Hollis.

Sautman, Barry (1999). 'Expanding Access to Higher education for China's National Minorities. Policies of Preferential Admissions'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 173–209. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Save the Children (2002). *Tibet Basic Education Project. April 2002–April 2005*. Prepared by Tibet education team, Save the Children (UK) China programme in consultation with Save the Children Denmark, May 2002. Retrieved September 2002 from, <http://www.redbarnet.dk>

Save the Children UK, SC(UK). *Education Programmes and Policies*. <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

Stites, Regie (1999). 'Writing Cultural Boundaries: National Minority Language Policy, Literacy Planning, and Bilingual Education'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 95–130. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Thøgersen, Stig (guest editor) (1991). *Chinese Education. Vocational and Technical Secondary Education in China*. Fall, 24: no. 3.

TIN (Tibet Information Network) (1998). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 26. 1997*. Education in Tibet. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra26.htm>

- (2001). 'Language and Tibetan Identity'. In *News Review. Reports from Tibet*, no. 29, 2000, pp. 53–66. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- (2001). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29. 2000*. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- (TIN) *Tibet Current Affairs Archive. News Updates 1988–1998*, <http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/TibPages/TIN/tin-archive.html>
- Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy. Annual Report 2001. <http://www.tchrd.org/pubs/2001>
- (1997). *The Next Generation: The State of Education in Tibet Today*. Dharamsala: Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy. <http://www.tchrd.org>
- Tsering W. Shakya (1994). 'Politicisation and the Tibetan Language'. In Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner (eds), *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*, pp. 157–165. Hurst & Company, London.
- UNICEF 2002a, 'Education Initiatives. Education is a Right'. <http://www.unicef.org/programme/education/cfchlist.htm>
- 2002b, Shaeffer, S., A. Dykstra, J. Irvine, M.J. Pigozzi and R.M. Torres, *The Global Agenda for Children: Learning for the 21st Century*. Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>
- Upton, Janet L. (1996). 'Home on the Grasslands? Tradition, Modernity, and the Negotiation of Identity by Tibetan Intellectuals in the PRC'. In Melissa J. Brown (ed.), *Negotiating Ethnicities in China and Taiwan*, pp. 98–124. Institute for East Asian Studies, University of California, Berkeley.
- (1999). 'The Development of Modern School-Based Tibetan Language Education in the PRC'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 281–340. Falmer Press, New York and London.
- Young, Nick (2001a). 'Bringing quality down to the basics'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, vol. IV: no. 2, pp. 7–12.

[http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/
article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369](http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369)

— (2001b) 'Exam system is weakest link in quality chain'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, vol. IV: no. 2, pp. 13–17.

[http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/
article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371](http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371)

WTN (World Tibet Network News. News Archive),

<http://www.tibet.ca/wtnnews.htm>

Chapter 4

Access and Participation

PRE-SCHOOL EDUCATION IN RURAL AREAS AND AT TOWNSHIP LEVEL – ELIMINATION OF VILLAGE SCHOOLS

When reading statistics on population in the TAR it is important to take into consideration that not all children are registered. Some children are considered illegitimate by the authorities, because their parents have exceeded the permitted child birth quota. Non-registered children are not allowed to attend school. Also, children are registered in school even when they only attend classes occasionally.

According to the 1990 national census, the illiteracy rate for the TAR in 1990 was 73.8%, which was the highest for all of PRC provinces. Only 19.4% of all Tibetans had completed primary school, 4.6% had graduated from junior middle school, 2.1% had graduated from senior middle school and only 0.4% had graduated from colleges and universities. (*China Population Statistics Yearbook 1994*)

According to the 2000 Population Census, 850,000 (32.5%) persons are illiterate in the TAR. Of the total population of 2,620,000 some 2,320,000 are above the age of six years. Of the persons above the age of six years, 30,000 (1.41%) are students who have completed junior college, 90,000 (3.85%) have completed secondary school, 160,000 (6.91%) have completed junior secondary school, 800,000 (43.35%) have completed primary school, 170,000 (7.17%) have completed literacy class and 1,070,000 (46.30%) have never been to school. The total school enrolment rate for TAR is 85.80%. (*China Population Statistics Yearbook 2001*)

By 2000, Tibet had set up 956 schools of all kinds, with a total enrolment of 381,100 students; the enrolment rate of school-age children had increased to 95.8 per cent; the illiteracy rate had declined to 32.5 per cent; and 33,000 persons had received education above the junior level, accounting for 12.6 per thousand of the region's total population and higher than the national level. (Chinese Government White Paper. *Tibet's March Toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001: 8)

The poor human and geographic environments are crafting major difficulties for the universalization and development of education. UNESCO maintains that the criterion for setting up a school schools, in general, be the presence of 500 inhabitants in villages within a radius of 5 kilometers. But Tibet's population is so sparse and scattered that the agricultural and semi-agricultural/semi-pastoral districts average only 3.2 inhabitants per square kilometre. This causes problems for the layout and distribution of schools. (Zhang Guodu 1997: 33–34)

Surveys show that the main reasons for the low attendance rate among school-age children in the agricultural and semi-agricultural/semi-pastoral districts are inconvenient communications make going to school difficult; unconcerned parents do not care whether their children go to school; household finances cannot support the expense of sending children to school; insufficient funds; and the lack of school premises restrict student recruitment. (Ibid.: 39)

Kolås and Thowsen write that during fieldwork in the TAR border regions researchers accounted that in several prefectures (including Golok and Kandze) information was received about an ongoing centralization involving the transformation of village-level schools into 'key schools' (*zhongxin xuexiao*). The main reason for this type of restructuring was the attempt to be able to provide better teachers and facilities. Local educators argued that the quality of education in these 'key schools' was better and an additional factor was that the centralization of schools is cost efficient. However, boarding schools tend to be more expensive for the parents, and boarding school students usually spend most of the year away from their families. In order to let the children spend more time with their families, some boarding schools have their own schedule and organize the school year differently from ordinary schools, for instance by having the school open from March to December (including summer vacation). The children then move home to stay with their families from December to March so that the parents can pass on important knowledge and teach their children the necessary skills to continue a life of farming or herding. (Kolås and Thowsen, Forthcoming)

Key issues in pre-school education in rural areas and at township level – elimination of village schools

- Poverty – parents have to pay miscellaneous fees or book fees. Supplementary rural education fees are insufficient or could not be collected. (Zhou et. al. 2001)

- Due to geographical conditions many children have limited access to school or they live in remote rural areas with an insufficient number of schools or a lack of boarding schools. In some rural areas children have to walk for many hours to get to school, and roads may not be considered safe for small children.
- The closing of village schools in the rural areas – in the drive to raise standards, some rural schools have been closed, reducing access for the poorest communities. (Young 2001a: 10)
- Many schools can only offer three–four years of primary schooling and the actual outcome of learning is low. Especially rural schools often have very limited attendance of students as the curriculum, is regarded to be irrelevant by many Tibetan parents.
- Many rural schools have poor facilities, often lacking desks, benches, and sometimes even a schoolhouse. There are not enough teachers, school management is lax, and the educational method inappropriate as one teacher has to teach several class levels at the same time.
- It is a problem that children of minority nationalities become very self-abased when they find no references to their own culture or history in school materials. When they find nothing to make them feel proud of being a person of their own nationality, they lose self-esteem and interest in schooling. (Postiglione 1999a: 17)

RETENTION – KEEPING CHILDREN IN SCHOOL – GIRLS’ ACCESS TO SCHOOLS

The education system in China is geared primarily to the needs of those who go further up the ladder and it tends to neglect the needs of those on the lower rungs. About 85 per cent of primary and secondary students don’t continue schooling and what they’ve learned is often not very useful: they’ve been trained for something they never go on to do. Yet society needs people of various kinds, not just Peking University graduates. Even the rapidly shrinking minority who will make a living exclusively from farming will need to adapt to major changes in markets, technologies, and use patterns. (Young 2001b: 16–17)

Such cultural units as Tibetan customs, ethics, philosophy, language, and natural sciences are by no means merely material for historical research but are the foundations and points of departure of contemporary social development in the Tibetan region. Tibetan culture, a mature culture, differs greatly from Han culture. Under the influence of Tibetan culture, the Tibetans’ lifestyle, customs, values orientation, and emotional characteristics have their own regularities that are basically unrelated to current school education, and this is the

chief reason for such symptoms as students nonattendance, drop-outs, lack of application to studies, and absence of parental support. When we open textbooks used in today's compulsory education, we find very little of the best elements of Tibetan culture; Tibetan children are only required to memorize the poems of Li Bai and Du Fu and no mention at all is made of the *Biography of King Gesang* (Ge-sar Rgyal-po). (Baden Nima 1997: 13)

The discontinuation in Sichuan of the 'jenpei' system (a guarantee for graduates to secure jobs and work unit) in 2000 has meant an increase in drop-out rates in school at all levels, as when basic education is no longer inexpensive or free of charge, and graduates experience unemployment, education is no longer considered to be a wise investment. (Kolås and Thowsen, forthcoming)

China's compulsory basic education is unbalanced, with the problems in girls' education being very obvious and most concentrated in regional areas that are primarily remote, economically underdeveloped, have poor transportation, are home to ethnic minorities, are rural and mountainous, and are autonomous. (Zhou et al. 2001: 5)

One out of less than 10 illiterates in the world is Chinese. About 90 per cent illiterate Chinese live in rural areas, 50 per cent in the west regions; 70 per cent are female. The statistics published by the Ministry of Education have aroused strong concern from CPPCC members at the just opened NPC and CPPCC sessions. After years of efforts, China's illiteracy eliminating work has made much progress: the illiteracy rate for adults dropped from 22.23 per cent ten years ago to 8.72 per cent. But the total number of illiterate people stands as much as 85.07 million, of which 20 million are at an age between 15 and 50. The provinces and autonomous regions of Tibet, Qinghai, Guizhou, Gansu, Yunnan, Ningxia, Xinjiang and Shannxi are home to 50 per cent of China's illiterates, although their whole population only takes 15 per cent of the national total. In rural areas, the dropout of girls remains a serious problem since women are responsible for raising children and an illiterate mother does no good to her child's education. (*People's Daily*, 4-3-2002. Retrieved from WTN 4-3-2002)

Key issues in retention – keeping children in school – girls' access to school

- Major factors for low school enrolment are poverty and the difficulty of learning a second language. Most of the students enrolled tend to drop out in the early grades.
- Many of the minority students drop out because they fail to qualify in the Chinese language examination.

- Girls' attendance in school in the herding and poorer agricultural areas is estimated to be only 50 per cent. (Kolås and Thowsen, forthcoming)
- High female illiteracy limits the choice of jobs and opportunities for development, directly influences the quality of family life, is detrimental to the education of these women's children, and leads to poverty and population increases. (Zhou et al. 2001: 7)
- The opportunities for higher education and employment are especially low for girls and a lack of female teachers and a distant location of the school make school attendance unattractive to girls.
- It is important to advocate a research between investigators, cadres, school principals, and teachers, as these persons are more familiar with the target group and have an affinity with rural and nationality feelings as well as the experience and knowledge to solve these problems. (Ibid.: 9)

COOPERATION BETWEEN PARENTS AND LOCAL COMMUNITIES

Guidelines of Ethics for Teachers published by the Chinese Ministry of Education maintains that contact between parents and teachers is an important feature of improved education (cf. Cheng 1999).

Zhang Goudu lists the problems of low attendance rates among school-age children in the agricultural and semi-agricultural/semi-pastoral districts:

A substantial portion of the general public does not place enough importance on education. This problem is manifested chiefly in two aspects: The first in an insufficient clear understanding of the significance of education, i.e. failure to understand that exposure to contemporary culture and education is the only way to become a social person (*she hui ren*) and an indispensable means of improving a person's qualities; some people fail to see the benefits of education and only calculate its costs, and regard education as a waste of time, manpower and resources. (Zhang Goudu 1997: 31)

Actually, the financial circumstances of many peasant and herdsman's households is not bad, but they prefer to have their school-age children stay at home and work to increase the family income; some parents will not even let their children go to primary school simply because they themselves have decided there is no point in giving the latter an education. (Ibid.: 32)

Cheng (2001) argues that 'parents pay for education indirectly through taxes, but the marketized economy has also given rise to other unprecedented private costs'. Parents have to pay textbooks, which were previously supplied by the state, and the introduction of fees for higher education in 1997 has forced the parents to apply economic analysis to their children's schooling. 'During the compulsory years (grades 1–9), schools are not supposed to charge fees. However, most schools charge what are known as miscellaneous fees'. Senior secondary education is not free and demands 'entrance fees' for admission. Since 1997, all universities have started to charge fees and this places the parents in the role of private investors. The fees vary from programme to programme, and are often dependent on the potential income of the graduates rather than the cost of the programme. English language charges are much higher than for physics. The only exception are teacher training programmes; the popularity of these and teacher training institutions has increased dramatically. (Cheng 2001: 250–253)

The attitude of parents in many parts of Songpan, Sichuan, seems to be that it is important to be competent in Chinese, and that it is better to start learning the language from an early age, so the lack of Tibetan-language education in village schools does not always reflect simple bureaucratic insensitivity to local concern. (Upton 1999: 339)

Educational access for Tibetan children appears to be restricted at times by their parents' lack of *guangxi*, or connections, with school officials or within the CCP hierarchy. This seems particularly true of secondary education, though we found that access to state-run primary schools also can require connections. Within schools, too, some teachers apparently demand 'gifts' in exchange for favourable treatment or better teaching. Tibetan parents rarely can afford these gifts. Their children, as a result, may suffer from wealth-based discrimination in school. (ICLT 2001)

Kolås and Thowsen write that some parents neglect to send their children to school. For rural Tibetans schooling can be a heavy economic burden, especially with regard to boarding school fees. One way of making it easier for parents to afford the expenses can be to let them pay in kind (meat, flour or butter) rather than in cash. Funding strategies introduced in some Tibetan areas (since the 1985 education reform) also include free grasslands and herds as income sources for individual schools. Fees collected from the parents of primary school

children typically cover heating, cleaning and wall decorations for the classroom. In addition, students must often pay for their own textbooks and writing materials. (Kolås and Thowsen, forthcoming)

Community involvement in parent-school relation in rural China will make children try harder and achieve more at schools. The parent-child relation is improved and parents participate more frequently in the children's activities. Parents become better teachers for their children at home and use more positive reinforcement. The community will value the school, and the children and school develop a positive and unique image of their own community. (*UN Theme Group Newsletter* 2001: no. 7, p. 1)

Gender differences in high school enrolment are the smallest amongst children of the cadre mothers and fathers. Having a father who is a member of the Chinese Communist party or Communist Youth League provides modest advantages to sons and daughters alike, while having a mother who is a CCP or CYL member provides advantages to daughters but not to sons. (Montgomery and Liu 1996: 86)

Key issues in cooperation between parents and local communities and in parents' response to official policies in schooling

- Families have little or no means to pay miscellaneous fees or book fees and the economic sanctions to force parents to send their children to school make schooling (at least for rural Tibetans) a heavy economic burden.
- Many Tibetan parents do not accept the political content of the school curriculum. The educational attainment of parents is in general very low, and they lack information on education.
- Many parents in the rural areas feel that education is unnecessary for making a living as there are very few local jobs available in the rural areas for which schooling is required.
- There should be a feedback to proposed school actions and plans from parents and the community. The community could be strengthened by for example inviting local religious persons and directors of rural enterprises to hold the post of honorary school principal to help attract girls, to improve school management, and to strengthen links with all sections of the community. (Zhou et al. 2001)
- Many Tibetan parents believe that it is of greater importance for their children to know about their traditional culture, language and religion than to learn mathematics and science.

- Some parents decide to send their children to the Tibetan exile community schools in India. Every year approximately 3,000 Tibetans, of which almost one third are children, undertake strenuous treks for weeks to cross the Himalayas. (Cf. ICLT 2001)

SELECTED REFERENCES, ACCESS AND PARTICIPATION

Baden Nima (1997). 'The Way Out for Tibetan Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 7–20. First published in Chinese 'Zangzu jiaoyu de chulu' in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 3, pp. 44–50.

Badeng Nima (2001). 'Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from 'Guan yu xizang de shuangyu jiaoyu wenti'.

Bangsbo, Ellen (2000). 'Tibetans in Exile: Monastic and Secular Education of Monks in Nepal'. *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 3, pp. 4–7.

Cheng, Kai-ming (1999). *Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century* (synopsis). (People's Republic of China). Proposed by the Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998 and endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm

— (2001). 'Changing cultures and schools in the People's Republic of China: tradition, the market and educational change'. In Jo Cairns, Denis Lawton and Roy Gardner (eds), *World Yearbook of Education 2001. Values, Culture and Education*, pp. 242–257. Kogan Page, London.

Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I). 1997 July–August, vol. 30: no. 4.

— *The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. 1997 September–October, vol. 30: no. 5.

Chinese Government White Papers. *Tibet's March toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001.

<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/20011108/index.htm>

Dorjee, Tashi (1977). 'Education in Tibet'. *The Tibet Journal*. Vol. 2: no. 4, pp. 31–37.

Hansen, Mette Halskov (2000). 'Chinese Minority Education: State Policy, International Organizations and Local Responses'. *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 4, pp. 12–16.

— (1999). *Lessons in Being Chinese. Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

ICLT (International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet, now TJC – Tibet Justice Centre) (2001). *A Generation in Peril. The Lives of Tibetan Children Under Chinese Rule*. A Report by the International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet, Berkeley.
<http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>

Kolås, Åshild and Monika P. Thowsen (forthcoming). *On the Margins of Tibet: Cultural Survival on the Sino–Tibetan Frontier*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Liao, Hollis S. (1995). 'The Recruitment and Training of Ethnic Minority Cadres in Tibet'. *Issues and Studies*. Vol. 31: no. 12, pp. 55–67.

Lopez, Donald (ed.) (1988). 'The monastery as a medium of Tibetan Culture'. *Cultural Survival Quarterly*. Vol. 12: no. 1, pp. 61–64.

Meng Xianfan, Qi Shujuan and Kan Ben (Translated by Lin Hong and revised by Su Xuetao) (1999). 'The Demand for Education Among the Tibetan People in Qinghai Province – An Investigation in Two Tibetan Communities'. *Social Sciences in China*. Autumn, vol. 20: no. 3, pp. 84–95. Originally published in Chinese in *Zhongguo shehui kexue* 1998: no. 3.

Ming Tsui and Lynne Rich (2002). 'The Only Child and Educational Opportunity for Girls in Urban China'. *Gender and Society*. February, vol. 16: no.1, pp. 74–92.

Montgomery Broaded, C and Chongshun Liu (1996). 'Family Background, Gender and Educational Attainment in Urban China'. *China Quarterly*, no. 145, pp. 53–86.

Postiglione, Gerard A. (ed.) (1999b). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London.

TCHRD (Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy) (1997). *The Next Generation: The State of Education in Tibet Today*. Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala. <http://www.tchrd.org>

Thogersen, Stig (2002). *A Country of Culture. Twentieth-Century China Seen from the Village Schools of Zouping, Shandong*. Michigan University Press, Michigan.

UN Theme Group Newsletter 2001. No. 7. Published by UNESCO Beijing Office.

Upton, Janet L. (1996). 'Home on the Grasslands? Tradition, Modernity, and the Negotiation of Identity by Tibetan Intellectuals in the PRC'. In Melissa J. Brown (ed.), *Negotiating ethnicities in China and Taiwan*, pp. 98–124. Institute for East Asian Studies, University of California, Berkeley.

— (1999). 'The Development of Modern School-Based Tibetan Language Education in the PRC'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 281–340. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Young, Nick (2001a). 'Bringing quality down to the basics'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 7–12.

[http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/
article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369](http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369)

— (2001b) 'Exam system is weakest link in quality chain'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 13–17.

[http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/
article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371](http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371)

Zhang Guodu (1997). 'Develop an Educational System Suited to the Requirements of the Economic Situation. Reflections on the Current State and Problems of Education in Tibet's Agricultural and Semi-Agricultural/Semi-Pastoral Districts.' *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. Sep.–Oct., 30: no. 5, pp. 26–53. First published in Chinese [Fazhan yu jingji shitai yaoqiu xiangshiying de jiaoyu – dui wo qu nongqu, bannongbanmuqu jiaoyu xianzhuang, wenti de sikao] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 2, pp. 25–34.

Zhou Wei, Zhang Tiedao, Liu Wenpu, Ma Yuqin, and Peng Jiayun (2001). 'Research into Girl's Education in Four Western Provinces of China'. *Chinese Education and Society. Educational Research Selections*. September–October, vol. 34: no. 5, pp. 4–28. First published in *Jiaoyu yanjiu* (Educational research), 1996: no. 1, pp. 34–43.

Zhou Yangguang (1997). 'Reflections on the Development of Vocational/ Technical Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, 30: no. 4, pp. 80–88. First published in Chinese [Dui fazhan Xizang zhiye jishu jiaoyu de sikao] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1992: no. 1, pp. 83–86.

Chapter 5

International Development Aid

China and the European Union (EU) jointly launched a poverty-relief program in Lhasa Monday, to assist 40,000 people in the rural areas of Bainang of Tibet, southwest China. The EU will donate 7.6 million euro, together with 16.05 million yuan (1.94 million US dollars) on Chinese side, to the program, which is designed to develop nine poverty-relief projects and will concentrate on areas such as education, health and drinking water supply. Richard Hardiman, the EU project director, said the EU hopes the project will help promote the development of production and improve the living standards of the local people. Gyabo, vice-chairman of the Tibet Autonomous Regional government, said that the local people will benefit from the project, the first one of its kind launched by EU. Bainang is an important agricultural area in Tibet. The Chinese government has so far spent 200 million yuan on irrigation projects there. (*People's Daily* 30-4-2002).

The Canadian government will provide 5.4 million Canadian dollars (about 26 million yuan) to Tibet in the next four years for improving the living conditions of local people, according to an agreement signed in Lhasa Saturday. Losang Toinzhub, vice chairman of the People's Government of Tibet Autonomous Region Saturday met with Lisa Armstrong, official with the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and Gerald Chauvet, official from the Canadian Embassy to China. They signed the agreement on the development projects to be implemented in three counties in Tibet to improve the life of Tibetan people. China's central government has also decided to provide 14.16 million yuan for the projects. (*People's Daily* 12-05-2002).

The independent aid organisation Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF, or Doctors without Borders) has made the controversial decision to pull out of Tibet at the end of the year after 14 years of working with Tibetans on humanitarian and medical assistance projects. The decision to pull out of Tibet was said to have been made following a reshuffle of MSF operational strategy in the area, linked to difficulties with continuity of staff and the transfer of management of MSF's Tibet projects from Lhasa to Beijing. MSF has developed a reputation for activism as well as medical assistance projects since it was founded by a

group of French doctors in 1971. Relations between the authorities in Tibet and MSF have frequently been tense, partially due to the charity's stated mandate of '*undertaking advocacy positions when dealing with specific abuses of endangered populations*'. In June 1997, two senior members of the MSF team had their permits briefly withdrawn – Chinese officials are said to have commented that the two experts had been in Tibet for too long. The authorities in Tibet maintain a strict control over the activities of all foreign NGOs and aid projects in Tibetan areas. Tibet has one of the smallest concentrations of NGOs in the world, prompting concerns that the withdrawal of MSF will have an impact on Tibetans who have benefited from their projects. (Retrieved from TIN 16–12–2002).

TIBET HERITAGE FUND (THF), a non-profit organization registered in Berlin with international members and supporters, is committed to the preservation and advancement of Tibetan Cultural Heritage, and the promoting of international understanding and co-operation. Since 1996 THF has initiated the restoration of historic buildings in Lhasa, funding and organizing the rehabilitation of two dozen sites, working with the government and the local communities. Another aspect of THF's work has been the study and documentation of traditional Tibetan architecture, resulting in a small number of non-commercial publications. (Heritage Fund Project). Retrieved February 2003 from <http://www.tibetheritagefund.org/>

The expulsion of a European non-governmental organisation, the Tibet Heritage Fund, from Lhasa in 2000 indicated the particular difficulties faced by those involved in cultural heritage work in the current economic and political climate. The Tibet Heritage Fund, which employed more than 200 local workers in Lhasa, had been involved in restoring more than 70 historic buildings in Lhasa, including houses and temples more than 1,200 years old. There were reports that officials had accused the Tibet Heritage Fund of a series of violations, including using unauthorised construction firms, restoring unapproved sites and damaging social order, which were disputed by the group. (TIN News Update 29–4–2002) <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/2002/2904.htm>

OFFICIAL DEVELOPMENT ACTORS IN TIBET

- Asian Development Bank (ADB) <http://www.adb.org/>
- Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID), Qinghai Community Development Project, <http://www.ausaid.gov.au>

- Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), <http://www.cida.ca>
- European Union (EU), <http://europa.eu.int/> EU, Panam Integrated Rural Development Project EU, Qinghai Livestock Development
- Food and Agriculture Organization (UN) FAO, http://www.fao.org/sd/2001/IN0601_en.htm and http://www.fao.org/sd/2001/IN0602_en.htm
- Ford Foundation, <http://www.fordfound.org/>
- Italian Trade Commission, Beijing: Development Cooperation, <http://www.cina.com.cn/layer2/12Fin.htm>
- Ministero degli Affari Esteri: Cina – Sviluppo della medicina di urgenza in Tibet, II fase (Italien), <http://www.esteri.it/opportu/gare/gara110101.htm>
- New Zealand Agency for International Development (NZAID): Tibet Poverty Alleviation Fund, Sichuan Hydatid Project & Yunnan Integrated Rural Development Projects, <http://www.nzaid.govt.nz/>
- United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) <http://www.unicef.org>
- United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) <http://www.undp.org/>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) <http://www.unesco.org/>
- USAID: Tibetan Community Support, http://www.usaid.gov/pubs/bj2001/ane/cn/china_ads.html
- World Bank Group <http://www.worldbank.org>
World Bank: China Western Poverty Reduction Project, <http://www.worldbank.org/html/extdr/offrep/eap/projects/china/wprp/chindex.htm>

**NGOS AND INSTITUTIONS IN EDUCATIONAL
DEVELOPMENT IN TIBET AND BORDERING
REGIONS**

List cited from China Development Brief, the Directory of International NGO’s working in China, <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.com/>

- Aide aux Réfugiés Tibétains (France), <http://www.chez.com/artgrenoble/activites/dispensaire.html>
- Appropriate Technology for Tibetans (UK), <http://www.ap Tibet.org/>
- ASIA (Italy), <http://www.melong.com/asia/>
- BODHI Australia, <http://www.angelfire.com/on/bodhi/>
- The Bridge Fund (Holland/USA): <http://www.bridgefund.org/home.htm>
- Centro Rabten Ghe Pel Ling: Ospedale del Popolo di Litang (Italy), <http://www.gpling.org/progettisolid.htm>
- Children in Crisis (UK), <http://www.childrenincrisis.org.uk/>
- Christian Action (Hong Kong), [http://www.christian-action.org.hk/china\(e\).htm](http://www.christian-action.org.hk/china(e).htm)
- Dayab e.V., Förderverein für die tibetische Region Dayab (Germany), <http://mitglied.lycos.de/Dayab/eindex.htm>
- Eko Himal (Austria), <http://www.ecohimal.org/>
- Eco Himal Italia, <http://www.working.it/fw/ecohimal/>
- Förderkreis Blinden-Zentrum Tibet (Germany), <http://www.blinden-zentrum-tibet.de/>
- Friendship Homes and Schools (USA), <http://www.friendship-homes.org/index.html>
- Kham Aid Foundation (USA), <http://www.khamaid.org>
- Kinderhilfswerk Tendol Gyalzur in Tibet (Switzerland), <http://www.tendol-gyalzur-tibet.ch/>
- Kongpo Chukla e.V. (Germany), <http://www.kongpo-chukla.de/>
- The Netherlands Red Cross, <http://www.rodekruis.nl>
- Norbu Charitable Foundation (Hong Kong), <http://www.ncf.net/>
- Rokpa Trust (UK), <http://www.rokpa.org>
- Save the Children Fund, <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/>
- SOS Children's Village, <http://www.sos-childrensvillages.org/>

International Development Aid

- Surmang Foundation (USA), <http://www.surmang.org>
- Swedish Society for School and Culture, <http://www.tibet-school.org>
- Swiss Red Cross, <http://www.redcross.ch>
- The Tadra Project (Germany), <http://www.tadra.de/>
- Tibet Foundation (UK), <http://www.tibet-foundation.org>
- Tibet Society, <http://www.tibetsociety.com>
- Tibet Heritage Fund, http://www.asianart.com/lhasa_restoration
- Tibet Poverty Alleviation Fund (USA), <http://www.tpaf.org>
- The Tibet Fund (USA), <http://www.tibetfund.org>
- Trace Foundation (USA), <http://www.trace.org>

Chapter 6

Implications for Educational Projects in Tibet

What are the considerations for development aid to promote the aims and goals for enhancing schooling in Tibet? What are the (main) problems for development workers of working in a Tibetan/Chinese context?

Issue

That Tibetan children will learn skills that are genuinely useful and relevant to their future lives; and to convince Tibetan parents to recognize the need to invest in their children's education.

Problems

- a) Many children drop out of school or attend school irregularly.
- b) Children have limited access to schools in the rural areas.
- c) Schools are too oriented towards assessment for exams.
- d) Chinese national school regulations have in the past tended to be driven by quotas and the goal of schooling is very academic and expertise-oriented.
- e) Directives from the (Chinese) Ministry of Education on an 'import' of Chinese teachers to Tibet.
- f) Teaching methods are very teacher-centred. The teacher is always considered to have the right views and stands as a dominant symbol of a teacher's authority. The teaching method is for a large part still 'rote learning' in the manner of memorization and repetition which leaves no space for dialogue.
- g) The Chinese national curriculum does not fully consider the aspects of Tibetan culture. The curriculum is regarded as irrelevant and to, some extent, useless by Tibetan parents – indeed, seen as indoctrinating Chinese nationalism and patriotism.
- h) Awareness of a potential tension between the international concept of *quality education* and *child-centred learning* in relation to Chinese

education/schooling policies and a Tibetan comprehension of education/schooling. Awareness that an approach to emphasize an international *child-centred learning* concept, which considers Tibetan language and cultural values, could be interpreted as being unpatriotic by the Chinese authorities.

Competence is required to

- improve the quality of education and teaching quality;
- improve rural teachers' education so that the Tibetans teachers will have the opportunity to upgrade their qualifications and keep their jobs;
- improve the dialogue and communication between parents and teachers on the community level;
- improve the learning environment;
- improve access to schools;
- improve the relevance of the education offered (curriculum);
- bridge the field between the state and the individual.

Another important factor is how Tibetan Buddhism is presented by the Chinese government as a major cause of educational and economic backwardness in Tibet. Causes of low self-esteem amongst Tibetan children might not only be based on a Buddhist ideological impact of emphasizing a modest and humble attitude, but could also be a result of the impact of the Chinese state categorizing Tibetans as a 'backward minority people'. Although traditional religious learning in Tibet is mainly based on simple methodology of 'root-learning', it still should be noted that education in higher Buddhist philosophy actually encourages students to involve themselves in critical thinking and analysis. In this respect, traditional ways of religious learning in Tibet, such as the Buddhist philosophical debate, can, to some extent, be seen as consistent with the ideological direction of modern pedagogy and methodology for learning.

As stressed by Bass the Chinese government persistently refuses to recognize the educational function of the monasteries in Tibet, and 'since the resurgence of national unrest in 1987, in which monks and nuns have played leading roles, the monasteries have been the focus of increasingly negative government propaganda'. This kind of campaign against the Buddhist monasteries serves to give the public view that Tibetan resistance to modern education is due to religious traditions. The issue of Buddhism became the focus of the 'Fifth TAR Conference on Education' in 1994, after which a new trend came about in the

official media of linking Tibetan Buddhism with poor educational attainments. (Bass 1998: 103)

Cheng writes that there are cultural implications of change in the Chinese society, as the educational reforms and their consequences have serious implications for values in education. With the changed funding situation, i.e. the introduction of a fee for higher education, the actual control of the state over the institution has diminished, and this change of role of the state to individuals is significant. Reforms in education and indeed in society, have increased the sense of the market in education, and hence have developed among students 'the sense of choice'. Fee charging, especially in higher education, 'has forced parents to apply an economic analysis to their children's schooling, that is, in addition to working hard, parents have to worry about whether or not they can afford university studies, even if their children obtain high scores in the examinations'. Teachers' education and training has become popular since these institutions do not charge fees. 'In rural areas in general and in poorer provinces, there have been reports that it has become increasingly difficult to retain students who intend to drop out, since parents are no longer sure of the returns from schooling'. (Cheng 2001: 252–254)

Tibetan parents complain that the school curriculum is too oriented towards Chinese patriotism and socialist ideologies, which they find to be of little relevance for Tibetan children living in Tibet. This factor can make parents reluctant of sending their children to school. Tibetan children find very little references to their own cultural background in the national school materials on culture or history and accounts of Tibetan history are often modified. It is important that the Tibetan children can find references and contents, which can make them feel proud of their culture. Due to political sensitivity it is a difficult task to change the contents of the compulsory national school curriculum in primary schools in Tibet. As presently conceived, developing aid in Tibet is unlikely to succeed in accomplishing a rapid change in the school curriculum and a long-term perspective is needed.

ISSUES OF ACCESS AND PARTICIPATION

The closing of village schools and their transformation into 'key-schools' can have serious implications for children living in the rural areas of Tibet. With educated teachers the quality of the teaching in these larger schools might improve considerably, but it is likely that many Tibetan parents will hesitate to send their children to a boarding

school, especially their young daughters. If parents feel uncertain of their children's well-being and the contents and usefulness of the lessons taught in school, they might choose to keep the children at home to do domestic work and pay the official fine for not sending their children to school. The Tibetan community needs to be educated if it is to participate actively in any decision-making and possible future economic development in Tibet. As stressed by Upton (1999) a future Tibetan elite will be 'those individuals who are capable of functioning in both a Chinese and a Tibetan social context. These students remain tied to their cultural roots through their educational focus on the Tibetan language, yet they are also introduced to a broader state-oriented culture through the standardized curriculum'. (Upton 1999: 306)

In order for the Tibetan written language to survive today, it must be taught in schools, as well as used in official and day-to-day communication. The role of education in promoting or undermining a Tibetan identity thus depends largely on whether or not students are given the opportunity to learn Tibetan at school. Young points out that proficiency in several languages is possible for children to learn, but 'given the situation in rural areas, it would be more realistic first to concentrate on making the few years that most Tibetans spend in school as productive, useful and relevant as possible'. Also the methods used to deliver education in the classroom are crucial. It is important that children learn both independent learning and individual initiative, as well as the ability to co-operate in groups, i.e. issues of teaching methods, classroom relationships and, indeed, themes from the local community and world outside. (Young 2001a)

ISSUES OF POLICY AND PRACTICE FOR TEACHERS' EDUCATION

In the 10th Five-Year Plan (2001–2005) for the TAR, it is expected that teachers will be recruited from China to take part in developing education in Tibet. This planned strategy might not work out well in Tibet, because – as Young notes – 'if the education authorities succeed in expanding the curriculum and the proportion of fully qualified teachers, it will almost certainly still be necessary to re-examine the implicit assumption that more education and more educated teachers naturally equate with better quality of education' (ibid.: 12). According to TIN, the implementation of a large recruitment of native Chinese teachers supports reports from Tibet, which indicates that Chinese is now being used as a teaching medium in a number of

primary schools near Lhasa. It has been planned to increase its use throughout the region with the implication that Chinese is becoming the main medium of instruction in schools in the Tibet Autonomous Region. The main teaching medium in middle schools is already standard Chinese (*putonghua*). Tibetan teachers who teach subjects such as English and mathematics through the medium of the Tibetan language are now seriously concerned about their future job security and prospects. (TIN 2002: 69)

APPLYING CHINESE EDUCATIONAL POLICIES IN TIBET

The educational attainments of Tibetans are still among the lowest in China. During the last decades the Chinese government has invested larger amounts of money and resources into the school system in the TAR than in any other part of China. Still, there is an estimate of 850,000 (32.5%) illiterate persons in the Tibet Autonomous Region out of the 2,320,000 who are above the age of six years (out of a total population of 2,620,000 in 2000). This is the highest rate of illiteracy in all of China's provinces and the official figures are probably too low.

The internal population flow of people in the PRC is enormous and steadily increasing. Many people search for employment and economic luck in the western regions of China. TIN recounts that official Chinese sources expect the population of Lhasa's urban area to more than double in the 15-year period ending 2005. Such an expansion should be seen in the light of unofficial reports from Tibet which indicate that the current (2002) population of Lhasa's inner city is at least 70 per cent Chinese. (TIN 2002: 30)

Young refers that 'since the mid-1980s, Tibetan children with the highest exam scores at the end of grade 9 have been offered state scholarship to complete their high school and, if they qualify, tertiary studies in other provinces'. This policy practice can result in a cultural uprooting of the selected children who are sent to boarding schools in mainland China. On a political level it can be seen as an official attempt to train a local elite who will be positively focussed towards future Chinese national policies (Young 2001a). These preferential policies have been introduced to give minority students easier access to higher education. However, the children of the increasing Han Chinese population flowing into Lhasa take up places in schools and compete with Tibetan students for higher education. Although the quota system is intended for Tibetans, it is also used by the children of Han Chinese emigrants residing in Tibet, mainly in Lhasa.

Reader's copy

Even though changing policies and laws dictated from Beijing officially consider Tibetan language as a medium of instruction in schools, on a practical level there is not much need for proficiency in literary Tibetan in the public sphere. Therefore Tibetans are obliged to study within the standard national Chinese educational system, to learn Chinese and work their way up through the system. With a school curriculum taught in Chinese, Tibetan students are disadvantaged from their Han Chinese schoolmates, as this gives them less time to learn and write Tibetan, not to mention English.

Cheng points out: 'When individuals are expected to make decisions independently of the state, they become experienced decisions makers and it is individual decision making that forms the very basis of the democracy that prevails in the international community' (Cheng 2001: 255). An updated and modern Chinese approach of education, which sees quality skills as a tool for promoting interpersonal innovation, could therefore prove essential in the development of a modern society. To introduce a policy of '*child-centred schools*' and '*quality teaching*' (from an international perspective) could help to bridge the field between the state and the individual. The use of '*quality education*' as seen from an international perspective encourages children to think critically, ask questions and express their opinions. It encourages participation, creativity, self-esteem and psycho-social well-being. This kind of result could help to convince parents that schooling and education for Tibetan children is necessary in order to be able to change the system from within.

Development agencies working in Tibet should be aware of eventual, unwanted effects of supporting the present education system in Tibet if it threatens rather than safeguards and promotes Tibetan cultural values. It is also necessary to pay attention to whether the educational system, which development agencies attempt to support with the goal of safeguarding Tibetan culture, ultimately leads its students to an assimilation with Chinese culture and political beliefs. An international NGO points out that education quality supports the personal development of the child, and therefore concludes that 'education is not only about *what* children learn, but *how* children learn' (SC[UK]). The issue of schooling in Tibet is not as simple as that, because at present, Tibetans in Tibet have little influence on the content of the national school curriculum. Development agencies working with schooling projects are obliged to compromise with this fact. It can be tempting to believe that the goal of teaching Tibetan children to engage in independent critical thinking will justify any compromise which accepting the Chinese national school curriculum makes necessary.

Given the present political circumstances in Tibet, such a compromise can be difficult to avoid, and quality education seen in an international perspective is indeed a useful and meaningful tool. This kind of teaching methodology and pedagogy is likely to encourage more children go to school and it is of course crucial that all Tibetan children must attend school. However, a long-term perspective on schooling in Tibet must urgently focus on the contents of the teaching; the issue is not just *that* children do learn in school, but also *what* they learn.

**SELECTED REFERENCES, IMPLICATIONS FOR
EDUCATIONAL PROJECTS IN TIBET**

- Badeng Nima (2001). 'Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from Chinese [Guan yu xizang de shuangyu jiaoyu wenti].
- Bass, Catriona (1998). *Education in Tibet: Policy and Practice since 1950*. Tibet Information Network & Zed Books, London & New York. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/education.htm>
- Cheng, Kai-ming (1999). 'Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century' (a synopsis) (People's Republic of China). Proposed by the Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998, and endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm
- (2001). 'Changing cultures and schools in the People's Republic of China: tradition, the market and educational change'. In Jo Cairns, Denis Lawton and Roy Gardner (eds), *World Yearbook of Education 2001. Values, Culture and Education*, pp. 242–257. Kogan Page, London.
- Goldstein, Melvyn C. (1989). *A History of Modern Tibet, 1913–1951. The Demise of the Lamaist State*. University of California Press, Berkeley.
- Labiesse, Christiane (1995). 'The paradox of Tibetan education in exile'. *Tibetan Review*. August, vol. 30: no. 8, pp. 12–13.
- Perdue, Daniel (1976). *Introductory Debate in Tibetan Buddhism*. Buddhist Studies Program, University of Virginia. Library of Tibetan Works & Archives, Dharamsala, India.

SC(UK) Save the Children UK. *Education programmes and policies*. Retrieved in December 2002 from

<http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

TIN (Tibet Information Network) (2002). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 30, 2001*. Tibet Information Network, London.

<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra30.htm>

UNICEF (2002b). *The Global Agenda for Children: Learning for the 21st Century*. A report by Shaeffer, S., A. Dykstra, J. Irvine, M.J. Pigozzi and R.M. Torres, Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>

Upton, Janet L. (1999). 'The Development of Modern School-Based Tibetan Language Education in the PRC'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 281–340. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Young, Nick (2001a). 'Bringing quality down to the basics'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 7–12.

<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369>

—— (2001b) 'Exam system is weakest link in quality chain'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 13–17.

<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371>

Reader's copy

Reader's copy

Part II: Bibliography

Reader's copy

Chapter 7

An Annotated Bibliography of Key Publications

All book descriptions are my own, unless otherwise stated. Authors' descriptions are not necessarily reproduced in full, but maybe paraphrased or even corrected.

Anderson, Barbara A., Cheong-Seok Kim, John H. Romani, John W. Traphagan, and Jinyun Liu (1999). *The Effect of Elderly Household Members on School Enrollment of Children in Tibet*. PSC Research Report No. 99-438. Population Studies Centre, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.psc.isr.umich.edu/pubs/abs.shtml?ID=33860>

Authors' description: The thesis deals with the effect of the presence of an elderly person (age 60 or older) on the chance that a 10- to 14-year-old Tibetan child in Tibet in 1995 attends school. Tibet in 1995 is at a very low development level, with only 40% of Tibetan children aged 10-14 in school; 48% of boys and 32% of girls. Extended families in Tibet are common; 88% of those age 60 or older live in vertically extended families. However, due to the steepness of the age structure, only 38% of children age 10-14 live in a household that includes a person aged 60 or above. Being a boy, having a literate adult in the household, living in an urban area, and living in a place with relatively high availability of schooling are positive factors for school attendance. Living in an agricultural household or in a family engaged in animal husbandry (pastoral nomads) is related to less chance of being in school. For both girls and boys, the more brothers a child has, the less likely that child is to go to school. But the more sisters a girl has, the less likely is school enrollment, while for boys it is the opposite: the more sisters, the more likely is school enrollment.

Baden Nima (1997). 'The Way Out for Tibetan Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July-August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 7-20. First published in Chinese [Zangzu jiaoyu de chulu] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 3, pp. 44-50.

The article emphasizes the importance of traditional Tibetan education. The author cites problems in the current state educational system, i.e. an inability to conform to the realities of social developments in Tibetan regions, and an inability to adapt to the cultural background of Tibet. He points out how Tibetan students and parents lack confidence in state schooling and that there is a dislocation of the teaching contents of school experience from the cognitive experience of Tibetan children.

Badeng Nima (2001). 'Problems Related to Bilingual Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 91–102. Translated from Chinese [Guan yu xizang de shuangyu jiaoyu wenti].

The article discusses the basic situation of school education and analyses how Tibetan people perceive language teaching in Tibetan schools, the problem within the Tibetan language, and the content of the curriculum within the Tibetan school system. The author argues that the content of the curriculum should be improved based on the needs of the Tibetan society, and that Tibetan is the most suitable language for Tibetan children in schools. Tibetan children must study Chinese in order to understand the country. It is important that Tibetan children do not only understand their traditional culture but also gain knowledge from the useful aspects of modern culture and society.

Bangsbo, Ellen (2000). 'Tibetans in Exile: Monastic and Secular Education of Monks in Nepal'. *NIASnytt. Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 3, October, pp. 4–7.

The article deals with the schooling of Tibetan refugees and Nepalese ethnic Tibetans in Kathmandu. The article narrates how a Tibetan monastery in Nepal has established its own secular school, which its monks and nuns (from an affiliated nunnery) attend together with lay children of both sexes. The majority of the monks and nuns in the school are Nepalese ethnic Tibetans from the northern border regions of Nepal; most Tibetan refugee parents no longer regard the monastic training as prosperous and prefer secular schooling for their children.

Barnett, Robert and Shirin Akiner (eds) (1994). *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*. Hurst & Company, London.

The book describes the character of the struggle and survival of Tibet as an evolving, contemporary society under Chinese Communism and confronting modernity. Principal themes are the search for identity, ethnicity, nationalism and the course of political protest since 1987. Co-authors include Tibetans and Chinese as well as Western experts.

Bass, Catriona (1998). *Education in Tibet: Policy and Practice since 1950*. Tibet Information Network & Zed Books, London & New York. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/education.htm>

Description (TIN): This work provides a comprehensive overview of education provision and policy in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) during the half century since China asserted control over the region. Catriona Bass sets her modern history of education in the TAR against the wider context of the political and educational shifts, which have taken place in China since the Communist Party came to power in 1949. She presents the best information available about each educational sector, focusing on access, funding, quality of provision, the little known role of the monasteries in education, and the controversial issue of the medium of instruction. She draws on first-hand observation, interviews with Tibetan refugees and educationalists in China and Tibet, and official sources in both Chinese and Tibetan. Some of the statistical data presented here has not been made available outside China before.

—— (1999). 'Shifting Priorities'. *China Review*. Autumn/Winter, 1999, vol. 14, pp. 23–25

Since 1950, education policies in the TAR have at times led to improvements in the education of Tibetans and at other times greatly disadvantaged them. The combination of the policies made in the interest of rapid economic development can hinder the participation of the Tibetan community in the future economic development of the TAR.

Blachford, Dongyan Ru (2000). *Language Planning and Bilingual Education for Linguistic Minorities in China: A case study of the policy formulation and implementation process*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Toronto. UMI Pub No: NQ41009, 1999. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.lib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/NQ41009>

Author's description: In this study, the issues of minority language policy and planning in contemporary China (1949–present) are pursued within a theoretical framework derived from three related areas of research: language planning, educational policy studies, and bilingual education. The aim is to achieve an understanding of the nature and the characteristics of Communist language policies and their impact on the life and education of over 90 million people. They are labelled as the Chinese national minorities consisting of 55 ethnic groups with extremely diversified languages and cultures. Employing the combined methods of documentary reviews, intensive interviews, and field observations, a series of case studies are conducted through research at various levels from the Centre (Beijing), to the region/province (Xinjiang and Gansu), and the local (prefectures, counties, and schools). Several minority groups (the Uygur, Kazak, Xibo, Yi, Dai, and Tibetan) and their languages and education situations are examined closely. The study seeks to contribute to empirical and conceptual knowledge on international studies of minority language policy, planning, education, and social change. It also provides an insight into current research in the fields of bilingual education, language planning and educational policy studies.

Burman, Beena Roy (1977). 'Cadre Education in Tibet'. *China Report*. Vol. 13: no. 1, pp. 11–15.

An account of the cadre education of Tibetans from 1951 to 1977 when Tibetan boys were sent to China for cadre schooling against the wish of their parents. The students received not only secular but also political education. Some students thereafter started questioning customs of the traditional society, which led to arguments with their parents. The author concludes that some of the educated Tibetan cadres became politically conscious of their national identity and not supportive of Marxist-Leninist viewpoints as was the (Chinese) purpose of their training.

Cai Dan (1997). 'A Cursory Analysis of the Special Problems in Nationality Education in the Ali District'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. September–October, vol. 30: no. 5, pp. 81–91. First published in Chinese [Ali diqu minzu jiaoyu teshu wenti qian xi] in *Zhongguo bianjiang minzu jiaoyu* [Nationality education in China's border regions]. Nationalities Institute Printing House, Beijing, 1989, pp. 417–423.

The author deals with the border areas of Tibet. The remote position, rugged geography, and scattered population of the region place special demands on the schools. The article notes the lack of qualified teachers, especially Tibetan teachers. Since the population in these areas has so little contact with Han Chinese speakers, it is necessary to have Tibetan teachers (or other teachers fluent in Tibetan) who can teach all subjects including science and mathematics in Tibetan.

CERNET (China Education and Research Network). *Education for Ethnic Minorities*,
<http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/education/ethnicedu/index.shtml>

Chen Lipeng (1999). 'On the "Law on Ethnic Minority Education"'. *Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education*. September–October, vol. 32: no. 5, pp. 7–19. First published in Chinese [Lun shaoshu minzu jiaoyu fa] in *Minzu jiaoyu yanjiu* [Studies on ethnic education], 1997: no. 3, pp. 20–24.

The author outlines what the Ethnic Minority Law – China's basic law for ethnic minority education – might look like and conducts a preliminary exploration of this matter.

Chen Yunpu and Huang Yunbin (1997). 'A Summary of Technical Secondary School Recruitment in 1994'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 94–102. First published in Chinese as [1994 nian zhongzhuan zhaosheng zongshu] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet], 1995: no. 2, pp. 43–46.

Based on a statistical analysis the authors sum up the basic situation and implementations of technical secondary schools in the Tibetan region.

Cheng, Kai-ming (1999). *Action Plan for Vitalizing Education for the 21st Century* A synopsis (People's Republic of China). Proposed by the Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998, and endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999. Centre of Research on Education in China, University of Hong Kong. Retrieved January 2003 from
http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm

- (2001). 'Changing cultures and schools in the People's Republic of China: tradition, the market and educational change'. In Jo Cairns, Denis Lawton and Roy Gardner (eds), *World Yearbook of Education 2001. Values, Culture and Education*, pp. 242–257. Kogan Page, London.

In China education is (and was) seen as the means to achieve social success and mobility. The author sums up the educational reforms in China and points to the significance in contemporary reforms on how the change of role of the state to individuals and reforms in education have increased the sense of the market in education, which has developed a sense of educational choice amongst students. The author suggests that education could be used as a window or thermometer to understand the dramatic cultural changes in China.

- Chhodak, Tenzing (1981). *Education of Tibetan Refugees: Characteristics and Conditions of Learning Environments in Selected Tibetan Schools in India*. EDD, University of Massachusetts. DAI 41,12A. UM 8110317. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/8110317>

Author's description: The purpose of the study was to assess the curriculum and instructional conditions in selected Tibetan refugee schools in India. To this end, a set of the educational objectives for Tibetan schools was generated and defined. Next, the existing curriculum and instructional conditions in sampled schools were described. Finally, the researcher examined how well these objectives were being met in the schools for Tibetan refugees. Specifically, four research objectives guided the study: (1) To establish institutional objectives for Tibetan schools in India; (2) To identify general curricular conditions in Tibetan schools; (3) To determine the extent to which the schools are presently reaching the establishing objectives; (4) To present recommendations for curriculum and instructional improvement and for change in administration.

- China Development Brief (2001). Plans and targets: the official agenda for 'quality education'. Vol. IV: no. 2. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org>
<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=372>

The article sums up statistical data, goals and achievements on education in contemporary China. Future official targets are mentioned with regard to literacy, assistance to poor areas, marginalized children, early childhood education, senior high schools and

universities, teacher training, 'quality education', information technology, and finance.

China Education News, CREC, September 19, 2000.

Chinese Government Homepage,

<http://www1.cei.gov.cn/govinfo/english/default1e.shtml>

Chinese Government White Papers, Retrieved June 2002 from

<http://test.china.org.cn/e-white/>

- Central Committee Proposal for Formulating 10th Five-Year Plan (2001–2005), <http://www.china.org.cn/e-15/15-3-g-2.htm>

- *The Development of Tibetan Culture*. Beijing, June 2000.

<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/2/index.htm>

On the use of spoken and written Tibetan language, preservation of ancient books, folk customs, culture and art, education and news broadcasting.

- *National Minorities Policy and Its Practice in China*. Beijing, June 2000.

<http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/4/index.htm>

On adherence to equality and unity among ethnic groups, regional autonomy, preservation and development of the cultures of ethnic minorities.

- *New Progress in Human Rights in the Tibet Autonomous Region*. Beijing, February 1998. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/last/index.htm>

On the ethnic regional autonomy system and the people's political rights, economic development and the rights to education, culture, health protection and freedom of religious belief.

- *Progress in China's Human Rights Cause in 2000*, <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/2000renquan/index.htm>

- *The Situation of Children in China*. Beijing, April 1996.

On children's rights, education, protection for disabled, and welfare home for children. No specific remarks on Tibet.

- *Tibet's March toward Modernization*. Beijing, November 2001, <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/20011108/index.htm>

On social development and modernization achievements in Tibet – economy, urbanization, environmental, education, culture, peoples quality of life – all depending on the Motherland.

- *Tibet – Its Ownership and Human Rights Situation*. Beijing, September 1992. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/tibet/index.htm>

On the historical relations between Tibet and China, Tibetan independence, the Dalai Lama and old Tibet, freedom and political rights, development of education, health and culture. Special state aid for Tibet's development.

China Perspectives (2001). Special Issue – Education in China. July–August, no. 36.

Articles on education challenges, initial training and economic development, educational diversity, privatization of education, migrant workers and evening schools, and vocational training.

Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China. 2001, March–April, vol. 34: no. 2.

The journal provides an introduction to some of the thinking on the subject on how state schooling permits minority languages to be used in the learning process in ethnic communities. The articles that appear in this issue aim to provide a scholar's view of bilingual education of ethnic minorities. Contents: a history of bilingual education in China; articles on the characteristics of bilingual education; an analysis of the relevance of the official policies; the problems of bilingual education among the Tibetans.

Chinese Education and Society. Laws and Regulations on Ethnic Minority Education. 1999, September–October, vol. 32: no. 5.

Articles by Chinese authors on the Law on ethnic minority education. Opinions concerning vocational-technical education for ethnic minorities by the State Education Commission. Comments on ethnic education by the State Education Commission, the State Nationalities Affairs Commission, General Office of the State Education Commission.

Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I). 1997, July–August, vol. 30: no. 4.

Articles (mainly Chinese authors) on different levels of schooling – elementary, secondary, vocational/technical, and adult education. Articles on forecasting formulas to study the scale and development of basic education in Tibet. Examination of vocational and technical education, research on recruitment of students to upper secondary technical schools, and a discussion on aims of adult education.

Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II). 1997, September–October, vol. 30: no. 5.

The journal aims to focus on different regions (urban and rural, Lhasa and inside the TAR, and western Sichuan Province), and on education of Tibetan students sent to urban schools in mainland China. The articles are written by Chinese scholars and were originally published in Chinese journals.

Ciren, Baima (Padma-tshe-ring) (1997). 'Reflections on the Work of Tibetan-Language Instruction'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. No. 30: no. 4, July–Aug, pp. 49–59. First published in Chinese [Dui zangyuwen shouke gongzuo de sikao] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 2, pp. 35–40.

A Tibetan scholar in Tibet writes on the importance of using Tibetan as a medium of instruction in schools, as minority laws support this and as many Tibetan children do not understand Chinese. There is a need for building up a bilingual teacher capacity and gradually, a teaching system in which Tibetan is the chief language used for instruction.

Clarke, Graham E. (1992). 'Research Design in the Use of China's Census and Survey Data for Rural Areas and Households'. In E.B. Vermeer (ed.). *From Peasant to Entrepreneur: Growth and Change in Rural China*, pp. 217–240. Wageningen, Pudoc.

The article challenges the institutional factors in the collection of statistics in China. Procedure used at the local level can inform us about types of survey errors, and the advantages and limitations in the use of the extant statistical data have to be examined. The account brings in data from Tibet and Hebei Province and considers the relative merits of survey and case-study research in China.

- (1994). ‘The Movement of Population to the West of China: Tibet and Qinghai’. In Judith M. Brown and Rosemary Foot (eds). *Migration: The Asian Experience*, pp. 221–257. St. Martin’s Press, Oxford.

The article gives a descriptive and historical account of population movements in Tibetan areas, in particular in the present Tibet Autonomous Region and Qinghai. It covers related demographic, ethnic, political and economic issues, and in particular concerns the linkage of local communities to wider, dominant, state structures. This information is based on material from four seasons of field research (1986, 1990, 1991, 1992), the 1989 census data, and secondary sources on the demographic distribution of ethnic groups, in particular Tibetans, in western China and Tibet.

- Conner, Victoria and Robert Barnett (1997). *Leaders in Tibet: A Directory*. TIN Background Briefing Paper no. 28. Tibet Information Network, London.

The Directory draws together the names of some of the leading officials in Tibetan inhabited areas of the PRC. The names are selected from lists of leading officials in the government, as well as from the membership list of three main institutions in China: The Communist Party, The People’s Congress, and The Chinese Peoples’ Political Consultative Conference. The lists include leading Chinese and Tibetan officials in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and prominent Tibetan cadres and officials from Sichuan, Gansu, Qinghai and Yunnan. <http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/bbp28.htm>

- Dawa Norbu (1994). ‘Motivational crisis in Tibetan education system: some personal reflections’. *Tibetan Review*. May, vol. 29: no. 5, pp. 13–14.

Dawa Norbu writes that motivation to study is sadly lacking amongst the present-day Tibetan students (in exile) and that it is a popular misconception of parents that the education of their children is best taken care of by simply sending them to boarding schools. The role of parents is important in the process of education in terms of guiding, encouraging and, above all, motivating their children to learn more. Also, one of the pragmatic reasons for the lack of scholastic achievements among the Tibetan students is the fact that their ambitions are blocked by the lack of employment opportunities.

Department of Planning, Ministry of Education (1984). *Achievement of Education in China. Statistics 1949–1983*, Department of Planning, Ministry of Education, PRC. Renmin Jiaoyu Chubanshe, Beijing. (In English and Chinese).

Dhondup, K. (1984). 'The Thirteenth Dalai Lama's Experiment in Modern Education'. *The Tibet Journal*. Vol. 9: no. 3, pp. 38–59.

A narrative of the Tibetan experiment of sending four young Tibetans from Lhasa to be educated in England in 1912. After seven years of study the chosen men returned to Lhasa where they – due to the conservative and suspicious Lhasa bureaucracy – had no chance of using their achieved modern education. The first Tibetan experiment in modern education failed mainly because the Lhasa government often interfered with the regular routine of the students in England, and because the students were chosen at random. Also modern education faced opposition from traditional conservative groups amongst the clergy and the aristocrats. After the death of the 13th Dalai Lama nobody bothered to consider whether the modern education attained by the students were of any use to Tibet.

Dorjee, Tashi (1977). 'Education in Tibet'. *The Tibet Journal*. Vol. 2: no. 4, pp. 31–37.

A description of Tibet's (traditional) educational system classified under the following divisions: Tze (Peak School), a school for the monk-cadre employees of the government, selected from different monasteries on the basis of intelligence and physical appearance; Yig-tsang (Ecclesiastical School), for graduates of the Tze school who are to take administrative posts; Tzi-tr'ug-pa, a school for lay officials to enter administrative posts; Chag-po-ri (Medical Centre), admission for monk students only; Ae-pa-k'ang (Medical and Astrological center), admission for both lay men and women; and the private schools of Lhasa.

Dwyer, Arienne M. (1998). 'The Texture of Tongues: Language and Power in China'. In William Safran (ed.), *Nationalism and Ethnoregional Identities in China*. University of Colorado, Boulder. Frank Cass, London.

Author's description: Mandarin stands at the pinnacle of a metalinguistic hierarchy, which mirrors the vertical basis of power in China today. State language policies have established official minority languages

and Chinese ‘dialects’ under the arching umbrella of the Chinese state; yet their domain is strictly constrained through prescriptive standardization. The tension between this codifying imperative and the dynamic force of speaker identity is examined through the expressions of power through language use, inviting a re-examination of assumptions about the static texture of language in a multilingual society.

ECTAR. (1997). Education Commission of the Tibet Autonomous Region and the Leading Group for Tibetan-Language Instruction of the Regional Education Commission. ‘Summary of Pilot Project Work in Middle-School Tibetan-Language Instruction’. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 41–48. First published in Chinese [Zhongxue zangyuwen shouke shidian gongzuo zongjie] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet] 1995: no. 5, pp. 3–6.

An account of a pilot project on Tibetan-language instruction in middle-schools begun by the Education and Science Commission in 1989 in four districts: Lhasa Municipality (middle-school no. 1+2), Shannan (Lko-kha) Prefecture, and Shigatze Prefecture. The Commission recommends education in patriotism, socialism, and collectivism, and especially to education directed at upholding the motherland’s unity and opposing the separatist activities of the Dalai clique. The commission considers the pilot project to be successful, as 129 of the 161 primary school graduates became Communist Youth League members.

Goldstein, Melvyn C. (1989). *A History of Modern Tibet, 1913–1951. The Demise of the Lamaist State*. University of California Press, Berkeley.

An extensive account of historical and political events in Tibet from 1913, at the time of the return of the 13th Dalai Lama from exile in India, till 1951 when the Tibetan government, under the authority of the sixteen-year-old 14th Dalai Lama signed the Seventeen Point Agreement. The book is based on interviews and discussions with former Tibetan officials and others involved in particular historical events, first-hand accounts (written in Tibetan, Chinese, and English) by former Tibetan, Indian, and Chinese officials; the extensive diplomatic and political archival records of the British Government of India, the United Kingdom, and the United States; and newspapers, books, and articles, some of which include primary political materials.

Goldstein-Kyaga, Katrin (1993). *The Tibetans – School for Survival or Submission: An Investigation of Ethnicity and Education*. HLS Förlag, Stockholm.

The thesis investigates if there is a link between Tibetan ethnicity and education and, if so, how it functions. More specifically, the aim was to find out if the educational achievements of Tibetans in Tibet, India and Switzerland differ, and how those differences can be attributed to their positions as an ethnic group in these countries. The study shows that the achievements of Tibetans in education differ in these countries. The author concludes that there is a link between ethnicity and education; and even if cultural and social factors have some impact on the educational achievements of the Tibetans, the main reason for the differences is the ethnic context in which Tibetans are living. The general conclusion is that the outcome of education for an ethnic group largely depends on the degree of its control over the institutions of education and political power.

Hansen, Mette Halskov (1999). *Lessons in Being Chinese. Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Two very different ethnic minority communities – the Naxi of the Lijiang area in northern Yunnan and the Tai (Dai) of Sipsong Panna (Xishuangbanna), along Yunnan's border with Burma and Laos – are featured in this comparative study of the implementation and reception of state minority education policy in the PRC. Based on field research and historical sources, Hansen argues that state policy, which is intended to be applied uniformly across all minority regions, in fact is much more successful in some than in others.

— (2000). 'Chinese Minority Education: State Policy, International Organizations and Local Responses'. *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 4, pp. 12–16.

While economic reforms have produced an unprecedented increase in average living standards, length of education and number of high quality schools, the poor western areas have often remained caught in poverty that has often been an impediment to the further development of education.

Harrell, Stevan (2002). *Ways of Being Ethnic in Southwest China. Studies on Ethnic Groups in China*. University of Washington Press, Washington.

Author's description: Drawing on extensive fieldwork conducted in the 1980s and 1990s in southern Sichuan, the study examines the nature of ethnic consciousness and ethnic relations among local communities, focusing on the Nuosu (classified as YI [ethnic group] by the Chinese government), Prmi, Naze, and Han. It argues that even within the same regional social system, ethnic identity is formulated, perceived, and promoted differently by different communities at different times. The heart of the book consists of detailed case studies of three Nuosu village communities, along with studies of Prmi and Naze communities, smaller groups such as the Yala and Nasu, and Han Chinese who live in minority areas. These are followed by a synthesis that compares different configurations of ethnic identity in different communities and discusses the implications of these examples for our understanding of ethnicity and for the near future of China.

Hayhoe, Ruth (ed.) (1992). *Education and Modernization. The Chinese Experience*. The Comparative and International Education Series. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

This collection of essays on Chinese education combines historical perspectives with the thematic analysis of a range of contemporary issues. One key issue is modernity and modernization in comparative education. The book considers the importance of 'modernization', weighing its meaning for the Chinese concept in chapters on: historical perspectives on education and modernization; the formal and nonformal system of education; and issues and groups in education and modernization.

Hayhoe, Ruth and Julia Pan (eds) (1996). *East-West Dialogue in Knowledge and Higher Education*. M.E. Sharpe, Armonk, New York and London.

The book provides a dialogue on alternative approaches to knowledge and higher education characteristic of the Western university. Western and Chinese scholars approach these issues from the viewpoint of the challenges facing the university and eastern contributors explore parallel issues in their societies. The book brings together a set of essays on cultural interchange and the construction of knowledge; the media and higher education; higher education evaluation; historical challenges to the university; and indigenous knowledge and contemporary higher education.

Reader's copy

ICLT (International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet now Tibet Justice Center, TJC) (2001). *A Generation in Peril. The Lives of Tibetan Children Under Chinese Rule*. A Report by the International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet, Berkeley. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>

This report by the International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet (now Tibet Justice Center) investigates the degree to which the Chinese government respects and promotes Tibetan children's human rights in three areas: detention, torture and other maltreatment by state actors; education; and healthcare and nutrition. The report describes the impact of Chinese rule on Tibetan children from a human rights perspective.

Johnson, Bonnie and Nalini Chhetri (2000). 'Exclusionary Policies and Practices in Chinese Minority Education: The Case of Tibetan Education'. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*. On-line Journal from Teachers College, Columbia University. Vol. 2: no. 2. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/index.htm>
<http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/articles/bjnc122.htm>

This paper examines how the government of the People's Republic of China modifies its educational policies to achieve separate and distinct regional objectives, which are linked to regional and ethnic differences. These policies often result in exclusionary practices. Using the case of Tibet, this paper illustrates the dichotomy of Chinese educational policy: how to achieve universal education for all students and at the same time contain regional ethnic resistance against the communist government and maintain national unity.

Keary, Lisa Shawn (1999). *Terrain of Struggle: The Tibetan Nation and the Chinese State*. Ph.D. diss. in Philosophy of Education, Columbia University. DAI-A 1999: 60, 6, Dec. 1958. UMI Pub No: 9930737. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations>
<http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/9930737>

Author's description: This is a study in the politics of education in which state elites attempt to establish political integration by transmitting ideologies of nationhood and national identity via the school system. In some countries, the national identity transmitted by state elites may result in disintegrative rather than integrative effects. Educational

Reader's copy

theorists have argued that weak state structures, colonial legacies, and economic inequalities, are some of the factors that may inhibit education from achieving national integration. Few theorists, however, have suggested that pre-existing national identities may circumscribe the ability of education to serve as a viable integrating and consolidating agent. This study argues that in order to understand why the Chinese government has been unsuccessful in integrating Tibet into China, one needs to move beyond the prevailing literature on the development of nations, and recognize that Tibetans had a sense of nationhood and national identity prior to the Chinese takeover in 1950. The study focuses on the development of Tibetan nationhood by drawing on historical experiences, folk literature, and oral traditions, as well as religious practices and cultural symbols in creating a sense of Tibetan national consciousness. It then turns to the role of the Chinese government in trying to reshape Tibetan nationhood and identity in its efforts to incorporate Tibet into China, and examines the contestation of national identities. In this sense, the study argues for a new perspective on the Tibet Question, one which posits different yet important contributions being made from both Tibetans and Chinese to the creation of Tibet as a nation. Toward this end, the study argues that the formation of the Tibetan nation is an ongoing process, neither ceasing nor originating with the Chinese takeover, but one which has continued in response to Chinese policies. This suggests that a realistic and accurate picture of contemporary Tibet must move away from the overdrawn and simplistic analysis that Tibetan culture and national identity is on the verge of disappearing, and move to a more richly textured consideration of the complex processes occurring in the country, specifically the role of education in the evolution of Tibetan national identity.

Kipnis, Andrew (2001). 'The Disturbing Educational Discipline of 'Peasants''. *The China Journal*, July, no. 46, pp. 1–24.

Based on research in Zouping, Shandong province, the author points to that rural students study extremely hard to succeed on university exams, as a means to secure a higher education and move on to urban jobs. There is both local and official support and resistance to current reform policies regarding an implementation of 'quality education' versus traditional educational discipline. The author argues that educational reform systems should serve both those who enter university, as well as those who do not, and that exam-oriented education for high-scoring rural students does little for students who don't pursue a higher education.

Kolås, Åshild and Monika P. Thowsen (forthcoming). *On the Margins of Tibet: Cultural Survival on the Sino-Tibetan Frontier*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

A research project on Tibetan culture in the PRC based on fieldwork (five months during 1998–2000) in Diqing TAP in Yunnan, followed by additional fieldtrips to Tibetan areas in Sichuan, Gansu and Qinghai. The book presents a study of contemporary Tibetan cultural life and cultural expression in Tibetan areas bordering the TAR. The book presents information and data on the conditions for Tibetan culture, in-migration, economics policies, the development of tourism, the focus on Tibetan language education, the rebuilding of monasteries and of religious traditions.

Kormondy, Edward J. (1995). 'Observations on Minority Education, Cultural preservation and Economic Development in China'. *Compare*, Vol. 25, no. 2, pp. 161–178.

The article is based on fieldwork in 1993 at 25 schools, colleges and universities, which are primarily concerned with the education of China's minority nationalities. The article focuses on aspects of the national admission system, and the national examinations for minority students at college or university, fees and graduate academic programmes, teacher's training, cultural preservation and economic development. A specific focus is on facts and problems related to sending Tibetan students to selected 'key-schools' in major 'inland' cities such as Beijing, Chengdu and Tianjin. During the 7-year stay at school, the children are only allowed one summer vacation visit at their homes; this takes place at the end of junior middle school, after an absence from home of 4 years. Then they return for the final 3 years of high school. Fieldwork interviews with school principals indicate that the Tibetan children have cultural learning difficulties compared to Han students. Kormondy concludes that the increasing access to education and other avenues of modernization, including increased interaction with Han Chinese, will lead to a gradual loss of cultural identity in economic base, dress, cuisine, language, beliefs, music and dance for 'isolated nationalities'.

Labiesse, Christiane (1995). 'The paradox of Tibetan education in exile'. *Tibetan Review*. August, vol. 30: no. 8, pp. 12–13.

Drawing from her own field experiences, a French educationist offers suggestions for improving the schooling of Tibetans in exile in India

and Nepal. The author argues that the teaching methods and the education of Tibetans have not changed for a long time and have become obsolete. Lessons are too often too teacher-centered and teachers are too often book-centered. In addition, the Tibetan teachers and students suffer from the same poor backgrounds, and educational backwardness is often on a par with the socio-economical problems.

Liao, Hollis S. (1995). 'The Recruitment and Training of Ethnic Minority Cadres in Tibet'. *Issues and Studies*. Vol. 31: no. 12, pp. 55–67.

The paper examines Beijing's policy on the recruitment of Tibetan cadres in Tibet, the characteristics of Tibetan cadres, and their role in Beijing's Tibet policy. For more than four decades, cadres recruited from among ethnic minorities themselves have played an important role in Beijing's control of minority nationalities. Now the ratio of Tibetan to Han Chinese cadres is reported to be seven to three, and the number of Tibetan technicians and women cadres have continued to increase. Disturbances in Tibet in recent years have prompted Beijing to put more emphasis on maintaining stability in the region and leading Han Chinese cadres are transferred into Tibet. This decision is a sign of the failure of the Beijing government's effort to cultivate ethnic minority cadres in Tibet.

Lin, Jing (1997). 'Policies and Practices of Bilingual Education for the Minorities in China'. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. Vol. 18: no. 3, pp. 193–205.

The article summarizes problems for minorities in China, such as low minority status, an irrelevant centralized curriculum, a need for coordinated system of teacher training. The author concludes that bilingual education has improved the overall quality of learning and has enhanced self-confidence among the minority students, but although bilingual education in China has been promoted to improve the learning of minority students, in general it is used to facilitate their assimilation. Problems relating to the development of education for the minorities go far beyond the language issue.

Lin Junhua (Padma-tshe-ring) (1997). 'Brief Summary of the History of Evolution of School Education in the Ganzi Tibetan Region'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. Vol. 30: no. 5, September–October, pp. 7–25. First published in Chinese [Ganzi

zangqu xuexiao jiaoyu kaifashi gaisuo] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1993: no. 2, pp. 39–46.

The authors divides this narrative of school education in the Ganzi region into three parts: 1907–1911 (end of Qing Dynasty), 1912–1959 (Nationalist Republic), 1950–1990 (the Forty Years since Liberation).

MacPherson, Sonia (Seonaigh) (2000). *A path of Learning: Indo–Tibetan Buddhism as Education*. Ph.D. diss. in Education, the University of British Columbia, Canada. DAI–A 2000: 61, 5, Nov, 1731. UMI Pub No: NQ48656. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations> and <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/NQ48656>

Author's description. This study chronicles a non-modern pedagogical tradition, Indo–Tibetan (Gelugpa) Buddhist education, as it negotiates a modern, global context in exile in India. As an enlightenment tradition, Buddhism emphasizes investigative inquiry over scriptural orthodoxy and belief, making it compatible with some aspects of modern, secular culture. This is a study of the relationship between these two educational cultures within one educational institution; Dolma Ling Nunnery and Institute of Dialectics in the Indian Himalayas. The text itself is arranged in the form of a *mandala*, which is divided into five sections or stages of learning: intention, path, inference, experience, and realization. The *intention* section highlights the value of cultural and educational diversity, and includes a brief synopsis of Indo–Tibetan Buddhist educational history. The *path* section describes specific Buddhist approaches to ethnography and social research. The *inference* chapter is the empirical (ethnographic) component of the study, and considers the practice of dialectical debate as a case of what Wittgenstein called a language game. This chapter includes photographic documentation and the text of a public (Western–style) debate held at Dolma Ling on the subject of the merits of their traditional debate system. The *experience* chapter considers the unique role of direct perception (experience) in Buddhism, and how it can be educated through combined meditational and testimonial practices. The author explores the tendency to segregate experiential from rational paths, especially when liminal experiences of suffering, bliss, and death are involved. She concludes that such experiences strain our powers of reason and, in some cases, representation, resulting in a tendency to marginalize such experiences within formal, rational education systems and their knowledge bases. Narrative, poetic, and direct experiential methods of meditation are better suited to deal with these subjects. The realization chapter [*sic*] discusses conceptions of realization, praxis and embodiment, that is, rational

inferences translated into direct experience and action, as of particular relevance to educators. In the Buddhist view, such realizations are the desired end of all inquiry. This end is accomplished through creative and direct conversations; (testimonies, dialogues) between reason and direct experience on the path of learning.

Meng Xianfan, Qi Shujuan and Kan Ben (Translated by Lin Hong and revised by Su Xuetao) (1999). 'The Demand for Education Among the Tibetan People in Qinghai Province – An Investigation in Two Tibetan Communities'. *Social Sciences in China*. Autumn, vol. 20: no. 3, pp. 84–95. Originally published in Chinese in *Zhongguo shehui kexue* 1998: no. 3.

The article is based on a survey research in Haidong Prefecture and Hainan Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture during 1996 and 1997. The authors argue that no secular education system has ever developed in these prefectures, people do not identify with modern education, and modern education does not enjoy popular support. The conclusions are that family decisions are no longer based on entirely religious considerations, both farmers and herdsmen expresses great interest in developing economy and raising income, farmers have more demand for education than herdsmen, and education makes it easier for people to accept the 'mainstream' culture of the Chinese nation.

Ming Tsui and Lynne Rich (2002). 'The Only Child and Educational Opportunity for Girls in Urban China'. *Gender and Society*. February, vol. 16: no. 1, pp. 74–92.

Based on 1998–99 survey data in Wuhan, the study explores the differences between single-girl and single-boy families. It is concluded that there is no gender difference between single-girl and single-boy families related to education in modern urban China. It is suggested that this gender equality in education is an unintended consequence of the one-child-per-family policy and that under China's current social and economic conditions, girls are better off living in one-child families in the big cities of modern China, compared to conditions prior to the introduction of the one-child family policy in 1979.

Montgomery Broaded, C and Chongshun Liu (1996). 'Family Background, Gender and Educational Attainment in Urban China'. *China Quarterly*. No. 145, pp. 53–86.

A study on the factors that play a role in the distribution of junior high schools graduates in Wuhan. Having parents as members of the Chinese Communist Party helps young people to continue in school after graduation, and to gain access to key-point schools. Students make enrolment decisions based on their calculations of the relative cost and benefits of pursuing academic or vocational tracks at the high schools level. Gender differences in educational aspirations and enrolments are pronounced.

Nawang Phuntsog (Sipur) (1994). 'Tibetan-centric approach to schooling'. *Tibetan Review*. August, vol. 29: no. 8, pp. 17–20.

The greatness of a free Tibet must be grounded on the foundation upon which Tibetans are at their best – with Buddhism as the inner science for ensuring individual and world peace. The author argues that the links between Tibetan culture and Buddhism are central to the Tibetan society, and Tibetan identity and culture are complementary in nature and not mutually exclusive.

Nowak, Margaret (1978). 'The Education of Young Tibetans in India: Cultural Preservation or Agent for Change?' In Martin Brauen and Per Kvaerne (eds), *Tibetan Studies, Presented at the Seminar of Young Tibetologists*, Zurich, June 26–July 1, 1977, pp. 191–198. Völkerkunde-museum der Universität Zürich, Zürich.

A description of primary schooling for Tibetan in northern India during the 1970s. It illustrates the 'culture-sustaining' aspects of formal schooling and cultural preservation as change. Although students are made aware of Buddhism and their rich culture, they are unavoidably influenced by the Indian culture of their host country.

Paine, Lynn (1992). 'The Educational Policy Process: A Case Study of Bureaucratic Action in China'. In Kenneth G. Lieberthal and David M. Lampton (eds), *Bureaucracy, Politics, and Decision Making in Post-Mao China*, pp. 181–215. University of California Press, Berkeley.

The author argues that China's institutional environment requires much strategic action, consensus building, and, where possible, persuasion. The topic of the article deals with the complex pattern of power within the education system. Included is a formal description of the education system's bureaucratic actors, such as the State Education Commission, Ministry of Education, and the State Council. Two cases

of policy formation illustrates the grouping process, the powerful roles of the subordinates, and the variety of coping strategies involved, as well as the limits of the education sector and the subsequent need for cross-sector alliances and cooperation.

Pema Chhinjor (1984). 'Monastic Education System of Tibet'. *Tibetan Review*. December, vol. 19: no. 12, pp. 14–17.

The article explains the history and origin of the Buddhist monastic education system in Tibet. Also explained are the monastic terms of appointment and qualifications for admission, salary, discipline, methods and examination, and prospects for the monastic tradition in the modern world.

Perdue, Daniel (1976). *Introductory Debate in Tibetan Buddhism*. Buddhist Studies Program University of Virginia. Library of Tibetan Works & Archives, Dharamsala, India.

A guidebook to Tibetan Buddhist philosophical debate and an introduction to Buddhist logic and epistemology.

Petersen, Glen, Ruth Hayhoe and Yongling Lu (eds) (2001). *Education, Culture, and Identity in Twentieth-Century China*. University of Michigan Press.

A comprehensive collection on twentieth-century educational practices in China. The book seeks to understand how developments in education contributed to, and were in turn influenced by, cultural patterns and the ongoing search for identity by individuals, collectivities, and states. Its sixteen contributors explore three themes that have enlivened China studies in recent years: Sino-foreign interactions, state-society relations, and gender representation and identification.

Postiglione, Gerard A. (1992a). 'China's National Minorities and Educational Change'. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*. Vol. 22: no. 1, pp. 20–44.

Author's description: The article aims to 'provide a general background to certain issues related to equality and inequality for national minority education in China. The paper provides a context concerning the

basic situation of national minorities in China, including information on population, history, regional autonomy, government organs and policies. A review of changes since June of 1989 emphasizes the northwestern region of China. A brief overview of educational policies since 1949 is followed by a discussion and analysis of several dimensions of the equality issue as it relates to education. These include social, economic, cultural, and political factors'.

- (1992b). 'The Implications of modernization for the Education of China's National Minorities'. In Ruth Hayhoe (ed.), *Education and Modernization. The Chinese Experience*, pp. 307–336. The Comparative and International Education Series. Pergamon Press, Oxford.

The article reviews selected aspects of the current state of national minority education in China with special emphasis placed on the western regions, particularly Xinjiang and Tibet. Relevant background information is provided on basic characteristics, historical phases, data regarding admission and enrolments at various levels of the education system, levels of literacy and school attendance, financing and administration, teacher preparation, curriculum, and the language medium of instruction. The implications of socialist transformation in the Soviet Union and the republic of Mongolia are also discussed.

- (1997). 'Editor's Introduction'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 3–6.
- (ed.) (1999a). 'Introduction: State Schooling and Ethnicity in China'. In Gerard A. Postiglione, *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London, pp. 3–19.
- (ed.) (1999b). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Editor's description: The book is divided into three parts: Cultural Challenges to State Schooling: Religion and Language; Educational Disparities: Literacy Levels and Access to Higher Education; and Case Studies of Ethnic Minority Schooling: The Yi, Tai, Tibetan and Monguor. The essays examine ethnic minority education on issues related to culture, schooling, and development, including 'the degree to which ethnic groups are drawn from traditional religious institutions and toward modern schooling, the manner in which state

schooling represents ethnic cultures, the effect of state schooling on the conservation of ethnic group languages, the scope of basic education across ethnic minority regions, the results of preferential policies to admit ethnic minorities to higher education and the results of state schooling's attempt to ensure equal educational opportunities, reproduce national culture, and foster inter-ethnic unity'.

— (2001). 'Editor's Introduction'. *Chinese Education and Society. Bilingual Education in China*. March–April, vol. 34: no. 2, pp. 3–6.

RITNE (1997). Research Institute for Tibetan Nationality Education. 'The Light of Hope on the Roof of the World: A Brief Account of Thirty Years of Tibetan Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, vol. 30: no. 4, pp. 21–38.

A narrative of the development of schools in Tibet since 1959. The account states that the current state of development of Tibetan education is closely linked to the Party's concern for the future and destiny of the Tibetan nationality (*minzu*) and is an outcome of the integration of the Party's nationality theories and policies with the realities of Tibet.

Rong Ma (1991). 'Han and Tibetan Residential Patterns in Lhasa'. *The China Quarterly*. December, no. 128, pp. 814–835.

With survey data (1988) on ethnic contact in the city of Lhasa, this article examines to what extent new ethnic relationships have been realized. It indicates many unintended consequences of social policy, some of them unique to socialist societies and others universal, and the aspects of society, which are difficult to change even with the most enlightened policies.

Rosen, Stanley (1987). 'Restoring Key Secondary Schools in Post-Mao China: The Politics of Competition and Educational Quality'. In David M. Lampton (ed.), *Policy Implementation in Post-Mao China*, pp. 321–353. University of California Press, Berkeley.

The key-school system has a history prior to the Cultural Revolution and was meant to cultivate outstanding students. The system signals emphasis on educational quality rather than quantity. The article analyses the history of key-schools in the 1970s and some of the

problems and political implementations in the process of restoring the system during the 1980s.

Sangay, L. (1998). 'Education rights for Tibetans in Tibet and India'. In J. D. Montgomery (ed.), *Human Rights: Positive Policies in Asia and the Pacific Rim*, pp. 285–307. Hollis Publishing Company, Hollis.

Sautman, Barry (1999). 'Expanding Access to Higher Education for China's National Minorities. Policies of Preferential Admissions'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 173–209. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Preferential policies provide benefits to broad sections of the minority population, particularly with regard to family planning and education. The article provides a comprehensive research analysis of the massive system of preferential treatment for minorities in China's universities. A major aim of this policy is also to increase the number of trained personnel in minority regions; however, many minorities do not return to their home regions after graduation from universities.

Save the Children (2002). *Tibet Basic Education Project. April 2002–April 2005*. Prepared by Tibet education team, Save the Children (UK) China programme in consultation with Save the Children Denmark, May 2002. Retrieved September 2002 from <http://www.redbarnet.dk>

SC(UK) Save the Children UK. *Education programmes and policies*. Retrieved in June 2002 from <http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/education/quality.html>

Smith, Warren W. Jr. (1996). *Tibetan Nation. A History of Tibetan Nationalism and Sino-Tibetan Relations*. Westview Press, Oxford.

An extensive narrative and analysis of Tibetan nationalism and Sino-Tibetan relations from the time of the consolidation of the Tibetan empire in the 7th century till modern times in the 1990s. This substantive book on the history of Tibet also contributes to an understanding of epic mythology, mountain cults and the mythology of Tibetan origins.

Stites, Regie (1999). 'Writing Cultural Boundaries: National Minority Language Policy, Literacy Planning, and Bilingual Education'. In

Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.). *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 95–130. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Stites maps out the complex linguistic diversity of China and examines language policies and the literature on bilingual education in China. She argues that success in bilingual and literacy education for minorities will be shaped by the politics of ethnic identity to a large extent.

Stoddard, Heather (1994). 'Tibetan Publications and National Identity'. In Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner (eds), *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*. pp. 121–156. Hurst & Company, London.

A short introduction to the literary output in Tibet during the last centuries, with special emphasis on the impact of newer publications based on political and influenced by historical events.

Su, Z., J. N. Hawkins, C. Zhao, and T. Huang (2002). 'Student Teachers in Tibet: a case study'. *Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy*, vol. 28: no. 1, pp. 17–33.

A case study of beginner teachers in Tibet describes the demographic characteristics and perspectives of Tibetan teacher candidates in comparison with their mainstream counterparts in China. Survey questionnaires, individual interviews, observation in classrooms, and reviews of relevant institutional, curricular and instructional material were used. Findings demonstrate that a typical student of a beginners' class in Tibet is more likely to be a young male Tibetan under the age of 25 and from a middle-class family background, who considers intrinsic reasons to be more important than extrinsic reasons in becoming a teacher. Nevertheless he is reluctant to commit himself to teaching as a lifelong career, largely because of the low status and low compensation of the teaching profession, and the additional personal difficulty in finding a suitable spouse and setting up a decent home.

Taft, Julia V. (2000). 'Tibet booming at Tibetan expense'. *Tibetan Review*. July, vol. 35: no. 7, pp. 22–24.

In her testimony to the US Senate Foreign Relations Subcommittee on East Asia and Pacific Affairs on June 13, 2000, US government's Special Coordinator for Tibetan issues, Julia V. Taft expressed disappointment

at China's stubborn lack of interest to resolve the issue of Tibet. Taft confirmed that although still the poorest and most backward of all the territories under the communist Chinese administration, Tibet's economy, said to be booming, is marginalizing the disempowered and colonially subjugated Tibetans, while Chinese settlers with their proximity and race affinity to the seat of power and much else reap all the benefits that make up Tibet's growth statistics. Taft referred to a 1999 human rights report on China which documents widespread religious and human rights violations in detail. She concludes that there is considerable common ground between the Dalai Lama and Chinese leaders and urges the authorities in Beijing to establish a dialogue with the Dalai Lama.

TCHRD (Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy). *Annual Report 2001*. Dharamsala. <http://www.tchrd.org>
<http://www.tchrd.org/pubs/2001>

— (1997). *The Next Generation: The State of Education in Tibet Today*. Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala.
<http://www.tchrd.org>

For the Tibetan children education has a particular importance. Economically, Tibetans cannot compete with the estimated 7.5 million Chinese settlers in Tibet. Chinese authorities provide Chinese with substantial financial and social benefits to encourage them to settle in Tibet, including high wages, long holidays, housing, health services and educational opportunities. For these reasons, Tibetan children's right to education and the protection of their minority rights plays a decisive role in Tibet's future. Education must not only be available to Tibetan children, it must also satisfy their right to receive instruction on Tibet-related subjects and in Tibetan language. The principal part of this report is based on testimonial gathered in interviews conducted in spring 1997 with 50 Tibetan children who had fled from Tibet in the previous two or three years and are now living in northern India. Several factors mean that the study was necessarily limited: the number of children interviewed, the impossibility of accessing school children in Tibet, the young age of the interviewees and their potential subjectivity. Nonetheless, the testimonial is largely supported by reports compiled by other sources on the poor state of education in Tibet.

Thøgersen, Stig (1989). 'Through the Sheeps Intestines – Selection and Elitism in Chinese Schools'. *The Australian Journal of Chinese Affairs*, no. 21, pp. 29–56.

Formal education in China is determinant for career opportunities and therefore plays a crucial role in the social distribution process in China. The atmosphere throughout the education system has been competitive and elitist. The article provides a brief historical introduction on the elitist educational model during the past decade, the use of exams and tests, the division between 'key' and non-'key' schools and the streaming of students in 'fast' and 'slow' classes. The problems created by the new policies, and the process of moderation which they have had to go through, demonstrate that purely meritocratic and elitist measures have been incapable of solving the problems facing Chinese education.

— (1990). *Secondary Education in China after Mao: Reform and Social Conflict*. Aarhus University Press, Aarhus.

This study reviews, analyses and discusses the dramatic changes, and the results of the same, in Chinese secondary education in the period from the death of Mao Zedong and the subsequent overthrow of the remaining Cultural Revolution leaders in 1976 up to the crushing of the pro-democracy students' movement in 1989.

— (guest editor) (1991). *Chinese Education. Vocational and Technical Secondary Education in China*. Fall, 24: no. 3.

The journal contains articles and reports on the evolution and experience on secondary education and vocational and technical education in China since 1978, when China transformed the structure of secondary education. The articles, translated from Chinese, also focus on the future of the vocational school strategy in China.

— (2000). 'The 'Quality' of Chinese Education and the New Ideal Student.' *NIASnytt, Nordic Newsletter of Asian Studies*, no. 4, pp. 4–7.

The author argues that the debate on 'quality education' reflects the troubled and contradictory nature of the Chinese modernization process and therefore has significance far beyond the field of educational planning and teaching methods.

- (2002). *A Country of Culture. Twentieth-Century China Seen from the Village Schools of Zouping, Shandong*. Michigan University Press, Michigan.

Publisher's description: A County of Culture provides a detailed analysis of education reforms in twentieth-century rural China, and of how these reforms relate to larger processes of social, political, and economic transformation. Based on documents and life histories collected in Zouping, the book focuses on education as an indicator of the changing relations between state and rural society; as a crucial feature in local economic life; and as a decisive factor in individual careers and destinies. <http://www.press.umich.edu/titles/11283.html>

- TIN (Tibet Information Network) (1998a). *News Review. Reports from Tibet*, no. 26. 1997. Education in Tibet. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra26.htm>

- (1999a). *News Review. Reports from Tibet*, no. 27. 1998. Education in Tibet. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra27.htm>

- (TIN) (1999b). *A Sea of Bitterness: Patriotic Education in Qinghai Monasteries*. TIN Briefing Paper no. 32, TIN, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/bbp/bbp32.htm>

The essay examines the implementation of the Patriotic Education Campaign in Tibetan Buddhist monasteries in Qinghai Province and analyses the differences and the similarities between this campaign and the Patriotic Education Campaign which has been running for the past three years in the Tibet Autonomous Region. The findings of this report are drawn from two main sources. The first, a series of in-depth interviews with new arrivals from Tibet, conducted by TIN field researchers in India and Nepal between September 1997 and April 1999, provides information on the implementation of the campaign in at least 14 Qinghai monasteries and highlights the effect that it has had on religious life in the province. The second source, a Patriotic Education document issued by the Qinghai authorities and used for study sessions in at least two monasteries in Qinghai province, outlines the basic ideology and aims of the Patriotic Education campaign in Qinghai.

- (2000). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 28. 1999.* Education in Tibet. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra28.htm>
- (2001a). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29. 2000.* Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>
- (2001b). ‘Language and Tibetan Identity’. In *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 29, 2000*, pp. 53–66. Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra29.htm>

The report provides a policy background, official documents on Tibetan language and education, language translations and the printed media in Tibet and a summary of Chinese press releases on culture and education in Tibet in 2000. The Tibetan language is in theory protected by constitutional and other legal provisions, but its usage is in decline both in Tibetan areas and in exile. Economic and other policies are having an increasing impact in determining which language is used, and the increased migration of Han Chinese to Tibetan and other areas of Western PRC, mean that Chinese language skills are increasingly important in finding employment.

- (2002). *News Review. Reports from Tibet, no. 30, 2001.* Tibet Information Network, London. <http://www.tibetinfo.net>
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/news-reviews/nra30.htm>

Tournadre, Nicolas (2003). ‘The Dynamics of Tibetan–Chinese Bilingualism. The current situation and future prospects’. *China Perspectives*. January–February, no. 45, pp. 30–36.

The study considers the current situation of Tibetan and Chinese languages in the region of Tibet and examines the sociolinguistic factors at work as well as language policy. Although law dictates Tibetan to be the official language, it is excluded from the administrative spheres and Chinese is given a predominant position at schools and universities. If present language policy is maintained, Tibetan will be an endangered language. The author argues that in order to enable proper integration as well as sustainable economic and cultural development in Tibet, it is vital to put in place a truly bilingual

Tibetan–Chinese education system, which would foster real harmony between the two cultures.

Tsering W. Shakya (1994). 'Politicisation and the Tibetan Language'. In Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner (eds), *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*, pp. 157–165. Hurst & Company, London.

The article elaborates on the political needs for the Communist Party to invent new linguistic categories to propagate the new socialist ideology in Tibet under Chinese control since the 1950s. The author argues that people inside Tibet are not free to translate works as they wanted and that the translation and innovation of the new lexicon is a product of political needs rather than of a genuine intellectual and creative exchange of ideas.

UN Theme Group Newsletter 2001, no. 7, pp. 1–4.

UNESCO (2000). Dakar Framework for Action, http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/wef_2000/expanded_com_eng.shtml

— (2000a). *Education for All: The Year 2000 Assessment Final Country Report of China*. Chinese National Commission for UNESCO. Beijing, PRC.

— (2003). *United Nations Literacy Decade – Education for All (2003–2012)*. <http://www.unesco.org>
http://portal.unesco.org/education/ev.php?URL_ID=5000&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201&reload=1046196388

UNICEF 2002a, 'Education Initiatives. Education is a Right'
www.unicef.org/programme/education/cfchlist.htm

— 2002b. *The Global Agenda for Children: Learning for the 21st Century*. A report by Shaeffer, S., A. Dykstra, J. Irvine, M.J. Pigozzi and R.M. Torres. Retrieved June 2002 from, <http://www.unicef.org>

Guidelines on learning and how to implement concepts of child centred learning. This is needed, as the education system in the 21st century is generally not keeping up with the challenges of today.

Upton, Janet L. (1996). 'Home on the Grasslands? Tradition, Modernity, and the Negotiation of Identity by Tibetan Intellectuals in the PRC'. In Melissa J. Brown (ed.), *Negotiating ethnicities in China and Taiwan*, pp. 98–124. Institute for East Asian Studies, University of California, Berkeley.

Based on a visit to nomads in Sichuan, Upton narrates on the role of Tibetan educators as mediators between groups with opposing interests and of their ability to interact and exchange ideas among the Tibetan population. The article explains local Tibetans understanding of educators and intellectuals as preservers and promoters of Tibetan culture. A unified Tibetan identity is promoted and reinforced by Tibetan educators, as is a nationally approved, standardized Tibetan-language curriculum.

— (1998) 'Beyond the Content of a Curriculum: Toward an Ethnographic Reading of Tibetan-Language Textbooks in the People's Republic of China'. Paper presented at the Eighth Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies Seminar, Indiana University, Bloomington, USA, July 25–31, 1998.

The essay provides an analysis of the content and the actual use of the junior- and secondary-level textbooks for the course on Tibetan language and literature in Tibetan medium schools in the PRC. Upton finds that the contents of these textbooks are derived from three primary sources: translation from Chinese, modern Tibetan, and traditional Tibetan. She also points out that it is misleading to assume that Tibetan literature is missing in the Tibetan-language curriculum in the PRC. A great deal of material also is drawn from historical and contemporary Tibetan-language sources. Upton says that writings of modern and contemporary authors are used as models, which encourages students to be active producers of literature, and that textbooks therefore provide students an active, engaged literacy with a potential to transform intellectual and social practice beyond the classroom walls.

— (1999). 'The Development of Modern School-Based Tibetan Language Education in the PRC'. In Gerard A. Postiglione (ed.), *China's National Minority Education. Culture, Schooling, and Development*, pp. 281–340. Falmer Press, New York and London.

Upton traces the history of modern Tibetan language education since 1949 through periods of development and change. Her research is

focused on Songpan County of Aba Prefecture; she provides a very detailed account of its local language school.

- (2000). 'Schooling Shar-khog: Time, Space and the Place of Pedagogy in the Making of the Tibetan Modern'. Ph.D. Dissertation in Cultural Anthropology, University of Washington. DAI-A 2000: 60, 12, Jun, 4496. University of Washington, 1999. The thesis is not available from UMI, Retrieved June 2002 from <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations>

Author's description: The dissertation focuses on the historical development and contemporary conditions of Tibetan-language schooling in a community in the Sino-Tibetan borderlands. It examines the role of schooling in the construction of Amdo Shar-Khog/Songpan County as a place that embodies multiple meanings and serves multiple agendas, a place where local, national and global forces intersect in the flows of agents, objects and ideas through space and time. 'Based on extensive ethnographic fieldwork in Tibetan schools and communities, I explore the relationship between time, space and the place of schooling in Tibetan areas in the PRC in both the historical and the contemporary context. I consider not only the educational innovations proposed by the Chinese state and its agents, but also the creative and resourceful ways that Tibetans have responded to new social and pedagogical forms. I focus on how the introduction and expansion of particular forms of modern schooling, especially school-based Tibetan-language education under the PRC's rubric of ethno-national education (Chin. *minzu jiaoyu*), has created an arena for the mediation of diverse political and cultural ideologies and divergent systems of meaning over space and time. I also explore the historical transformation of schooling ideologies and the ways those transformations have impacted local, regional and national senses of place. Tracing developments in curricular policy, content and form across both space and time, I explore the relationship between textbooks and the construction of the Tibetan modern. I go on to discuss how the spatial organization of schooling reflects the ties that schools have to both local and national senses of place. I then examine the multiple ways in which Beijing time, the official temporal realm of the PRC nation-state, and local time intersect in the schooling context. Finally, I consider how public and private performances of Tibetanness can be considered in light of the conjunctions of space, time, pedagogy and the construction of place in Amdo Shar-Khog/Songpan County, and what they reveal about the performative nature of Tibetan identity in the PRC.'

Wang, Chengzhi, PhD (2001). *Governance and Financing of Basic Education in China*. AAT 3023226. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations>
<http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/fullcit/3023226>

This dissertation introduces, examines, and analyses the development of basic education in China. In particular, it focuses on the governance and financing of 9-year compulsory education in the contexts of socioeconomic transformation and international parity. The 4-domain and 4-level policy structure is used to analyse governance of basic education in the policy domains of formulation and consultation, adoption, implementation, and monitoring at the national, provincial, county, and school levels. The basic education financing system, especially budgetary allocations, resource generation, and the newly appeared education taxation system, is analytically described and critically studied. The dissertation also studies diversity of education by examining the Hope Primary Schools, private schools, and *minban* teachers, managed and funded, to a great extent, outside the Ministry of Education (MOE) system. Additionally, it analyses the development of basic education for women and minorities, particularly the gender gap of schooling and literacy for women and the dislocation of boarding schools for Tibetan students. The research has found that, among many others, the education system in reform era, compared to popular education in Maoist time, is segregated, stratified, and biased against the rural, the poor, and the powerless. It is primarily the state's chosen policies that have resulted in serious disparities, inequalities, and inequities between the urban and the rural, between male and female, and between the Han majority and the minorities. However, governance of basic education system at local and school levels are, to a great degree, participatory, accountable, and democratic.

Wang, Samuel C. (1999). 'Project Hope and the Hope School System in China: A Re-evaluation'. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, vol. 7, no. 28, pp. 1-17. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v7n28.html>

The article investigates the creation, development, contributions and limits of Project Hope, a huge government-endorsed education project seeking non-governmental contributions [in order] to overcome educational inadequacy in poverty-stricken rural communities in transitional China. By re-examining the composition of sponsored students, the locations of Hope Primary Schools and non-educational orientations for building and expanding schools, Wang argues that Project Hope with its Hope School system have not

contributed to educational access, equality, equity, efficiency and quality as it should have. Poverty-reduction-oriented curricular requirements in Hope Primary Schools are theoretically misleading and realistically problematic.

Wang Tinghua (1997). 'Surveys, Reflections, and Opinions on the Educational Work in Twelve Counties and Cities in the Rikeze District'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. September–October, vol. 30: no. 5, pp. 54–64. First published in Chinese [Jiu si nian jiaoyu jie shuoguo; jiu wu nian yao you xin jucuo; duo Rikeze diqu shi'er xian shi jiaoyu gongzuo de diaocha, sikao yu jianyi] in *Xizang jiaoyu* [Education in Tibet] 1995: no. 2, pp. 22–24.

The author summarizes advances, main problems and measures to be taken to enhance education in Rikeze prefecture. The author suggests to reduce the number of schools so that in principle, village schools will no longer be retained within an area of three or four kilometres around base points consisting of county and township complete primary schools. All students within three kilometres of the complete middle schools will be day students, whereas those living more than three kilometres away may board at the schools.

Wing-Wah Law (guest editor) (1999). *Chinese Education and Society. New Rules of the Game in Education in the People's Republic of China. Education Laws and Regulations*. May–June, 32: no. 3.

The journal outlines articles in various educational laws: Academic Degrees, Compulsory Education, Teachers' Law, Education Law, Vocational Law, Protecting Minors Law. The editor mentions that the emphasis on the use of law, rather than leaders' words, to govern education is a good beginning for the PRC to move away from the personality cult. Whether it could develop a sophisticated culture of respect for law in education as well as society remains a question.

Xu Linyan and Zhang Qiang (1997). 'Education to Aid the Border Regions. Conference on Aid-Tibet Education'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (II)*. September–October, 30: no. 5, pp. 92–96. First published in Chinese [Jiaoyu zhi bian] in *Zhongguo jiaoyu nianjian* [China Education Yearbook], 1994, pp. 252–253.

An account of the outcome of a conference on 'aid-Tibet education' in Beijing March 9–11, 1993 convened by the State Education Commission.

Xue Tianxiang (translation by Ningsha Zhong) (1996). 'Chinese Higher-Education Evaluation: Status Quo, Problems, and Future Tendencies'. In Ruth Hayhoe and Julia Pan (eds), *East-West Dialogue in Knowledge and Higher Education*. M.E. Sharpe, Armonk, New York, pp. 156–176.

The article presents a historical background and a present status quo on evaluation of higher-education in mainland China. Based on an enumeration of existing problems in the field the author makes suggestions for future development. In order to improve the quality of higher education, consideration should be given both to societal needs and individual needs, and research should include the levels of state, society and the individual. The author challenges the issue of authority and suggests higher education to be run by a range of different authorities.

Young, Nick (2001a). 'Bringing quality down to the basics'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 7–12. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org>
<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=369>

The author argues that China's top educationalists often have little or no experience in teaching children and that adult literacy classes are often delivered on a quota basis. The article elaborates on present development programmes with regard to a successful introduction of western style quality education for children in Tibet.

— (2001b) 'Exam system is weakest link in quality chain'. *China Development Brief*. Autumn 2001, IV: no. 2, pp. 13–17. Retrieved June 2002 from <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org>
<http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.org/article.asp?sec=19&sub=1&toc=1&art=371>

In order to raise standards, Chinese schooling is geared to university entrance, and it does not consider the 90% who won't make it that far.

Zhang Guodu (1997). 'Develop an Educational System Suited to the Requirements of the Economic Situation. Reflections on the Current State and Problems of Education in Tibet's Agricultural and Semi-Agricultural/Semi-Pastoral Districts'. *Chinese Education and Society. The*

Schooling of Tibetans (II). Sep.–Oct., 30: no. 5, pp. 26–53. First published in Chinese [Fazhan yu jingji shitai yaoqiu xiangshiying de jiaoyu – dui wo qu nongqu, bannongbanmuqu jiaoyu xianzhuang, wenti de sikao] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1994: no. 2, pp. 25–34.

Zhou Wei, Zhang Tiedao, Liu Wenpu, Ma Yuqin, and Peng Jiayun (2001). 'Research into Girl's Education in Four Western Provinces of China'. *Chinese Education and Society. Educational Research Selections*. September–October, vol. 34: no. 5, pp. 4–28. First published in *Jiaoyu yanjiu* (Educational research), 1996: no. 1, pp. 34–43.

A four-year research project by Chinese scholars on girls' schooling conducted in the mid- to late 1990s in Ningxia, Gansu, Qinghai, and Guizhou at the national or provincial level. Financed by WB, UNICEF, UNESCO. The authors claim that national minority girls are intelligent, and that total optimization of the girls' environment will effectively solve the difficulty of girls going to school.

Zhou Yangguang (1997). 'Reflections on the Development of Vocational/ Technical Education in Tibet'. *Chinese Education and Society. The Schooling of Tibetans (I)*. July–August, 30: no. 4, pp. 80–88. First published in Chinese [Dui fazhan Xizang zhiye jishu jiaoyu de sikao] in *Xizang yanjiu* [Tibetan Studies] 1992: no. 1, pp. 83–86.

The author elaborates on how advances in education in Tibet have been a constant process of trial and error. The article sketches educational causes and problems and stresses the importance of strengthening vocational/technical education and a follow up of on-the-job training to obtain the best results.

Chapter 8

Selected Reference Material

A. BIBLIOGRAPHIC GUIDES

Barendsen, Robert (1976). *Education in the P.R.C.: A Select, Annotated Bibliography of Materials Published in the English Language 1971–1976*. Washington: U.S. Dept. of Health, Education and Welfare.

The Bibliography of Asian Studies, published yearly since 1971. The Association for Asian Studies Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan. U.S.A. <http://www.aasianst.org/bassub.htm>

Dilger, Bernhard and Henze, Jürgen (1978). *Das Erziehungs- und Bildungswesen der VR China seit 1969: Eine Bibliographie*. Hamburg: Institut für Asienkunde.

Fraser, Stewart and Hsu Kuang-liang (1972). *Chinese Education and Society: A Bibliographic Guide*. White Plains, New York: International Arts and Sciences Press.

Lo, Billie L.C. (1983). *Research Guide to Education in China After Mao*. Hong Kong: Centre of Asian Studies, University of Hong Kong.

Parker, Franklin and Betty June Parker (1986). *Education in the People's Republic of China. Past and Present: An Annotated Bibliography*. New York: Garland Publishing Inc.

Postiglione, Gerard A. and Grace C.L. Mak (eds)(1997). *Asian Higher Education: An International Handbook and Reference Guide*. Greenwood Press.

B. NEWSPAPERS AND JOURNALS

American Anthropologist, <http://www.aaanet.org/aa/>

Anthropology and Education Quarterly, <http://www.aaanet.org/cae/aeq/>

Selected Reference Material

- Anthropology Today*, <http://www.jstor.org/journals/0268540X.html>
- Asian Affairs*, Royal Society for Asian Affairs (UK),
<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/titles/03068374.html>
- Asian Development Review*,
<http://www.adb.org/Documents/Periodicals/ADR/default.asp>
- Asian Folklore Study* <http://proquest.umi.com/>
- Asian Survey*, University of California Press Journals,
<http://www.ucpress.edu/journals/as/>
- Asian Studies Review*, University of Queensland, Australia,
<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/online.html>
- Asian Thought and Society* (U.S.A.),
<http://www.sunysb.edu/ssiprogram/ssi/asian.html>
- Australian Journal of Chinese Affairs*, Australia,
<http://www.jstor.org/journals/01567365.html>
- Beijing Review*, <http://www.bjreview.com.cn/>
- Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, University of London,
<http://www.jstor.org/journals/0041977X.html>
- Central Asian Survey*,
<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/carfax/02634937.html>
- China Aktuell*,
<http://www.duei.de/ifa/show.php/de/content/zeitschriften/china.php>
- China Brief*, <http://china.jamestown.org/pub-brief.htm>
- China Development brief*, <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.com/>
- China Exchange News*, <http://www.nap.edu/catalog/887.html>
- China in Brief*, Education,
<http://www.china.org.cn/e-china/education/index.htm>
- The China Journal*, <http://rspas.anu.edu.au/ccj/journal.htm>
- China Perspectives*,
<http://www.cefc.com.hk/english/perspectives/derniernumero.html>
- China Quarterly*, Cambridge University Press, U.K.,
<http://www.jstor.org/journals/03057410.html>

China Review: An Interdisciplinary Journal on Greater China. The Chinese University Press,

http://www.chineseupress.com/english/e_front_page.html

Chinese Academic Journal Publications (Digital Document Delivery Center, East Asian Library, Univ. of Pittsburgh, PA, USA.

<http://www.library.pitt.edu/gateway/>

Chinese Education News (Zhongguo Jiaoyu Bao)

Chinese Education & Society, <http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/journal.html>

Chinese Law and Government,

<http://www.mesharpe.com/mall/results1.asp?ACR=CLG>

Comparative Education Review,

<http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/CER/home.html>

Comparative Politics, <http://web.gc.cuny.edu/jcp/index.HTM>

Comparative Studies in Society and History,

<http://www.jstor.org/journals/00104175.html>

Cultural Survival Quarterly, <http://www.culturalsurvival.org/publications/csq/>

The Economist Intelligence Unit, UK. Country Profile, <http://www.eiu.com/>

Education About Asia, <http://www.aasianst.org/eaa-toc.htm>

Etudes Chinoises / French Association for Chinese Studies,

<http://assoc.wanadoo.fr/afec/htdocs/somm.htm>

Forced Migration Review,

<http://www.asylumsupport.info/publications/rsc/fmr.htm>

Gender and Society (SUNY, USA),

<http://www.jstor.org/journals/08912432.html>

Harvard Educational Review, <http://www.gse.harvard.edu/~hepg/her.html>

International Migration Review,

<http://www.jstor.org/journals/01979183.html>

International Review of Education, <http://www.campus-oei.org/n7345.htm>

Journal Asiatique (Paris), <http://www.unipv.it/cspe/rja.htm>

Journal of Asian Studies (previously *The Far Eastern Quarterly*),

<http://www.jstor.org/journals/00219118.html>

Journal of Contemporary Asia,

<http://www.econ.cam.ac.uk/marshlib/journals/listings/j/j19.html>

Selected Reference Material

Journal of Contemporary China, University of Denver, USA.

<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/carfax/10670564.html>

Journal of International Development,

<http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/cgi-bin/jhome/5102>

The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute (previously *Man*). Anthropological articles and book reviews, more recent news are published in *Anthropology Today*. <http://lucy.ukc.ac.uk/rai/jrai.html>

Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society, Cambridge of University Press,

<http://www.cambridge.org> and <http://journals.cambridge.org/>

Lund Studies in African and Asian Religions, <http://www.lub.lu.se>

Modern Asian Studies, Cambridge University press,

<http://www.cambridge.org>

Modern China (U.S.A.), <http://www.jstor.org/journals/00977004.html>

NIASnytt – Asia Insights, <http://www.nias.ku.dk/nytt/>

Pacific Affairs, UBC Institute of Asian Research, U.S.A.,

<http://www.pacificaffairs.ubc.ca>

Provincial China, <http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/titles/13267612.html>

Social Sciences in China,

<http://www.econ.cam.ac.uk/marshlib/journals//listings/s/s20.html>

Tibet Current Affairs,

<http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/TibPages/TIN/tin-bulletins.html>

Tibet Journal, <http://tibet.com/Laanguage/ltwa/tibet-journal.html>

Tibet Studies (Xizang yanjiu)

Tibet Times (in Tibetan), <http://www.tibettimes.net/>

Tibetan Bulletin, Central Tibetan Administration, <http://tibetnews.com/>

Tibetan Review, New Delhi, <http://tibetan.review.to/>

**C. SELECTED STATISTICAL REFERENCES ON
TIBET AND CHINA**

Achievement of Education in China. Statistics 1949–1983. (1984). [Renmin Jiaoyu Chubanshe]. Ministry of Education, Department of Planning. The People's Republic of China. Beijing (In English and Chinese).

China Education Yearbook. People's Education Press, Beijing.

China Population Statistics Yearbook 2001. (2002). [Zhongguo renkou tongji nianjian 2001]. Compiled by the Department of Population, Social, Science and Technology Statistics. National Bureau of Statistics of China. China Statistics Press. Beijing.

China Statistical Data. China Internet Information Center. The People's Republic of China. <http://www.china.org.cn/e-company/index.htm>

China's Tibet – Facts and Figures 2002, Achievements of Education in China. Statistics 1949–1983. China Internet Information Center. The People's Republic of China. <http://www.china.org.cn/english/tibet-english/index.htm>

Data of 1990 Population Census on China's Nationalities. (1994). [Zhongguo minzu renkou ziliao: 1990 nian renkou pucha shuju]. China Statistical Publishing House. Beijing.

Overview of the Tibetan population in the PRC from the 2000 census. (2003). TIN (Tibet Information Network). <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/2003/3009.htm>
See also *Tibet File. Background information and statistics about Tibet* <http://www.tibetinfo.net/tibet-file/stats.htm>

Statistical Communiqué of the People's Republic of China on the 2000 National Economic and Social Development. (2001). CERNET. China Education and Research network. The People's Republic of China. <http://www.edu.cn/20010101/22293.shtml>

Statistical Report on Educational Achievements and Development in China in 2000. (2001). [2000 Nian Quanguo Jiaoyu Shiye Fazhan Tongji Gongbao]. CERNET. China Education and Research network. The People's Republic of China. <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/statistics/index.shtml>

Statistical Yearbook of China. Compiled by State Statistical Bureau, The People's Republic of China. Published by Economic Information & Agency, Hong Kong.

Statistics on Education. CERNET. China Education and Research Network.
<http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/statistics/education/index.shtml>

Ten Great Years. Statistics of Economic and Cultural Achievements of the People's Republic of China. (1960). Compiled by State Statistical Bureau. Foreign Language Press, Beijing.

Tibet Statistical Yearbook. Compiled by Tibet Statistical Bureau. China Statistics Press, Beijing.

D. ON-LINE GUIDES

- Asia Pacific Research Online, <http://www.ciolek.com>
- The Asian Studies WWW Monitor, <http://coombs.anu.edu.au/asia-www-monitor.html>
- China Education and Research Network (CERNET), China Education and Research Network (CERNET), <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/statistics/education/index.shtml>
- Chinese Laws: Internet Guide for China Studies, <http://sun.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/igcs/index.html> or <http://www.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/library/>
- Chinese Laws: NovexCn.com, http://novexcn.com/china_law_contents.html
- CREC, Wah Ching Centre of Research on Education in China, <http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/>
- CREC: China Education News Archive, http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/index_old.html
- Elsevier. International Journal of Educational Research including Learning and Instruction, <http://www.elsevier.com/locate/ijedures>
- Ethnologue. Language of the world and a whole lot more. Sil International <http://www.ethnologue.com/>
- Governments on the WWW: China Government (PRC), <http://www.gksoft.com/govt/en/cn.html>
- Portal, The ACM Digital Library, <http://portal.acm.org/portal.cfm>
- ProQuest Information and Learning, <http://www.umi.com/>

- Dissertations search: <http://wwwlib.umi.com/dissertations/search>
- Tibet Education Network. Approaching Tibetan Studies: A Resource Handbook for Educators. Global Source Education, Seattle, WA. Tibet Education Network, <http://www.globalsourcenetwork.org/tibet.htm>
- Tibetan and Himalayan Digital Bibliography, <http://iris.lib.virginia.edu/tibet/>
- The World-Wide Web WWW Virtual Library, Asian Studies, <http://coombs.anu.edu.au/WWWVL-AsianStudies.html>
- The World-Wide Web WWW Virtual Library, Tibetan Studies, <http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVL-TibetanStudies.html>

E. SELECTED WEBSITES

On-line news

- BBC Monitoring – Summary of World Broadcasts (SWB). Ceased. Archive September 1993 till March 2001, <http://ds.datastarweb.com/ds/products/datastar/sheets/bswb.htm>
- *Beijing Review*, <http://www.bjreview.com.cn/>
- *China Daily*, <http://www1.chinadaily.com.cn/en/home/index.html>
- *China Internet Information Center*, <http://www.china.org.cn/english/index.htm>
- *China News Agency* (World News com), <http://www.chinanewsagency.com/>
- *China News Digest*, <http://www.cnd.org/CND-Global/CND-Global.new.html>
- *China Today*, <http://www.chinatoday.com.cn/English/ctenglish.htm>
- *East View Information services*, <http://www.eastview.com/>
- New China News Agency (*Xinhua*), <http://www.fas.org/irp/world/china/xinhua/>
- *People's Daily* (Renmin Ribao), <http://english.peopledaily.com.cn>
- Radio Free Asia, <http://www.rfa.org/front/>
- Tibet Current Affairs Archive, TIN News Updates 1988–1998, <http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/TibPages/TIN/tin-archive.html>
- *Tibet Daily*, <http://www.tibetpost.com/>

Selected Reference Material

- TIN. Tibet Information Network, News Updates (1997–), <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/update.htm>
- *Voice of America – Tibetan*, <http://www.voanews.com/tibetan/>
- WTN. World Tibet Network News, <http://www.tibet.ca>
- *The World News Network*, <http://www.wnnetwork.com/>
- WNC. World News Connection (previously SWB – Summary of World Broadcast), <http://wnc.fedworld.gov/>
- Xinhuanet–Xinhua News Agency, <http://www.xinhua.org/english/>

Education strategies links

The links below provide details of organisations involved in educational activities, programmes or research.

- CERNET. China Education and Research Network, <http://www.edu.cn/HomePage/english/index.shtml>
- The Consultative Group on Early Childhood Care and Development. <http://www.ecdgroup.com>
- CREC. Wah Ching – Centre of Research on Education in China, <http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/index.html>
- Education International, <http://www.ei-ie.org/main/english/index.html>
- Global Campaign for Education, <http://www.campaignforeducation.org>
- Pan Asia Networking (Canada), <http://www.panasia.org.sg/about/>
- Tibetan Children’s Educational & Welfare Fund, Central Tibetan Administration, <http://www.tcewf.org>
- UN. United Nations Population Division. Department of Economic and Social Affairs, <http://www.un.org/esa/population/unpop.htm>
- UNDP. United Nations Development Programme, <http://www.undp.org>
- UNESCO. Dakar Framework for Action, http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/wef_2000/expanded_com_eng.shtml
- UNESCO. Institute for Statistics. Education statistics, <http://www.uis.unesco.org/>

- UNESCO. United Nations Literacy Decade 2003–2012, http://portal.unesco.org/education/ev.php?URL_ID=5000&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201&reload=1046196388
- UNICEF education initiatives, <http://www.unicef.org/programme/education/index.html>
- UNICEF education statistics, <http://www.childinfo.org/eddb/education.htm>
- World Bank Group, World Development Report 2004, <http://econ.worldbank.org/wdr/wdr2004/text-18786/>

Online reports on the status of Tibet

- DIIR (Department of Information & International Relations), *Environment and Development Desk (2001): Railway Project: Where will it Take Tibet?* http://www.tibet.net/eng/diir/pubs/rail_report.pdf
 - *Racial Discrimination in Chinese-Occupied Tibet* (2001), <http://www.tew.org/cerd/index.html>
 - *Tibet under Communist China – 50 Years* (2001), <http://www.tibet.net/eng/diir/flash/0901/260901.html>
- The Government of Tibet in Exile, *China's Current Policy in Tibet: Life-and-death Struggle to Crush an Ancient Civilization* (2000), <http://www.tibet.com/Eco/cover.html>
 - *Tibet: Proving Truth from Facts* (1996), <http://www.tibet.com/WhitePaper/index.html>
 - *The Status of Tibet* (1999), <http://www.tibet.com/Status/>
- ICLT (International Committee of Lawyers for Tibet, now: Tibet Justice Center) (2001), *A Generation in Peril: The Lives of Tibetan Children Under Chinese Rule*, <http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/children/index.html>
- International Lawyers Conference, *The London Statement* (1993), <http://www.tibet.com/Status/londonconf.html>
- TCHRD (Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy), *Annual Report, 1999 – Tibet: Tightening of Control*, <http://www.tchrd.org/press/archive.html>
 - *Human Rights Updates and Archive 2000*, <http://www.tchrd.org/hrupdate/2000/index.html>

Selected Reference Material

- *Human Rights Updates and Archive 2001*,
<http://www.tchrd.org/hrupdate/2001/index.html>
- *Human Rights Updates and Archive 2002*,
<http://www.tchrd.org/hrupdate/2002/index.shtml>
- *Human Rights Updates and Archive 2003*,
<http://www.tchrd.org/hrupdate/2003/index.html>
- TIN (Tibet Information Network), *Different Voices: The Media in Tibet* (2000), <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/nu030500.htm>
 - *A Struggle of Blood and Fire: The Imposition of Martial Law in 1989 and the Lhasa Uprising in 1959* (1999),
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/nu250299.htm>
 - TIN (Tibet Information Network) & Human Rights Watch/Asia, *Cutting Off the Serpent's Head: Tightening Control in Tibet, 1994–1995* (1996), <http://hrw.org/reports/1996/China4.htm>
 - TJC (Tibet Justice Center), *Occupied Tibet: The Case in International Law*, a report by Eva Herzer,
<http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/occupied.html>
 - *Racial Discrimination in Chinese Occupied Tibet: A Report Submitted to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination* (2001),
http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/final_brief_2001.html
 - TJC (Tibet Justice Center) & UNPO, *The Case Concerning Tibet: Tibet's Sovereignty and the Tibetan People's Right to Self-Determination* (1998),
<http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/sovereignty/index.html>

Online books and publications

- Amnye Machen Institute,
<http://www.amnyemachen.org/publicat/books.html>
- DIIR (Department of Information and International Relations Central Tibetan Administration), <http://tibetnews.com/pubs/index.html>
- Motilal Banarsidass, <http://www.mlbd.com/>
- Paljor Publications, <http://www.paljorpublications.com>
- Snow Lion Publications, <http://www.snowlionpub.com>
- Tibet Information Network Research Publications,
<http://www.tibetinfo.net/publications/tinpubs.htm>
- Tibetbook.com, <http://www.tibetbook.com>

- Wisdom Publications, <http://www.wisdom-books.com/>

Online geography and maps

- China Internet Information Center, Tibet Autonomous Region, <http://www.china.org.cn/e-xibu/2JI/3JI/xizang/xizang-ban.htm>
- The Environmental and Cultural Geography of Tibet and the Himalayas, http://faculty.virginia.edu/tibet-initiative/library/culture/cultural_geography/frameset.html and http://iris.lib.virginia.edu/tibet/culture/cultural_geography/tibet_map.html
- Tibet Environmental Watch (TEW) – Geography, <http://www.tew.org/geography/index.html> and <http://www.tew.org/totar/index.html>
- The Tibet Map Institute, <http://www.tibetmap.com/>
- Tibetan Studies – Maps & Images of Tibet, <http://www.ciolek.com/WWWVLPages/TibPages/tib-maps.html>

Tibet in general

- Central Tibetan Administration (The Government of Tibet in Exile, Department of Education), <http://www.tibet.net/education/eng/>
- Central Tibetan Administration (The Government of Tibet in Exile website in English) <http://www.tibet.net>
- China Development Brief, <http://www.chinadevelopmentbrief.com/>
- China's Tibet, <http://www.china.org.cn/ch-xizang/tibet/indexE.html>
- China's Tibet – Facts and Figures 2002, <http://www.china.org.cn/english/tibet-english/index.htm>
- École Française D'Extreme Orient (French research School of the Far East, <http://www.efeo.fr/>
- The Government of Tibet in Exile, <http://www.tibet.com>
- His Holiness 14th Dalai Lama, <http://www.dalailama.com>
- Latse Contemporary Tibetan Cultural Library, <http://www.latse.org/>
- Tibet and Himalayas, <http://www.kotan.org/tibet/>
- Tibet Online, <http://www.tibet.org/siteseeing.html>
- Tibet Web (China), <http://www.tibet-web.com> (in Chinese)

Selected Reference Material

- University of Michigan Tibetan Collection: Tibetan Studies Resources, http://www.lib.umich.edu/area/sasia/Tibet/Tibetan_collection_web/ts_resources.htmr
- Xizang-Zhiye (The Government of Tibet in Exile website in Chinese) <http://xizang-zhiye.org/>

Human and legal rights

- China Human Rights, <http://www.humanrights-china.org>
- HRI (Human Rights Internet), <http://www.hri.ca>
- HRW (Human Rights Watch), <http://www.hrw.org>
- Human Rights in China, <http://www.hrichina.org>
- UN. United Nations Documentation: Research Guide, <http://www.un.org/Depts/dhl/resguide/spechr.htm>
- UN High Commission for Human Rights, <http://www.unhchr.ch>

Reader's copy

Part III: Appendices

Reader's copy

Appendix 1

THE 1990 AND 2000 POPULATION CENSUS IN THE PRC

Extracts from 'Overview of the Tibetan population in the PRC from the 2000 census' by TIN.¹

Tibet Information Network has produced a summary overview of the Tibetan population in the PRC, derived from the 2000 population census. As expected from numerous informal field reports, the census statistics show that Tibetans remain overwhelmingly rural in all of the five Chinese provinces that incorporate the traditional Tibet (87.2 per cent live in rural areas overall), much more so than either the Chinese or Chinese Muslims (Hui) living today in the same regions. Within the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) the rural areas are almost exclusively Tibetan (97.6 per cent of the TAR rural population). Chinese residing in Tibetan areas, are predominantly urban and are mainly concentrated in larger towns.

Attention to population shares, however, overlooks important qualitative issues. The urbanization rates in 2000 suggest that most of the changes in the composition of the population in the Tibetan regions have been taking place in the urban areas. While Tibetans have remained predominantly rural, most of the rapid urbanization has been as a result of Chinese and Chinese Muslim migration, whether from within each province or from without. Because the towns and cities hold the levers of economic and political power, the key issue is not whether the population balance has shifted towards Tibetans or Chinese. Rather, it is the fact that economic and political dominance has shifted towards the Chinese because they have become increasingly concentrated in the cities and towns, regardless of their overall position in the population balance.

In contrast, the low rate of urbanization among Tibetans suggests that they are poorly integrated into the rapid development that has

1. Reproduced here with the kind permission of the TIN.

been taking place in the region over the last decade, which has a strong urban bias, much stronger than elsewhere in China (see <http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/2003/0804.htm>). It is therefore important to distinguish between increasing population on the one hand, and actual changes in the population shares of each ethnic group on the other. It is possible that the dominant group, i.e. the Chinese, might be increasing at a slower rate than the Tibetans or other subordinate groups, while at the same time consolidating economic and political power. In this case, an increasing proportion of Tibetans in the population may simply mask their emergence as a marginalized rural underclass in a society in transition – a majority in all regions higher than 3,000 metres, but a majority stuck in rural areas with few means or resources to enter into or compete in an urban environment.

In the TAR, the number of the non-Chinese population (almost all Tibetan) has been growing faster than the population in China in general, but not as fast as the ‘minority’ populations in the other western provinces of the PRC, the fastest of which is in Qinghai (which is two thirds Tibetan and one third Chinese Muslim). This rate of increase is slightly lower than one would expect from the demographic statistics over the 1990s (births minus deaths per thousand in every year) indicating a marginal outflow of Tibetan migration. On the other hand, the Chinese population in the TAR has been increasing at a much faster pace, albeit from a very small base, doubling its size between the two censuses. Most of this would be from migration. As a result, the share of the Tibetans in the total population purportedly fell from 96 to 94 per cent. It should be noted that the in-migration of Chinese is counter-balanced by the out-migration of the same.

Table 1: Population of Tibetans in the PRC according to the 2000 Census

	TAR	Sichuan	Qinghai	Gansu	Yunnan	Other	Total
Total	2,427,168	1,269,120	1,086,592	443,228	128,432	61,481	5,416,021
City	141,551	11,951	20,714	18,534	2,740	25,865	221,355
Town	227,606	120,788	72,981	21,652	22,988	7,452	473,467
Rural	2,058,011	1,136,381	992,897	403,042	102,704	28,164	4,721,199
<i>percentage</i>							
City/Total	5.8	0.9	1.9	4.2	2.1	42.1	4.1
Town/Total	9.4	9.5	6.7	4.9	17.9	12.1	8.7
Rural/Total	84.8	89.5	91.4	90.9	80.0	45.8	87.2
<i>rate of urbanization</i>							
City+Town/Tot. (%)	15.2	10.5	8.6	9.1	20.0	54.2	12.8

Source: Table 1-6, 1-6a, 1-6b, 1-6c, Population by sex, nationality and by province, from *Tabulation on the 2000 Population Census of the People's Republic of China*, China Statistical Press, 2002.

Table 2: The Tibetans and others: breakdown by province and by other ethnicities

Changes in the Population of Chinese and 'Minority Nationalities'							
	China	TAR	Sichuan	Qinghai	Gansu	Yunnan	Tibetans
<i>Total Population (all population figures in millions of people)</i>							
1990 census	1,133.68	2.2	78.36	4.46	22.37	36.97	
2000 census	1,265.83	2.62	83.29	5.18	25.62	42.88	
Annual change (%)	1.1	1.7	0.6	1.5	1.3	1.4	
<i>Minority population</i>							
1990 census	91.2	2.11	3.41	1.88	1.86	12.34	4.59
2000 census	106.43	2.46	4.15	2.36	2.23	14.33	5.42
Annual change (%)	1.5	1.5	1.9	2.2	1.8	1.5	1.80
<i>Chinese population</i>							
1990 census	1,042.48	0.08	74.95	2.58	20.51	24.63	
2000 census	1,159.40	0.16	79.14	2.82	23.39	28.55	
Annual change (%)	1.0	6.5	0.5	0.9	1.3	1.4	
<i>Minority/Total (%)</i>							
1990 census	8.0	95.9	4.4	42.2	8.3	33.4	0.41
2000 census	8.4	93.9	5.0	45.6	8.7	33.4	0.43
Percentile change	+0.4	-2.0	+0.6	+3.4	+0.4	+0.0	0.02

Sources: Tables 2–13, 2–14 and 2–21 in China Population Statistics Yearbook 2001. Beijing, China Statistics Press. Note that in certain cases there are basic arithmetic errors in these Yearbook tables and the percentages have been recalculated here.

Table 3: Breakdown of the population of the TAR in the 2000 census

	Total	Tibetan	Chinese	Hui	Other*
Total	2,616,329	2,427,168	158,570	9,031	21,560
<i>Subtotals</i>					
City	217,779	141,551	69,799	4,881	1,548
Town	290,547	227,606	56,270	2,316	4,355
Rural	2,108,003	2,058,011	32,501	1,834	15,657
City/Total (%)	8.3	5.8	44.0	54.0	7.2
Town/Total (%)	11.1	9.4	35.5	25.6	20.2
Rural/Total (%)	80.6	84.8	20.5	20.3	72.6
<i>Rate of urbanisation</i>					
City+Town/ Total (%)	19.4	15.2	79.5	79.7	27.4

* The category of 'others' is about one half made up of Monpa and Lhopa (Chin. Moiba and Lhoba) who are closely related to Tibetans.

The breakdown of the population of the TAR confirms several common observations from the field; while Tibetans tend to be overwhelmingly rural, the Chinese and Hui (Chinese Muslims) are concentrated in the cities and towns, with only 32,501 Chinese and 1,834 Chinese Muslims actually residing in the rural areas, versus over 2 million Tibetans. Conversely, both the Chinese and the Hui, neither of whom are indigenous to the TAR and thus represent accumulated migration, are 80 per cent urban. In other words, most of the out-of-province in-migration congregates in the urban areas, which only represent about 20 per cent of the provincial population overall. The debates over the inflow of Chinese into the TAR and the rapid Sinicization of the province are an urban matter; little of the inflow enters the rural areas where most Tibetans actually reside.

Table 4: Percentage of each ethnic group in the total population of the TAR

	Tibetan	Chinese	Hui	other
Total	92.8	6.10%	0.30%	0.80%
<i>subtotals</i>				
• City	65.0	32.1	2.2	0.7
• Town	78.3	19.4	0.8	1.5
• Rural	97.6	1.5	0.1	0.7

© 1998–2003 Tibet Information Network. All rights reserved.

For full overview of the 2000 population census outside the TAR, see

<http://www.tibetinfo.net/news-updates/2003/3009.htm>

Sources:

China Population Statistics Yearbook 1992, 2001. Compiled by the Department of Population, Social, Science and Technology Statistics. National Bureau of Statistics of China, Beijing.

TIN (Tibet Information Network). Retrieved October 2003 from TIN News Update 30 September 2003 <http://www.tibetinfo.net>

Appendix 2

ACTION PLAN FOR VITALIZING EDUCATION FOR THE 21ST CENTURY (PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA)

Proposed by Ministry of Education, December 24, 1998

Endorsed by State Council, January 13, 1999

Published February 25, 1999.

Synopsis in English by Professor Kai-ming Cheng

Centre of Research on Education in China

University of Hong Kong

(Retrieved June 2002 from http://www.hku.hk/chinaed/action_plan.htm)

Table of Contents

OVERALL TARGET GOALS

- I. Quality Education
- II. Enhancement of teacher Quality
- III. Higher Education
- IV. Project 211
- V. Distinguished Universities and Disciplines
- VI. Distance Education
- VII. Commercialisation of University innovations
- VIII. Law of Higher Education
- IX. Vocational Education and Adult Education
- X. Structural Reform
- XI. Educational Funding
- XII. Ideological Education

OVERALL TARGET GOALS

- For 2000: Universal basic education, 11% enrolment for higher education, preparation of a new infrastructure for the new economy
- For 2010: Gradual universalization of senior secondary education, 15% enrolment for higher education, establishment of a national system of lifelong learning, a system of knowledge innovation.

I. Quality Education

1. At 2000, universalization of 9-year compulsory education and the eradication of illiteracy among the young and middle-aged. 'Emphasis of emphasis'. Concentration on poor regions. Enhancement of the inspection system as a vehicle for quality assurance.
2. Implementation of the 'Cross-century Quality Education Project'. Reform in basic education curriculum, standards, teaching, assessments, accompanied by teacher training and educational experiments, to build a new curriculum system in 10 years.
3. Enhancement and improvement of moral education.
4. Enhancement of physical and aesthetic education, with articulation between primary, secondary and tertiary education.
5. Improvement of early childhood and special education.
6. Expansion and improvement of education of the ethnic minorities.
7. Further standardization of the national language and improvement of teaching of the national language and the minority languages.

II. Enhancement of Teacher Quality

8. Enhancing teacher professionalism. Retraining of all principals and teachers in 3 years. Consolidate teachers' qualification and certification systems. Around 2010, upgrade the required qualification of primary and junior secondary teachers.
9. Selecting and breeding 100,000 'core teachers' in 1999 and 2000 as models and change agents.
10. Around 2000, turn the entire teaching force into contract employment. Economizing the teaching force. Preferential treatments for teachers in difficult rural areas.

III. Higher Education

11. Tracking the cutting-edge developments, training and attracting talents accordingly.

Appendix 2

12. Starting from 1998, establishment of Distinguished Professorship for academics within and outside China.
13. Create competition and incentive mechanisms for research. Starting from 1999, selection of 100 young academics (age below 35) with award of extra funding for 5 years.
14. Create an open policy for Visitorship.
15. Enhance doctoral education. Starting 1999, selection of 100 best dissertations with award of extra funding for 5 years.
16. Enhance international exchange.

IV. Project 211

(Selection and incubation of 100 best universities for the 21st century. Started in 1995, the project identifies quality institutions and input heavy subsidy.)

17. Completion of Project 211 in 2000.

V. Distinguished Universities and Disciplines

18. Facilitating development of such universities
19. Long-term planning for such disciplines

VI. Distance Education

20. Implementation of 'Modern Distance Education Project'
21. Based on the CERNET, expand the capacity and scale of the network to achieve a comprehensive national information system for education.
22. Enhancement of the existing satellite TV system. By 2000, most rural schools should be able to receive education TV.
23. Development of high quality software.
24. Drafting a 'Modern Distance Education Development Plan' for nation co-ordination by the Ministry of Education.
25. Extending the existing continuing education system to the cyberspace, expanding the Self-study Examination system, thereby increasing the education opportunities for the entire nation.

VII. Commercialization of University Innovations

26. Improvement of the innovation mechanisms of higher education and to link them with the industrial and commercial sectors.
27. Creation of incubation bases in the vicinity of higher education institutions.

28. Creation of industrial enterprises within higher education institutions.
29. Establishment of infrastructure to protect and to encourage the commercialization of innovations.

VIII. Law of Higher Education

30. Earnest implementation of the Law of Higher Education and enhancement of institutional autonomy in particular. Expansion of higher education:
 - Enrolment to increase to 6.6 million
 - Enrolment ratio raised to 11%
 - Expansion mainly in higher vocational education
 - Increase in the scale of post-graduate studies
 - Student/teacher ratio to be improved to 12:1
 - Institution size to reach an average of 4,000.
31. Continuing with structural reform, including central-local joint-ventures, re-adjustment of controlling organs, co-operation with industries and mergers. Encouraging non-governmental endeavors in operating schools.
32. Actively developing vocational higher education, and to develop a comprehensive system accordingly, in order to face the pressure of delaying employment.
33. Further reform in admissions and employment systems. Improve grant and loan assistance to students.
34. Improving teaching in higher education.
35. Further reforming institutional management. In 3 or 5 years, all supporting services should be contracted out.

IX. Vocational Education and Adult Education

36. Implementation of the Law of Education and Law of Vocational Education, to articulate among vocational education at different levels of education and to articulate among vocational education, general education and adult education. Creation of prestigious vocational schools.
37. A lifelong education system that integrates adult education, unemployment re-training and continuing education, with integration of education, assessment and employment.
38. Enhancement of the significance of vocational education in rural regions.

X. Structural Reform

39. Non-governmental endeavors in operating schools should be 'actively encouraged, significantly supported, correctly guided and effectively administered'. In 3 to 5 years, there should be a general system where public schools form the core with participation from other sectors of the community. Establishment of preferential treatment for non-government schools.
40. Legislation for non-government schools. Protecting non-government school operators as autonomous legal entities.
41. Reform the administration of public schools.

XI. Educational Funding

42. Implementation of the '3 growths':
 - annual growth in education expenditures should exceed growth in the general avenue;
 - unit costs of students should see a positive annual growth;
 - teachers' salaries and per-student general expenditures should see a positive annual growth; and,
 - national educational expenditures should reach 4% of GNP;
 - starting 1998, central contribution to educational expenditures should increase by 1% per annum, and 3% after 2000;
 - starting 1998, provincial governments should raise their contributions to educational expenditures by 1 or 2% per annum;
 - starting 1998, extra income and extra-budget incomes should be proportionately allocated to education;
 - establish Education Foundation.
43. Urgent improvement of teacher and staff quarters for higher education.
44. Implementation of 'Project Comfort' for the accommodation of primary and secondary school teachers.
45. Overall improvement of the efficient utilization, audit and monitor of educational fund.

XII. Ideological Education

46. Enhancement of moral education in higher education.
47. Improvement of the curriculum in 'Marxist Theories' and 'Ideology and Morality'
48. Reinforcement of education in national tradition and revolutionary tradition.

49. Enhancement of research in Philosophy. Enhancement of educational research.
50. Enhancement of the role of the Party

The Nordic Institute of Asian Studies (NIAS) is funded by the governments of Denmark, Finland, Iceland, Norway and Sweden via the Nordic Council of Ministers, and works to encourage and support Asian studies in the Nordic countries. In so doing, NIAS has been publishing books since 1969, with more than one hundred titles produced in the last decade.



Nordic Council of Ministers